

City of Fresno

*City Hall Council Chambers
2600 Fresno Street*



Meeting Minutes - Final

Wednesday, December 4, 2024

6:00 PM

Regular Meeting

City Hall, Council Chambers

Planning Commission

Chairperson – Peter Vang

Vice Chair - Kathy Bray

Commissioner – David Criner

Commissioner – Monica Diaz

Commissioner – Jacqueline Lyday

Commissioner - Linda M Calandra

Commissioner – Gurdeep Singh Shergill

**THE PLANNING COMMISSION WELCOMES YOU TO COUNCIL CHAMBERS,
LOCATED AT CITY HALL, 2600 FRESNO STREET, FRESNO, CALIFORNIA 93721.**

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION – Any interested person may appear at the public hearing and present written testimony or speak in favor or against the matters scheduled on the agenda. Public participation during Fresno City Planning Commission meetings is always encouraged and can occur by attending a meeting in the Council Chambers, City Hall, 2nd Floor, 2600 Fresno Street, Fresno, CA 93721. When called to speak during a meeting, you may approach the speaker podium upon the Chair’s call for public comment.

All public speakers will have up to 3 minutes to address the Commission pursuant to Rule No. 13 of the Planning Commission Bylaws of the City of Fresno (available in the City Clerk’s Office).

SUBMIT DOCUMENTS / WRITTEN COMMENTS –

1. E-mail – Agenda related documents and comments can be e-mailed to the Planning & Development Department. Unless otherwise required by law to be accepted by the City at or prior to a Commission meeting or hearing, no documents shall be accepted for Commission review unless they are submitted to the Planning and Development Department at least 24 hours prior to the commencement of the Commission meeting at which the associated agenda item is to be heard. All comments received at least 24 hours prior will be distributed to the Planning Commission prior and during the meeting and will be a part of the official record, pursuant to Article 4 (3).

a. Email comments to PublicCommentsPlanning@fresno.gov.

b. Emails should include the agenda date and item number you wish to speak on in the subject line of your email. Include your name and address for the record, at the top of the body of your email.

VIEWING PLANNING MEETINGS (non-participatory) – For your convenience, there are ways to view Planning Commission meetings live:

1. Community Media Access Collaborative website: <https://cmac.tv/>

2. Cable Television: Comcast Channel 96 and AT&T Channel 99

3. Participate Remotely via Zoom:

https://zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_I18M0bh8TbSGAo27i5ze1Q

a. The above link will allow you to register in advance for remote participation in the meeting via the Zoom platform. After registering, you will receive a confirmation email containing additional details about joining the meeting.

Should any of these viewing methods listed above experience technical difficulties, the Commission meeting will continue uninterrupted. Commission meetings will only be paused to address verifiable technical difficulties for all users participating via

Zoom or in the Chambers.

The City of Fresno's goal is to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Anyone requiring reasonable ADA accommodations, including sign language interpreters, or other reasonable accommodations such as language translation, should contact the office of the City Clerk at (559) 621-7650 or clerk@fresno.gov. To help ensure availability of these services, you are advised to make your request a minimum of 48 hours prior to the scheduled meeting.

I. ROLL CALL

Chair Vang called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

Commissioner Criner arrived at 6:02 p.m.

Also present were Jennifer Clark, Ashley Atkinson, Israel Trejo, Robert Holt, Juan Lara, Sophia Pagoulatos, Michelle Zumwalt, Kari Camino, Heather Thomas (CAO), Dejan Pavic (DPU), Denise Soria (DPU), and Jairo Mata (DPW).

Present 5 - Chairperson Peter Vang, Commissioner David Criner ,
Commissioner Kathy Bray, Commissioner Monica Diaz, and
Commissioner Gurdeep Singh Shergill

Absent 2 - Commissioner Jacqueline G. Lyday, and Commissioner
Linda Calandra

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

6:01 p.m.

III. PROCEDURES

6:01 p.m.

Chair Vang read the procedures aloud.

IV. AGENDA APPROVAL

6:03 p.m.

Commissioner Criner arrived at 6:02 p.m.

Trejo reported no changes to the agenda.

**On motion of Commissioner Criner, seconded by Commissioner Bray,
the AGENDA was APPROVED. The motion carried by the following
vote:**

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Vang, Commissioner Criner , Commissioner
Bray, Commissioner Diaz, and Commissioner Shergill

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Lyday, and Commissioner Calandra

V. CONSENT CALENDAR

N/A

VI. REPORTS BY COMMISSIONERS

6:04 p.m.

None

VII. CONTINUED MATTERS

N/A

VIII. NEW MATTERS

VIII-A [ID 24-1613](#) Consideration of Conditional Use Permit Application No. P24-02488 and related Environmental Assessment No. P24-02488, pertaining to approximately 7.57 acres of property located on the northwest corner of East Copper Avenue and North Portofino Drive (Council District 6) - Planning and Development Department.

