



# City of Fresno

2600 Fresno Street  
Fresno, CA 93721  
www.fresno.gov

## Meeting Minutes City Council

**President - Nelson Esparza**

**Vice President - Tyler Maxwell**

**Councilmembers:**

**Annalisa Perea, Mike Karbassi, Miguel Angel Arias,**

**Luis Chavez,**

**Garry Bredefeld**

**City Manager - Georgeanne A. White**

**City Attorney - Andrew Janz**

**City Clerk - Todd Stermer, CMC**

---

Thursday, January 5, 2023

9:00 AM

Council Chambers (In  
Person And/Or Electronic)

---

### Regular Meeting

The City Council met in regular session in the Council Chamber, City Hall, on the date and time above written.

#### 9:08 A.M. ROLL CALL

**Present:** 7 - Councilmember Nelson Esparza  
Council President Tyler Maxwell  
Vice President Annalisa Perea  
Councilmember Mike Karbassi  
Councilmember Miguel Angel Arias  
Councilmember Luis Chavez  
Councilmember Garry Bredefeld

Invocation by Pastor DJ Criner from Saint Rest Baptist Church.

*Pastor DJ Criner gave the invocation.*

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

*Vice President Maxwell led the Pledge of Allegiance.*

#### Performances By:

Bagpiping Performance by Aaron Lipinski

*PERFORMED*

Mariachi Cachanilla

*PERFORMED*

Folklorico Performance by Los Niños de Aztlán (The Children of Aztlán)

*PERFORMED*

Hmong Culture and Art Performance by Viv Ncaus Koom Siab (Sisters in Harmony)

*PERFORMED*

## **APPROVE AGENDA**

*City Clerk Stermer announced the following changes to the agenda:*

*The oath of office for Councilmember-elect Perea (ID 23-02) would be administered by her father, Henry R. Perea, and her mother, Grace Daniels.*

*The proclamation for "Corin Hoggard Day" (ID 23-41) was moved to the January 19, 2023, agenda by Councilmember Karbassi and Councilmember Arias.*

*Consent Calendar item 1-E (ID 23-09), regarding the Staffing for Adequate Fire and Emergency Response (SAFER) grant, was moved to the January 19, 2023, agenda by staff.*

*Councilmember Karbassi and Councilmember Bredefeld each registered "no" votes for Consent Calendar item 1-G (ID 23-48) regarding the purchase of the Accela Cannabis Module.*

*Councilmember Karbassi requested the meeting be adjourned in the memory of life long Fresno resident and U.S. Army veteran, Donal Lacy Gregory.*

**THE FOLLOWING CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS WERE MOVED TO THE CONTESTED CONSENT CALENDAR FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION**

*1-D (ID 23-27) regarding the payoff of the Roeding Business Park loan - moved to Contested Consent by Councilmember Arias.*

1-I (ID 23-15) regarding the summary vacation of certain streets - moved to Contested Consent by Councilmember Arias.

1-P (ID 23-57) regarding declaration of a local state of emergency to address affordable housing and homelessness - moved to Contested Consent by Councilmember Chavez.

**On motion of Councilmember Chavez, seconded by Councilmember Arias, the agenda was APPROVED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Esparza, Maxwell, Perea, Karbassi, Arias, Chavez and Bredefeld

### **UNSCHEDULED COMMUNICATION**

*Upon call, the following members of the public addressed Council: Steve Diddy (1-G), Debra Godbout (1-P), Dez, Brandi Nuse-Villegas (1-P), F. Elizando, Karla Martinez (1-B and 1-P), Joe Martinez (1-P), Shawn Anthony Horigan, Gloria Wyatt (1-P), Crystal, Shawn Lee Broyles Sr., Robert McCloskey, Kristin Pothier, Lisa Flores and Ruben Espinoza (1-P).*

### **CEREMONIAL PRESENTATIONS**

#### **Installation and Administration of Oaths of Office to Councilmembers-Elects & Statements by the Newly Sworn in Councilmembers**

[ID 23-02](#) Councilmember Annalisa Perea - District 1  
Oath Administered by Former Fresno County Supervisor Henry R. Perea

*OATH ADMINISTERED*

[ID 23-03](#) Councilmember Miguel Arias - District 3  
Oath Administered by Anaii Zamora-Arias and Diego Angel Zamora-Arias

*OATH ADMINISTERED*

[ID 23-04](#) Councilmember Luis Chavez - District 5  
Oath Administered by Pablo Villagrana

*OATH ADMINISTERED*

[ID 23-05](#) Councilmember Nelson Esparza - District 7  
Oath Administered by Sandra Garcia and Dania Michelle Esparza

