

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

FOR: RFP FOR ARPA FAÇADE GRANT PROGRAM

RFP No. 12300927
RFP Opening: 10/25/2022

<u>PROPOSERS</u> (In alphabetical order)	<u>TOTAL PROPOSAL AMOUNT</u>
1. Chinatown Fresno Foundation 912 F Street Fresno, CA 93706	\$300,000.00
2. Fresno Area Hispanic Foundation 1444 Fulton Street Fresno, CA 93721	\$1,500,000.00
3. Fresno Metro Black Chamber Foundation 1600 Fulton Street 120 Fresno, CA 93721	\$750,000.00
4. Geocko, Inc. dba FORWARD PO Box 12242 Seattle, Washington 98102	\$149,250.00
5. Neighborhood Industries 353 E. Olive Avenue Fresno, CA 93728	\$25,000.00
6. SE Fresno Com. Dev. Assn. 5288 E. Heaton Avenue Fresno, CA 93727	\$499,500.00
7. The Downtown Association 845 Fulton Street Fresno, CA 93721	\$1,500,000.00

Each proposer has agreed to allow the City one hundred twenty (120) days from date proposals were opened to accept or reject their proposal.

DEPARTMENT CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION:

Award a contract in the amount of \$ 1,500,000.00
to Fresno Area Hispanic Foundation
in accordance with the Selection Committee recommendation.

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

FOR: RFP FOR ARPA FAÇADE GRANT PROGRAM

RFP No. 12300927
RFP Opening: 10/25/2022

Reject all proposals. Reason:

Remarks: Please see attached "Committee Report" for a summary of the review of these proposals and justification for this selection.

Department Head Approval



Title Economic Development Director

Date 12/21/2022

Approve Dept. Recommendation

Disapprove

See Attachment

Approve GSD/Purchasing Recommendation

Disapprove

GENERAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

CITY MANAGER



Purchasing Manager 12/22/2022
Date



City Manager or Designee 1/4/23
Date



General Services Director 2/12/22
Date

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
ARPA FAÇADE GRANT PROGRAM
RFP NO. 12300927
(Committee Meeting held on 12/08/2022)**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Terry Cox, Project Liaison/Program Administrator, City of Fresno, Planning and Development Department
- Courtney Espinoza, Business Manager, City of Fresno, Finance Department
- Alma Torres, Deputy City Manager, City of Fresno, City Manager's Department
- Kelly Trevino, Economic Development Analyst, City of Fresno, Economic Development Department

FACILITATOR

- James Jackson, Senior Procurement Specialist, City of Fresno, General Services Department

BACKGROUND

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals from local community-based organizations to administer a façade grant program to local small businesses. A total of \$1,500,000 in American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) funding is available to be awarded to one or multiple proposers.

Proposals were submitted by a total of seven (7) entities by the Request for Proposals deadline of 3:00 pm on October 25, 2022.

COMMITTEE NOTES

The committee members evaluated the proposers on a number of factors including 1) Staffing levels and overall confidence in meeting the program requirements including reporting compliance and established funding deadlines; 2) Past experience with similar programs; 3) Past performance and experience with the City of Fresno, and 4) other related information provided by proposers, including thoroughness and adherence to the RFP guidelines, in their submissions.

Chinatown Fresno – Chinatown Fresno submitted a proposal for \$300,000 (20% of available funding) to administer a façade grant program in Chinatown. General consensus was that the organization does not have prior experience with a similar program and does not have the staffing required to adequately manage this program. The committee was concerned that this proposal would require additional City staff time for oversight and reporting compliance.

Downtown Fresno Partnership (DFP) – DFP submitted a proposal for \$1,500,000 (100% of available funding) to administer a façade grant program in Downtown Fresno. Proposal indicated all marketing and outreach would be concentrated on the downtown triangle area and there would be reliance on the City of Fresno for Punjabi and Hmong translations. They indicated experience with much smaller programs but nothing of this size or with the reporting complexity required for these funds. General consensus was that they do not have the experience or staffing required to adequately administer a program of this size. Additionally, staff was concerned about negative

impacts due to the upcoming changes in leadership associated with the President/CEO who has announced his departure from the organization in the coming months.

Forward/Geocko – Forward/Geocko submitted a proposal for \$149,250 to administer the façade grant program with the remaining funding made available for façade grants (100% of available funding). Proposal indicated very limited outreach through one local partner (with limited staffing) with reliance on the City for assistance with marketing. It does appear that they have experience with similar programs. This organization is based in Seattle, Washington and is not a local community-based organization. The evaluation committee was concerned that the organization did not have well established relationships with local entities to fully reach the intended targeted businesses.

Fresno Area Hispanic Foundation (FAHF) – FAHF submitted a proposal for \$1,500,000 (100% of available funding) to administer a façade grant program throughout the City of Fresno with outreach/marketing focused on Downtown, Chinatown and the TOD Corridors. Proposal indicated that the organization would work with subcontractors to assure that outreach and assistance was provided to these areas in English, Spanish, Hmong & Punjabi. This organization has significant experience with similar programs including the City of Fresno's "Save our Small Business" Grant Program. The organization also expressed a willingness to subcontract with other entities to gain maximum reach and exposure throughout the target areas and populations. General consensus was that the organization has the staffing and experience to adequately and successfully administer this program with minimal burden and impact to the City.

Fresno Metro Black Chamber of Commerce (FMBCC) – FMBCC submitted a proposal for \$750,000 (50% of available funding) to administer a façade grant program throughout the City of Fresno with outreach/marketing focused on Downtown, Southwest Fresno, West Fresno, Southeast Fresno and Chinatown. General consensus was that this proposal was hard to follow with significant typographical errors and references to performance of work to be done in other cities. Timelines were unclear and confusing. The proposal did not reflect any successful prior experience with similar programs of this magnitude and evaluators felt that additional City staff time would be necessary to ensure accurate compliance and reporting and on time delivery.

Neighborhood Industries – Neighborhood Industries submitted a proposal for \$25,000 (less than 2% of available funding) to fund a façade grant for their building. The proposal was removed from consideration as they did not sufficiently respond to the RFP to administer the overall grant program.

Southeast Fresno Community Economic Development Association (SEFCEDA) – SEFCEDA submitted a proposal for \$499,500 (33.3% of available funding) to administer a façade grant program in the Ventura/Kings Canyon Corridor (TOD) area. Proposal indicated that organization intends to act as project manager for all construction work directly and that CEO may also perform as the general contractor. General consensus was that this organization does not have prior experience with a similar program of this magnitude or the staffing required to adequately manage this program and that additional City staff time would be necessary to ensure accurate compliance and reporting

Summary Recommendation- After reviewing and discussing all proposals, the general consensus was that FAHF provides the best value and their proposal was the most thorough and best aligned with the RFP. In addition, staff determined that FAHF was capable of providing the level of service required to effectively administer this project and had the prior experience and knowledge necessary for reporting compliance requirements of the ARPA funding that would be

helpful for success and create minimal impact to City staff. Per FAHF's proposal, the City will encourage them to subcontract as necessary in order to ensure that outreach and assistance is provided in English, Spanish, Hmong & Punjabi throughout the City with specific emphasis on Downtown, Chinatown and the TOD Corridor areas as indicated in the RFP.