



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: ID 23-138 **Version:** 1 **Name:**

Type: Action Item **Status:** Agenda Ready

File created: 1/12/2023 **In control:** Pending Approval

On agenda: 3/27/2023 **Final action:** 3/27/2023

Title: HEARING TO CONSIDER proposed alterations from Development Permit application P22-04417 to the Radin-Kamp Department Store (HP#124), located at 939-959 Fulton St (APN 46828101).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) take the following actions:

1. ADOPT a finding of Categorical Exemption pursuant to Sections 15331/Class 31 of the California Environmental Quality Act guidelines
2. APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS: Application P22-04417 to the Radin-Kamp Department Store (HP#124), located at 939-959 Fulton St (APN 46828101).

Sponsors: Planning and Development Department

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. Exhibit A - Operational Statement, 2. Exhibit B - Site Plan, 3. Exhibit C - Elevations, 4. Exhibit D - Floor Plans, 5. Exhibit E - DPR Forms, 6. Exhibit F - Fresno Municipal Code Findings, 7. Exhibit G - Secretary of Interior's Standards

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
3/27/2023	1	Historic Preservation Commission	APPROVED	Pass

REPORT TO THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

March 27, 2023

FROM: JENNIFER CLARK, Director
Planning and Development Department

SUBJECT

HEARING TO CONSIDER proposed alterations from Development Permit application P22-04417 to the Radin-Kamp Department Store (HP#124), located at 939-959 Fulton St (APN 46828101).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) take the following actions:

1. **ADOPT** a finding of Categorical Exemption pursuant to Sections 15331/Class 31 of the California Environmental Quality Act guidelines
2. **APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS:** Application P22-04417 to the Radin-Kamp Department Store

(HP#124), located at 939-959 Fulton St (APN 46828101).

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Development Permit Application No. P22-04417 was filed by Philip Mettler of The Taylor Group Architects and pertains to ± 0.57 acres of property located on the southwest corner of Fulton and Tulare Street. Convert an existing vacant 6-story retail building into a mixed-use retail and multi-unit residential building. No net increase to the square footage of the existing building is proposed. The applicant proposes to convert the existing 6 story, 166,125 square-foot, retail building into a mixed-use retail and multi-residential Building. The property is zoned DTC (Downtown Core).

Staff recommends approval with the condition that exterior materials be replaced per The Secretary of The Interior's Standards for The Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring & Reconstructing Historic Buildings, 2017

BACKGROUND

H.P. #124



Radin-Kamp Department Store (1924)
959 Fulton St
Felchlin, Shaw & Franklin, Architects
Commercial

Radin & Kamp were pioneer merchants in Fresno from the 1880s until 1941. The J. C. Penney Company occupied the building from 1941 to 1986. At one time it had the greatest square footage of any building in Fresno. Its decorated cornice is particularly distinctive.

Project Proposal

Development Permit Application No. P22-04417 was filed by Philip Mettler of The Taylor Group Architects and pertains to ± 0.57 acres of property located on the southwest corner of Fulton and Tulare Street. Convert an existing vacant 6-story retail building into a mixed-use retail and multi-unit residential building. No net increase to the square footage of the existing building is proposed. The

applicant proposes to convert the existing 6 story, 166,125 square-foot, retail building into a mixed-use retail and multi-residential Building. The property is zoned DTC (Downtown Core).

Project Analysis

HP#124 Radin-Kamp Department Store located at 959 Fulton St is an individually listed historic resource on the Local Register of Historic Resources therefore any proposed project with a scope of work which proposes alterations to the resource is subject to review by the Commission pursuant to FMC Section 12-1617.

The applicant proposes to bring new life to this historic resource by activating all levels of the building. The first floor and mezzanine will be active spaces while the upper levels will be reimagined as residential units. These spaces were designed to fit within the existing structural supports to maintain interior integrity. Each unit was designed to maximize the usable space.

The project proposes to change exterior windows to a ‘vinyl frame window system’ and first floor store fronts to a ‘storefront system’, materials unknown. This does not conform to The Secretary of The Interior’s Standards for The Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring & Reconstructing Historic Buildings, 2017, pages 46 and 48 below.