1. **ADOPT** Environmental Assessment No. P24-02488, dated December 4, 2024, an Addendum to the Final Subsequent Environmental Impact Report State Clearinghouse No. 2000021003 ("SEIR") for the proposed project, pursuant to Section 15164 of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines.
2. **APPROVE** Conditional Use Permit Application No. P24-02488 which requests authorization to construct a 90-unit multi-family residential development, subject to compliance with the Conditions of Approval dated December 4, 2024.

6:05 p.m.

Lara made a presentation on the project including location, existing land use, Fresno Municipal Code 15-906, development standards, public outreach, and Staff recommendations.

Commissioners asked about community involvement, comments from residents in the area, and what the price range would be.

Brenda Cosio (Applicant) introduced herself and spoke of the Granville House of Hope Giveaway. She stated that a summary of the Neighborhood Meetings was included in the Staff Report provided, and the project would be market rate housing.

No public comment was given.

On motion of Commissioner Diaz, seconded by Commissioner Shergill, that the above Action Item be APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Vang, Commissioner Criner, Commissioner Bray, Commissioner Diaz, and Commissioner Shergill

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Lyday, and Commissioner Calandra

VIII-B [ID 24-1625](#) Hearing to consider Plan Amendment Application No. P24-04066, filed by the Planning and Development Director, to amend the text of Chapter 11 of the Fresno General Plan by replacing the current Fresno Housing Element (2015-2023) with an updated Fresno Multi-Jurisdictional Housing Element (Fresno Housing Element, 2023-2031). The Housing Element is a state-mandated plan for meeting the city's housing needs, including housing affordable to low- and moderate-income households and special needs populations. The Multi-Jurisdictional Housing Element is applicable within the Fresno city limits and would apply to all lands annexed into the City of Fresno.

1. **RECOMMEND that the City Council FIND** that the project is exempt from the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines pursuant to the commonsense exemption set forth in Section 15061(b)(3) because it can be seen with certainty that adoption of the Fresno Housing Element (2023-2031) has no possibility of causing a significant effect on the environment.
2. **RECOMMEND that the City Council ADOPT RESOLUTION** - approving Plan Amendment Application No. P24-04066, amending the text of Chapter 11 of the Fresno General Plan to replace the 2015-2023 Fresno Housing Element with the Fresno Housing Element (2023-2031), including all Text, Policies, Maps, Tables, and Exhibits contained in the Fresno Housing Element dated December 2024 and authorizing the Planning and Development Director to file all necessary material with the Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) for HCD to find that the Housing Element is in conformance with State Housing Element Law and to make all non-substantive changes to the Housing Element to make it internally consistent or to address any non-substantive changes or amendments requested by the HCD to achieve certification.

6:14 p.m.

Director Clark introduced Pagoulatos (who was available on Zoom), and Chelsey Payne, Director of Urban Planning at Ascent (Consultant), and spoke of how the Fresno Housing Element has been a work in progress.

Payne made a presentation on how the Fresno Housing Element is a state-mandated Plan, including an overview, Regional Housing Needs

Allocation (RHNA), Action Plan, community engagement, and Staff recommendations. She spoke of how the RHNA is determined, allocated, broken down by income level, and a detailed inventory of housing available. She further explained how Assembly Bill 686 mandates the City to affirmatively further fair housing, and the key implementation programs to achieve those mandates. She summarized comments from the State Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD), public review of the Draft Plan, public comments, the submittal and revision process, and was available for questions.

Commissioners asked questions regarding public comments, prioritizing most need neighborhoods (especially South of Shaw Avenue), and examples of how the City is providing for those neighborhoods. Clark stated a great example is Measure P, and how the City is working on developing online availability to show where the improvements are being completed.

Public Comment:

4 people spoke in opposition of the Housing Element voicing concerns of the Plan not meeting the State's standards, deficiencies in critical housing needs, failing to address the needs of the un-housed, and seniors with disabilities.

Commissioners asked about the Housing Element not meeting requirements in certain areas, which Payne responded that they are working closely with the State to make revisions. Commissioners appreciated the passion from the Public, and encouraged them to continue the discussions with City Council, however, they were recommending for approval because this Housing Element is better than what Fresno currently has.

On motion of Chairperson Vang, seconded by Vice Chair Bray, that the above Action Item be RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Vang, Commissioner Criner , Commissioner Bray, Commissioner Diaz, and Commissioner Shergill

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Lyday, and Commissioner Calandra

IX. REPORT BY SECRETARY

7:13 p.m.

Director Clark reminded the Commissioners of the importance of notifying Staff of their attendance when trying to identify quorum.

X. SCHEDULED ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

N/A

XI. UNSCHEDULED ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

N/A

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Vang adjourned the meeting at 7:14 p.m.