

## REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE

### REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR RWRF REPLACEMENT OF PLC EQUIPMENT, SCADA SYSTEM REPLACEMENT & CONFIGURATION INTEGRATION RFP NO. 3753

#### COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Todd Eischen – Wastewater System Supervisor, Department of Public Utilities (DPU)
- Timothy Tompsett – Wastewater Manager, DPU
- David Row – Street Maintenance Supervisor, Public Works Department
- Michael Del Carlo – Senior Water Systems Telecommunication Specialist, DPU
- Matthew Bullis - Professional Engineer/Facilitator, DPU
- Iris Yi – Procurement Specialist, Finance Department

#### BACKGROUND

The City of Fresno's Department of Public Utilities solicited proposals from qualified firms to replace Programmable Control Logic (PLC) equipment within the Gas Conditioning Plant at the Fresno/Clovis Regional Wastewater Reclamation Facility (RWRF). This project will replace existing PLC controllers housed in the electrical control panels for the Zink Flare and Air Liquide equipment, replace one HMI terminal in the electrical panel door and replace specified PLC controllers within the balance of plant area. The Contractor will also replace the existing Wonderware SCADA software with Allen-Bradley Factory Talk software, configure the software functional to the application and upgrade the existing Historian software. The proposer is to possess an Electrical Contractor's license and have staff qualified as a Rockwell Automation System Integrator. The City received four proposals from vendors by the April 28, 2020, deadline.

#### COMMITTEE NOTES

The committee members met on May 7, 2020 and evaluated the proposers on 1) Cost as shown on the proposal form 2) Ability to meet the stated service requirements, 3) Past performance and experience 4) Conformance to the terms and conditions of the RFP, 5) Financial Stability and 6) Other related information provided by the proposers. The vendor summary information is as follows:

##### A-C Electric

A-C Electric Company had over 55 years' experience as a C10 electrical contractor and is an industrial automation company with expertise in PLC equipment replacement and programming. They have been a Rockwell certified system integrator for over 10 years. They have experience working on wastewater treatment plants including electrical equipment replacement, converting Wonderware with Factory Talk View SE software platforms and system integration. The proposal cost for this work was \$107,734 which was the lowest cost submitted by the four vendors. A-C Electric was ranked No. 1 by the selection committee.

### Pacific Blue Engineering

The engineering firm had 6 years' experience in PLC Programming. They did not have a contractor's license nor were they a Rockwell System Integrator as required by the RFP. The company listed experience working in the military defense industry and food processing industry. The proposal amount for this work was \$114,655.03. Pacific Blue Engineering was ranked No. 4 by the selection committee.

### Lighthouse Electrical

This company has 15 years' experience in PLC programming, works as a licensed C10 Electrical Contractor, holds certificates as a Rockwell system integrator and has experience working on wastewater related IT/SCADA system integrations. The proposal amount for this work was \$118,230. Lighthouse Electrical was ranked No. 2 by the selection committee.

### TESCO Controls

Tesco Controls have over 45 years' experience as a C10 Electrical Contractor and are a Level one certified Rockwell System Integrator. They have considerable experience in wastewater related project experience. The proposal amount was \$175,120.20. TESCO was ranked No. 3 by the selection committee as the cost for this work was the highest of the group.

### Summary Recommendation

The committee reviewed all proposals and ranked A-C Electric as the most qualified consultant to perform the specified work. A-C Electric's work experience, low cost to perform the work, conformance with the specifications and overall proposal was ranked No.1; therefore, the selection committee recommends that A-C Electric Company be awarded the contract.