

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS:**

BRIAN GOSS – Planning Division, Fresno Area Express  
NOEL VILLAVERDE – Information Services Supervisor, City of Fresno  
JEFF LONG – Senior Regional Planner, Fresno Council of Governments

**FACILITATOR:**

TAMRA TORRENCE – Senior Procurement Specialist, Department of Finance

**BACKGROUND:**

Fresno Area Express (FAX) has issued this Request for Proposals (RFP) to solicit proposals for a Cloud-Based Transit Planning Software.

FAX solicited for a Cloud-Based Transit Planning Software Solution that would provide a convenient way to strategically design and analyze transit options for the Fresno Metropolitan Area.

At a minimum, the solution that provides quick bus route design and analysis capacities through an internet browser interface, including map-based route and stop planning, stop-based demographic analysis, operating cost calculations based on both frequencies and timetables, and customizable accessibility visualizations and analytics. External stakeholders can comment electronically on the cloud-based plans through globally accessible hyperlinks, and users can analyze neighboring transit datasets for additional collaboration. The Transit Planning Software should be designed to work within existing transit planning processes, including the ability to import routes through existing sources such as General Transit Feed Specification (GTFS) and shape file, and to export data for use in existing transit tools.

FAX was seeking proposals from qualified firms to implement a Software as a Service (SaaS) solution. The solution will include design, hosting, software, communications, and all system interfaces.

Proposals were solicited for this project on July 8, 2024, and advertised in the Fresno Business Journal and posted to BidsOnline. The Request for Proposals was sent to six building exchanges and specifications were distributed to thirty-two potential bidders. The bids were publicly opened on August 6, 2024.

Five proposals were submitted.

## SIGNIFICANT EVENTS

|                 |                       |
|-----------------|-----------------------|
| July 8, 2014    | Bid Release           |
| August 6, 2024  | Bid Opening           |
| August 27, 2024 | Committee Meeting     |
| August 27, 2024 | Committee Evaluations |

## EVALUATION CRITERIA

FAX's solicitation included the following five evaluation criteria ranked in order of relative importance:

### 1. Proposed Solution

This category will evaluate the Proposed Approach included in the submittal. Some factors that will be considered when evaluating this category are:

- What is the proposed approach to completing the work?
- What is the proposed approach to project management and quality control?
- What are the team's expectations of FAX staff?

### 2. Qualifications, Related Experience, and References

This category will examine the qualifications and experience of each firm, associated staff, and specific individuals that will be assigned to the project. Some factors that will be considered when evaluating this category are:

- What is the experience of each firm in performing similar work?
- Does the firm possess the technical capabilities to deploy the application?
- What is the background and experience of the staff from each firm?
- Does the team have sufficient staffing and technical/analytical skills to complete the proposed tasks?

### 3. Cost Proposal and Conformance to the Terms and Conditions

This category will evaluate the reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed costs and the proposer's conformance to the terms and conditions of the RFP.

### 4. References

This category will evaluate each firm and/or team member based on the information obtained from the references listed in the submittal.

- Did FAX receive favorable information about each firm and/or team member when conducting reference checks?

## COMMITTEE NOTES

### **Remix Technologies –**

- *Meets all the FAX requirements*
- *Current provider of the service*
- *Jane and Network Jane are excellent features for evaluating service area*
- *Multi-user editing*
- *Well written proposal*
- *Turnkey product with no additional resources needed*
- *Best value for the price*

### **Trapeze Software Group -**

- *New product for Trapeze.*
- *Lacks desired features.*
- *Proposed software is not in use anywhere*
- *Inability to share maps*
- *Inability to shift trips based on trip times*
- *Inability to export to Excel*
- *Highest price for an inferior product*

### **Podaris Limited –**

- *Training on-site is an additional fee (\$8,000)*
- *References are from 2 consulting firms in the US and the only transit agency using the product is in Ireland*
- *Excellent training and follow-up plan*
- *Well written proposal*

### **Schedule Masters –**

- *Experience is with small operators with less than 1 million passenger trips (FAX 9.6 million)*
- *Proposal not clear about their abilities and do not fully address the requirements*
- *Insufficient details*
- *Low bid*

### **Optibus -**

- *Exceptions to Indemnification and General Conditions*
- *Data is hosted in Ireland with backup in the European Union. (CoF IT requires hosting in the US)*
- *Optibus offers multiple modules, similar to our current provider Trapeze, but is only proposing the Planning Module*
- *Machine learning run times, utilizing real times, historic times (if available) and car travel times from Google Maps*

## **SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION**

The City received five (5) responses to the solicitation. After independent evaluation of the proposals, using the evaluation criteria noted above, the evaluation committee unanimously determined that the most qualified, responsible, and responsive proposer was Remix Technologies. Remix Technologies is a proven vendor with extensive experience in transit planning software and has been the service provider for FAX since 2018.