

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE  
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR  
City Wide Copier Lease Program - RFP NO. 9336**

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS:**

- Gary Watahira, Purchasing Manager/Facilitator, City of Fresno, Finance Department– Purchasing
- Ann Loorz, Purchasing Coordinator, Fresno Unified School District
- Phillip Hardcastle, Principal Accountant, City of Fresno, Finance Department
- Archie Tovar, Network Systems Specialist, City of Fresno, Information Services Department
- Kenneth Wilson, Computer Services Specialist, City of Fresno, Information Services Department
- Todd Stermer, Assistant City Clerk, City of Fresno, City Clerk's Office

**BACKGROUND**

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals for a City wide copier lease program.

Proposals were submitted by the Four vendors according to the Request for Proposal September 22, 2015 deadline. The proposals were based on a price per copy with no minimum requirements

| <u>Vendor</u>              | <u>Projected Annual Cost</u> |
|----------------------------|------------------------------|
| Ray Morgan Company         | \$319,494.00                 |
| American Business Machines | \$326,000.00                 |
| Ricoh USA                  | \$399,339.94                 |
| Caltronics                 | \$455,014.80                 |

**COMMITTEE NOTES**

Evaluation committee members were in agreement that the four responsive proposers are capable of providing the City of Fresno with a copier lease program. All four have experience with large diverse organizations and met the printing needs of the City with the number of copiers proposed, technology aspects (mobile device capabilities, hard drive security, document management), administrative features (tracking prints, default settings to manage costs) and technical support for maintenance and repairs.

Each member agreed that based on the proposals, Ray Morgan Company would provide the best value based on price and services.

**Ray Morgan Company (RMC)**

RMC is the incumbent provider of copier lease services. Their proposal was the lowest cost and provided the additional services requested per the RFP. RMC offered 3 pricing proposals ranging from \$299,244 to 319,494; the price variance was due to the option to utilize Samsung copiers. The majority of the Committee believed that the City would better served by staying with the Cannon copiers. The chosen solution includes replacing Central Printing production copiers with Ricoh copiers considered a better option to meet production copier needs. RMC also offered a fixed price option in which the City

would be charged a fixed monthly rate for the year. The fixed charges would be adjusted annually based on actual previous year's costs. Based on price and proposal, RMC was the selected vendor.

#### **American Business Machines (ABM)**

ABM's proposal was the second lowest proposal. The committee believed ABM had the staffing and experience to manage an account the size of the City of Fresno. The committee believed ABM to be credible with their commitment to customer service as well as their experience with large organizations and deployments. Due to cost being slightly higher than RMC's proposal at \$326,000 and offering the same Cannon line of copiers, the committee's opinion was to stay with RMC.

#### **Ricoh USA**

Ricoh USA's proposal offered their brand of copier and had the staffing and experience to manage an account the size of the City of Fresno. The proposal of \$399,339.94 was higher than both RMC and ABM. The Ricoh interview showcased a variety of services and capabilities that were beyond the scope of this RFP. The services and capabilities were impressive, the committee's opinion was that the focus needed to be on the main objective of RFP and that decisions beyond the scope would require input from the Administration and all City Departments.

#### **Caltronics**

Caltronics offered Kyocera copiers with impressive copying speeds as well as product reliability documentation. Caltronics was also very well prepared for the interview process. Every question was answered to the complete satisfaction of the Committee. Overall the committee was very impressed and felt that Caltronics had the ability to provide a high level of service and expertise. The committee could not justify changing vendors at the bid price \$455,014.80, significantly higher than RMC, ABM and Ricoh.

#### **RECOMMENDATION:**

The committee unanimously recommends Ray Morgan Company to provide City Wide copier lease services. The decision was based on their proposal, offering the lowest cost and the option of a no-overage flat billing rate (rate would be determined by the prior year's actual usage).