WINDOWS	
RECOMMENDED	NOT RECOMMENDED
<p><i>Identifying, retaining, and preserving</i> windows and their functional and decorative features that are important to the overall historic character of the building. The window material and how the window operates (e.g., double hung, casement, awning, or hopper) are significant, as are its components (including sash, muntins, ogee lugs, glazing, pane configuration, sills, mullions, casings, or brick molds) and related features, such as shutters.</p>	<p>Altering windows or window features which are important in defining the historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished.</p> <p>Changing the appearance of windows that contribute to the historic character of the building by replacing materials, finishes, or colors which noticeably change the sash, depth of reveal, and muntin configuration; the reflectivity and color of the glazing; or the appearance of the frame.</p> <p>Obscuring historic wood window trim with metal or other material.</p>

<p><i>The following work is highlighted to indicate that it represents the greatest degree of intervention generally recommended within the treatment Preservation, and should only be considered after protection, stabilization, and repair concerns have been addressed.</i></p>	
Limited Replacement in Kind	
<p><i>Replacing</i> in kind extensively deteriorated or missing components of windows when there are surviving prototypes, such as frames or sash, or when the replacement can be based on documentary or physical evidence. The new work should match the old in material, design, scale, color, and finish.</p>	<p>Replacing an entire window when limited replacement of deteriorated or missing components is appropriate.</p> <p>Using replacement material that does not match the historic window.</p>

Staff does not find that there is sufficient evidence based upon the submittal that it is appropriate to replace the existing windows with new vinyl window systems. With evidence, staff could find appropriate a like-kind replacement.

There is no discussion of the type of material used for the storefront system, but the above criteria would be utilized for this analysis.

The reuse of the building conforms to the City of Fresno Development Code and to adaptive reuse standards referenced in The Secretary of The Interior's Standards for The Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring & Reconstructing Historic Buildings, 2017. Therefore, staff recommends approval of the conversion to a mix of active and residential uses.

Notice of Historic Preservation Commission Hearing

In accordance with Section 12-1617 of the FMC, the Planning and Development Department mailed Notices of this Commission hearing to surrounding property owners within 2,000 feet.

ENVIRONMENTAL FINDINGS

The project is consistent with a Class 31 finding of exemption if the conditions regarding the exterior materials are applied. 15331 Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation can be applied to this project as it is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings (1995), Weeks and Grimmer.

FRESNO MUNICIPAL CODE FINDINGS

The Commission must make one of the following findings. Based upon analysis of the application, the required findings by the Historic Preservation Commission to approve application permit B22-10883 FMC Section 12-1617 (h) are as follows:

FINDING 1 can be made because the proposed work is found to be consistent with the purposes of this article and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, not detrimental to the special historical, architectural, or aesthetic interest or value of the Historic Resource, with conditions.

Standards 1, 2, and 5 of the SOIS can be applied in this application as the project acknowledges the need to alter the interior of this historic property to meet changing uses while retaining the property's historic character. Exterior materials will need to be evaluated for consistency with the Standards prior to installation.

FINDING 2 is not applicable as the action proposed is not a correction of an unsafe or dangerous condition on the property.

FINDING 3 cannot be made because there is no evidence that the denial of the application will not result in unreasonable economic hardship to the owner.

FINDING 4 is not applicable because the site is not required for a public use which will directly benefit the public health, safety and welfare and will be of more benefit than the Historic Resource.

FINDING 5 is not applicable because this is not an application for relocation of an Historic Resource.

Staff Recommendation:

Based upon analysis of the application, staff recommends approval of Application P22-04417 to the Radin-Kamp Department Store (HP#124), located at 939-959 Fulton St (APN 46828101).

CONCLUSION

The appropriateness of the proposed project has been examined with respect to its consistency to the Fresno Municipal Code (FMC) Section 12-1617, The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and The Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The proposed project has been described and analyzed above and by the accompanying environmental assessment. Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) approve Application P22-04417 to the Radin-Kamp Department Store (HP#124), located at 939-959 Fulton St (APN 46828101).

ATTACHMENTS:

- Exhibit A - Operational Statement
- Exhibit B - Site Plan
- Exhibit C - Elevations
- Exhibit D - Floor Plans
- Exhibit E - DPR Forms
- Exhibit F - FMC Findings
- Exhibit G - Secretary of Interior's Standards