

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
ANNUAL BACKFLOW TESTING AND CERTIFICATION - RFP NO. 9315**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Diana Reynolds, Buyer II/Facilitator, City of Fresno, Finance Department– Purchasing
- Aaron Aguirre, Public Works Manager, Public Works/Landscape Division
- Ron Simons , Water System Supervisor, City of Fresno, Department of Public Utilities
- Dennis Schaefer, Parks Supervisor I, City of Fresno, Public Works/Landscape Division

BACKGROUND

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals to provide annual backflow assembly testing and certification. The operator will be responsible for maintaining various areas through the City of Fresno on a yearly basis.

Proposals were submitted by the four (4) vendors according to the Request for Proposal February 24, 2015 deadline. Below is a summary of Proposals submitted by the four (4) vendors:

<u>Vendor</u>	<u>\$ Proposal</u>
AAA Backflow Prevention Service	\$66,000.00
B.E. Gibbons-Consultant	\$57,200.00
Mobile Sprinkler Repair	\$62,000.00
Performance Plus Plumbing	\$163,000.00

COMMITTEE NOTES

Evaluation committee members were in agreement that three of the four proposers are capable of providing the City of Fresno with annual backflow testing and certification services. Therefore, the selection was based on the differences in the vendors' written proposals and adequate staffing.

During the committee meeting Performance Plus Plumbing was immediately eliminated from consideration due to their pricing. Performance Plus Plumbing is more than double the project budget and almost three times the amount of the other vendors. Mobile Sprinkler Repair was also eliminated since their proposal failed to show how they would be able to meet the time constraints with only one tester.

Each member agreed that based on the proposals, references and past projects, AAA Backflow Prevention Service will provide the best value for the City of Fresno. The award will cover the entire City of Fresno Public Works Division's 1,600 landscape services backflow throughout the entire City.

AAA Backflow Prevention Service

The committee unanimously agreed that AAA Backflow Prevention Service will provide the best value to the City of Fresno Public Works' annual backflow testing and certification needs. This was reflected in their proposal which illustrated adequate staffing, seven certified American Water Works Association Backflow Preventer (AWWA BP) Testers on staff, past performance on City of Fresno Water Division projects and holding the required contractor's license requested in the RFP. With over 1,600 backflows needing annual testing and certification their organization has the experience and organizational structure to meet the requirements set forth in the RFP.

Mobile Sprinkler Repair

The committee agreed that Mobile Sprinkler Repair might struggle providing the annual services outlined in the RFP. In their proposal, they only list one certified AWWA BP Tester on staff; with over 1,600 services in need of annual certification the committee was not confident one tester would be able to handle this quantity and meet the timeframe set forth in the RFP.

B.E. Gibbons

The proposer provided the lowest annual bid to perform the work, but they did not include a single certified AWWA BP Testers in their proposal. This uncertainty generated some doubt from the committee that the proposer would be able to get the work completed. Their proposal was missing an organizational chart and lacked organizational structure, even though they are the lowest proposer the committee felt like the vendor would struggle to meet the requirements in the RFP.

Performance Plus Plumbing

The committee felt that although the Performance Plus Plumbing would be able to perform the requirements of this RFP satisfactorily, their pricing was extremely high. Their pricing was more than double the project budget and nearly three times the amount of the other vendors, therefore eliminating them from consideration for this RFP.

RECOMMENDATION:

The committee unanimously agrees and reconfirms their findings that AAA Backflow Prevention Service will be able to provide the most effective annual backflow testing and certification as well as the best value based on their proposal. Therefore, the committee recommends that AAA Backflow Prevention Service be awarded the Annual Backflow Testing and Certification contract.