

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUIREMENTS CONTRACT REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FUEL SITE AND UST MAINTENANCE,
REPAIR, AND TESTING
RFP No. 9636**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

AMIE PAINTER – Senior Management Analyst, City of Fresno Fleet Management Division
COSMO ORDUNEZ – Equipment Supervisor, City of Fresno Fleet Management Division
JUAN CASTALLANOS – Equipment Supervisor, City of Fresno Fleet Management Division
LARRY THOMPSON – Equipment Supervisor, City of Fresno Department of Transportation
STEVE SMITH – DBE Coordinator, City of Fresno Purchasing Division
AUGUSTUS KRIDER – Procurement Specialist, City of Fresno Purchasing Division

FACILITATOR:

AMIE PAINTER – Senior Management Analyst, City of Fresno Fleet Management Division

BACKGROUND

The City of Fresno solicited proposals from qualified vendors to maintain, repair, and test various City of Fresno owned fueling sites and underground storage tanks within Fresno County. This request is for a two (2) year Contract with three (3) possible one (1) year extensions. At the conclusion of bid opening, three vendors bid on the RFP as follows:

1. West Star Environmental, Inc. (\$62,064.60)
2. Nwestco, LLC dba Confidence UST Services, Inc. (\$153,749.00)
3. Bagley Enterprises, Inc. (\$201,600.50)

SIGNIFICANT EVENTS

Bid Release – May 11, 2022

Bid Opening – June 21, 2022

Committee Evaluation – August 11, 2022

EVALUATION BY COMMITTEE:

West Star Environmental

West Star Environmental had the lowest proposal price of \$62,064.60. Committee members reviewed and approved their credentials. Committee members discussed past experience with West Star Environmental and Augustus was able to provide the details regarding complaints submitted to Purchasing. The complaints were from 2/3/2020 for test results not being submitted to the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District (APCD) in time. On 2/20/2020 Fleet reported West Star Environmental postponed site testing with no notice. On 3/6/2020 Fleet reported West Star did not show up for an inspection at the Cedar and Butler location. On

2/24/2021 Fleet reported West Star did not show up for an inspection at Wastewater and they canceled another site inspection scheduled for the next day. On 2/24/2021 Fleet also reported that West Star blamed the scheduling issues on the APCD and when the APCD was contacted by Fleet they stated it was West Star that had the issues. The Committee members discussed these complaints and determined it would be best to give West Star Environmental another chance due to personnel changes within Fleet and the large price difference between them and the other bidders.

Nwestco

Nwestco was the second lowest bidder with a proposal price of \$153,749. Committee members reviewed and approved their credentials. Committee members discussed their current experience with Nwestco and it was comparable to West Star Environmental. Nwestco showed up for an inspection and their tool was broken, the inspection was rescheduled, and the tool was still broken for the second inspection. It is difficult to receive responses from their office staff via phone and email. Committee members reviewed the proposed cost for each line item and noticed a much higher cost for travel expenses. The committee concluded that was due to Nwestco being located outside of the city of Fresno.

Bagley Enterprises

Bagley Enterprises was the highest bidder with a proposal price of \$201,600.50. Committee members reviewed and approved their credentials. Committee members reviewed the proposed cost for each line item and noticed a much higher cost for travel expenses. The committee concluded that was due to Bagley Enterprises being located outside of the city of Fresno.

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION

The Committee unanimously agreed that West Star Environmental would be the best fit for the City's based upon performance and adherence to contract requirements.