

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
REBID CITY OF FRESNO ANNUAL TREE TRIMMING - RFP NO. 9623
(Committee Meetings held on 10-27-21, 10-28-21, 11-8-21 and 11-10-21)**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Sandra Gamez, Senior Procurement Specialist/Facilitator, City of Fresno, Finance Department - Purchasing
- Brian Russell, Public Works Assistant Director, City of Fresno, DPW
- Vincent Patlan, Landscape Maintenance Superintendent, City of Fresno, DPW
- Hilary Kimber, Landscape Maintenance Parks Supervisor II, City of Fresno, DPW
- Bret Conner, Street Maintenance Superintendent, City of Fresno, DPW
- Mark Rivas, Street Maintenance Management Analyst II, City of Fresno, DPW

BACKGROUND

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals to provide professional tree trimming services for various locations within the City of Fresno. The RFP was intended to identify a qualified firm to provide services for tree trimming, removal and replacement of trees, and GPS tree inventory, as needed, within the City's Urban Forest as per the specifications.

Proposals were submitted by the following three vendors according to the Request for Proposal October 26, 2021, deadline. There was a subsequent Questionnaire requested by the two top candidates on October 28th, 2021 and returned on November 3rd, 2021. Responses to the Questionnaires are attached. Pricing proposals submitted by the top two candidates are included below:

				Kingsborough Atlas Tree Surgery Inc.	West Coast Arborists, Inc.
Item	Description	Unit	Quantity	Unit Price	Unit Price
1	Mediator (Owner's 50% Share, See Page 51 of General Conditions)	LUMP SUM	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
2	Tree Pruning (by Grid)	PER TREE	40000	\$48.00	\$75.00
3	Aesthetic/Service Request Pruning/Block Pruning 0" - 6" DBH	PER TREE	100	\$20.00	\$75.00
4	Aesthetic/Service Request Pruning/Block Pruning 7" - 12" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$30.00	\$150.00
5	Aesthetic/Service Request Pruning/Block Pruning 13" - 18" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$40.00	\$200.00
6	Aesthetic/Service Request Pruning/Block Pruning 19" - 24" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$50.00	\$200.00

7	Aesthetic/Service Request Pruning/Block Pruning 25" - 30" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$100.00	\$200.00
8	Aesthetic/Service Request Pruning/Block Pruning 31" - 36" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$150.00	\$300.00
9	Aesthetic/Service Request Pruning/Block Pruning 36"+ DBH	PER TREE	200	\$200.00	\$300.00
10	Crown Raise/Clearance Prune tree 0" - 6" DBH	PER TREE	100	\$25.00	\$50.00
11	Crown Raise/Clearance Prune tree 7" - 12" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$35.00	\$50.00
12	Crown Raise/Clearance Prune tree 13" - 18" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$50.00	\$50.00
13	Crown Raise/Clearance Prune tree 19" - 24" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$75.00	\$75.00
14	Crown Raise/Clearance Prune tree 25" - 30" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$150.00	\$75.00
15	Crown Raise/Clearance Prune tree 31" - 36" DBH	PER TREE	200	\$250.00	\$95.00
16	Crown Raise/Clearance Prune tree 36"+ DBH	PER TREE	200	\$350.00	\$95.00
17	Prune Date Palm (Phoenix spp.)	PER TREE	15	\$450.00	\$350.00
18	Ornamental Ball Shaping for Date Palm (Phoenix spp.)	PER TREE	20	\$450.00	\$500.00
19	Prune Fan Palm (Washingtonia Filifera)	PER TREE	20	\$100.00	\$350.00
20	Prune Fan Palm (Washingtonia Robusta.)	PER TREE	100	\$100.00	\$95.00
21	Skin Fan Palm Trunk (Washingtonia spp.)	LINEAR FT.	30	\$5.00	\$35.00
22	Prune all other Palm Species	PER TREE	20	\$100.00	\$95.00
23	Tree & Stump removal per dia. inch 0" - 6" DBH	PER TREE	5	\$60.00	\$300.00
24	Tree & Stump removal per dia. inch 7" - 12" DBH	PER TREE	25	\$120.00	\$400.00
25	Tree & Stump removal per dia. inch 13" - 18" DBH	PER TREE	25	\$180.00	\$600.00
26	Tree & Stump removal per dia. inch 19" - 24" DBH	PER TREE	50	\$240.00	\$800.00
27	Tree & Stump removal per dia. inch 25" - 30" DBH	PER TREE	50	\$300.00	\$1,000.00
28	Tree & Stump removal per dia. inch 31" - 36" DBH	PER TREE	50	\$360.00	\$1,500.00
29	Tree & Stump removal per dia. inch over 36"+ DBH	PER TREE	10	\$360.00	\$3,000.00
30	Tree only removal per dia. inch 0" - 6" DBH	PER TREE	5	\$25.00	\$250.00

31	Tree only removal per dia. inch 7" - 12" DBH	PER TREE	5	\$262.50	\$300.00
32	Tree only removal per dia. inch 13" - 18" DBH	PER TREE	10	\$525.00	\$500.00
33	Tree only removal per dia. inch 19" - 24" DBH	PER TREE	10	\$2,100.00	\$750.00
34	Tree only removal per dia. inch 25" - 30" DBH	PER TREE	10	\$2,300.00	\$900.00
35	Tree only removal per dia. inch 31" - 36" DBH	PER TREE	10	\$2,500.00	\$1,250.00
36	Tree only removal per dia. inch over 36"+ DBH	PER TREE	10	\$4,200.00	\$2,500.00
37	Stump grinding per stump diameter inch at grade	PER TREE	30	\$10.00	\$275.00
38	Special handling and disposal fee per ton for contaminated trees (per ton)	PER TREE	20	\$400.00	\$100.00
39	15-gallon tree	PER TREE	300	\$375.00	\$190.00
40	24-inch box tree	PER TREE	10	\$750.00	\$400.00
41	36-inch box tree	PER TREE	5	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00
42	48-inch box tree	PER TREE	5	\$1,500.00	\$2,000.00
43	Per foot of root barrier installed	LINEAR FT.	50	\$200.00	\$50.00
44	Per foot of roots pruned	LINEAR FT.	150	\$200.00	\$35.00
45	Hole Drilling 24" wide x 10' deep	PER HOLE	25	\$450.00	\$250.00
46	Tree Watering of young trees, includes water truck & operator	PER HOUR	100	\$275.00	\$100.00
47	Crew Rental Rate	PER HOUR	40	\$275.00	\$300.00
48	Crane	PER HOUR	10	\$575.00	\$100.00
49	95-foot aerial tower	PER HOUR	10	\$575.00	\$100.00
50	Misc Items (provide details of cost in Planet Bid line comments)	LUMP SUM	1	\$0.00	\$100.00
51	Misc Items (provide details of cost in Planet Bid line comments)	LUMP SUM	1	\$0.00	\$100.00
52	Misc Items (provide details of cost in Planet Bid line comments)	LUMP SUM	1	\$0.00	\$0.00
53	During normal business hours (Mon-Fri 7am to 4pm)	PER HOUR	10	\$412.50	\$450.00
54	After hours, weekends &/or holidays	PER HOUR	10	\$550.00	\$450.00
55	GPS Tree Inventory -Cost per tree site collected including vacant sites	PER TREE	250	\$75.00	\$4.00

COMMITTEE NOTES

The committee members evaluated the proposers on 1) Cost as shown on the proposal form, 2) Ability to meet the stated service requirements, 3) Past Performance and Experience based on References and experience, 4) Conformance to the terms and conditions of the RFP, 5) Financial Stability based on information provided, 6) Certified International Society of Arboriculture License, and 7) Other related information.

Mariposa Landscapes Inc. (Total Bid Amount: \$5,825,195.00) – The quote was cost prohibitive, so they were not considered in the final review.

Kingsborough Atlas Tree Surgery Inc. (Total Bid Amount: \$2,699,912.50) – The consensus among the committee members was that while Kingsborough Atlas provided the lowest quote, there were numerous areas of concern associated with their proposal. They are as follows:

- **Local Presence** – Kingborough Atlas does not currently have a strong established local presence. Per the firm, they would still need to hire local employees to ramp up and be able to meet the City's requirements per the RFP's specifications.
- **Proven Experience with Municipalities** – While the vendor did provide a list of references, only three were municipalities. Upon checking these references, the committee learned that the work being performed for these cities was either not at the scope or scale required by the City in this RFP.
- **Familiarity with the City of Fresno's Urban Forest** – Based on the RFP and follow up questionnaire, Kingsborough Atlas was unable to identify a substantial familiarity with the Fresno area urban forest. The previous work referenced by the firm was almost exclusively in the Bay Area, with no specific government or agency work identified in the Central Valley.

Because of the importance of these criteria, the committee saw this proposal as the weaker of the two. In addition, Kingsborough Atlas was unable to demonstrate a sufficient understanding of the prevailing wage policy by proposing "Climber" positions as part of their 3 to 4-person tree crews. Lastly, the committee felt the responses by Kingsborough Atlas to both the RFP and subsequent Questionnaire lacked the quality and thoroughness expected by a vendor looking to take on a project of this size and importance. Consensus amongst the committee was that this could be representative of the vendor as a whole, and emblematic of the actual work being requested in the RFP.

West Coast Arborists, Inc. (Total Bid Amount: \$3,827,900.00) – Because of their large local presence, the committee was familiar with West Coast Arborists (WCA). The consensus among the committee was that WCA is a known commodity in the Central Valley. When conducting the analysis, the committee found that the concerns we had with the previous vendor, conversely were all strengths of WCA. For comparison:

- **Local Presence** – WCA has maintained a local office in Fresno since 1994, and in that time has hired over 75 employees from the Fresno area. With 27 local employees currently on board, and the resources and equipment already in place, WCA is positioned to immediately begin work with no additional ramp up time required.
- **Proven Experience with Municipalities** – Along with their work with the City, WCA provided a list of references which included 158 municipalities in the State, including 4 in the Central Valley, all with similar needs as requested in the RFP.

- **Familiarity with the City of Fresno's Urban Forest** – WCA, who was previously contracted with the City to perform the requested work, is familiar with the City's urban forest, and has proven to be extremely competent and reliable while working on various projects for the City.

These items represent not only the most critical criteria, but also outlined the starkest contrasts between the two vendors. In each case, the clear advantage came down on the side of WCA. The vendor also provided the names of 5 ISA Certified Arborists to be assigned to this project as opposed to only 1 by Kingsborough Atlas. Lastly, WCA's professionalism was made evident in their responses to both the initial RFP as well as the follow-up Questionnaire. It was obvious WCA was making every effort to provide exactly what the City requested. The committee felt this was an indicator of the effort and professionalism the City could expect from WCA if awarded the contract.

Summary Recommendation – After carefully reviewing both proposals and conducting proper follow-up, the committee unanimously voted to recommend WCA's proposal. Considering all 7 of the criteria outlined in the RFP, it became clear that WCA's proposal represented a superior solution for the City. WCA's overwhelming advantage in the areas of local presence, relevant references, experience with the City's landscape, number of Certified Arborists, demonstrated knowledge of prevailing wage policy, and general professionalism in their responses to the RFP as well as the committee's follow-up questions made the recommendation obvious. WCA represents the best value for the City.