*OATH ADMINISTERED*

[ID 23-06](#) Election of Chair and Vice Chair to the Successor Agency to the Redevelopment Agency of the City of Fresno

*Upon call, there was no public comment on the above item.*

*COUNCILMEMBER ARIAS ELECTED CHAIR*

*VICE PRESIDENT PEREA ELECTED VICE CHAIR*

**On motion of Councilmember Esparza, seconded by Councilmember Chavez, to elect Councilmember Arias as the Chair and Councilmember Perea as the Vice Char of the Successor Agency to the Redevelopment Agency of the City of Fresno. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Esparza, Maxwell, Perea, Karbassi, Arias, Chavez and Bredefeld

[ID 23-07](#) Election of Council President and Vice President

*Upon call, the following members of the public addressed Council: Lisa Flores, Sam Frank, Fernando Paul Elizando Sr., Dez Martinez, Reyna Rodriguez and Michelle.*

*VICE PRESIDENT MAXWELL ELECTED PRESIDENT*

*COUNCILMEMBER PEREA ELECTED VICE PRESIDENT*

**On motion of Councilmember Arias, seconded by Councilmember Esparza, to elect Councilmember Maxwell as President and Councilmember Perea as Vice President of the Council. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Esparza, Maxwell, Perea, Karbassi, Arias, Chavez and Bredefeld

[ID 23-08](#) Comments by Council President & Vice President

*There were no comments from the Council President or Vice President following the election. President Maxwell opened the floor to allow comments from all Councilmembers and from the administration.*

*Vice President Perea Comments. The Public Works Department has diligently responded to flooding issues in Council District 1. Council*

*District 1 partnered with Assembly Member Soria to provide approximately 100 toys to homeless and migrant youth in the Central Unified School District. The public is welcome to attend the ribbon cutting ceremony for Alchemist Coffee Lab in the Tower District on January 9, 2023.*

*City Manager White Comments. The administration distributed memos to the Council concerning: the status of electric vehicle chargers; the status of the long range planning for the Air National Guard base relocation; updates regarding Yosemite International Airport, and; operational and programming impacts at the community centers utilized as warming centers.*

#### **1:00 P.M. MEETING TO RESUME IN CHAMBERS**

*At 10:34 A.M., following the election of the Council President and Vice President, the meeting was recessed for lunch and resumed at 1:05 P.M.*

#### **CEREMONIAL PRESENTATIONS (CONTINUED)**

[ID 23-41](#) Proclamation for “Corin Hoggard Day”

*The above proclamation was tabled to the January 19, 2023, agenda by Councilmember Karbassi and Councilmember Arias.*

**TABLED**

#### **1. CONSENT CALENDAR**

##### **APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR**

**On motion of Councilmember Chavez, seconded by Councilmember Arias, the CONSENT CALENDAR was hereby adopted by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Esparza, Maxwell, Perea, Karbassi, Arias, Chavez and Bredefeld

**1.-A.** [ID 23-01](#) Approval of Minutes for December 15, 2022, Regular Meeting and December 22, 2022, Special Meeting.

##### **APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR**

**1.-B.** [ID 23-28](#) Actions related to the One Fresno Housing Strategy to address the production of new housing and leveraging adaptive reuse opportunities:

1. \*\*\*RESOLUTION - Adopting the 22nd Amendment to the Annual Appropriation Resolution (AAR) No. 2022-154 Appropriating

- \$175,000 for One Fresno Housing Strategy Related Activities (Requires 5 Affirmative Votes) (Subject to Mayor's Veto)
2. Affirm the City Manager's Finding that LeSar Support Services is Uniquely Qualified
  3. Approve a Consultant Agreement with LeSar Support Services for \$175,000 to Provide Consultant and Grant Writing Services

*RESOLUTION 2023-001 ADOPTED*

**APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR**

**1.-C.** [ID 23-10](#)

Actions pertaining to American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) funding to Community Based Organizations (CBOs)

1. Adopt a finding of Categorical Exemption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15301/Class 1 for to proposed project pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA)
2. Approve an agreement with Helping Others Pursue Excellence (HOPE) allocating \$500,000 in ARPA funding for small business assistance and to construct a commercial kitchen at an existing space on the Vision View campus.

**APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR**

**1.-E.** [ID 23-09](#)

\*\*\*RESOLUTION - Authorize the acceptance of 2021 Staffing for Adequate Fire and Emergency Response (SAFER) grant award for \$7,246,600 from the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) and authorize the Fire Chief to complete all required documents (Subject to Mayor's Veto)

*The above item was tabled to January 19, 2023, by staff.*

**TABLED**

**1.-F.** [ID 23-42](#)

Approve an agreement with DataProse, LLC., in the not-to-exceed amount of \$206,874.40 annually, plus annual CPI adjustments, for three years with three one-year optional extensions for the Finance Department's print and mail services for utilities, business tax, and animal license billings and authorize the City Controller/Finance Director to execute all related documents (Bid File 9641)

**APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR**

**1.-G.** [ID 23-48](#)

Approve the purchase of licensing for the Accela Cannabis Module for our on-premise Accela Civic Platform in the amount of \$20,000.

*Councilmember Karbassi and Councilmember Bredefeld each registered a "no" vote on the above item. As such, this item was APPROVED 5-2 by the following vote:*

*Aye (5): Arias, Chavez, Esparza, Perea, Maxwell*

*No (2): Karbassi, Bredefeld*

**APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR**

- 1.-H. [ID 23-32](#) \*\*\*RESOLUTION - Adopt the 8th Amendment to the FY 2023 Salary Resolution No. 2022-152, amending Exhibit 2, Unit 2, Non-Represented Management and Confidential Classes to decrease the E13 minimum salary range from \$9,766 to \$9,092 per month for the affected classification of Project Liaison/Program Administrator, effective January 2, 2023 (Subject to Mayor's Veto)

*RESOLUTION 2023-003 ADOPTED*

**APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR**

- 1.-J. [ID 23-11](#) Approve the Fourth Amendment to the professional consultant services agreement with Carollo Engineers, Inc., to expand the scope of services and increase the contract amount by \$111,810 for a total fee not to exceed \$1,101,141 (Council District 3).

**APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR**

- 1.-K. [ID 23-12](#) Actions pertaining to Reclamation Well Power Poles Replacement (Bid File 12300454) (Council District 3):
1. Adopt a finding of Categorical Exemption per staff determination pursuant to Class 1, Section 15301(b)&(d) (Existing Facilities) and Section 15302(c) (Replacement or Reconstruction) of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines; and
  2. Award a construction contract to A-C Electric Company, in the amount of \$176,700.00.

**APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR**

- 1.-L. [ID 23-13](#) Approve consultant services agreement with Electrical Power Systems, Inc., for an amount not to exceed \$87,362, to provide a required Arc Flash Review and Update Study at the Fresno-Clovis Regional Wastewater Reclamation Facility. (Council District 3)

**APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR**

- 1.-M. [ID 23-26](#) Actions pertaining to roof repairs at the Department of Public Utilities Operations & Maintenance Facility located at 1626 E Street, Fresno, California ( Bid File 12300671) (Council District 3):
1. Adopt a finding of Categorical Exemption per staff determination pursuant to Section 15302/Class 1 of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines

2. Award a contract in the amount of \$248,315.43 to Nations Roof West, LLC of Fresno, California

### APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR

- 1.-N. [ID 23-30](#) Actions pertaining to the submission of grant applications for the California Department of Water Resources 2022 Urban Community Drought Relief Program:
1. \*\*\*RESOLUTION - Authorizing the submission of a 2022 Urban Community Drought Relief Grant Program grant application to the California Department of Water Resources for the Critical Wells for Drought Relief Project, and authorizing the Director of Public Utilities or designee to accept grant funds and execute all application and grant agreement documents on behalf of the City of Fresno (Council Districts 5, 6, and 7) (Subject to Mayor's Veto)
  2. \*\*\*RESOLUTION - Authorizing the submission of a 2022 Urban Community Drought Relief Grant Program grant application to the California Department of Water Resources for the Leaky Acres Groundwater Recharge Improvements Project, and authorizing the Director of Public Utilities or designee to accept grant funds and execute all application and grant agreement documents on behalf of the City of Fresno (Council District 4) (Subject to Mayor's Veto)

*RESOLUTION 2023-005 ADOPTED*

*RESOLUTION 2023-006 ADOPTED*

### APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR

- 1.-O. [ID 23-14](#) \*\*\*RESOLUTION - Authorize acceptance of funding in the amount of \$100,000 from the Pacific Gas and Electric (PG&E) Foundation Better Together Nature Positive Program, approving the associated Community College Rides Free project, and authorizing execution of grant documents. (Subject to Mayor's veto)

*RESOLUTION 2023-007 ADOPTED*

### APPROVED ON CONSENT CALENDAR

## CONTESTED CONSENT

- 1.-D. [ID 23-27](#) \*\*\*RESOLUTION - Approving the payoff of the Roeding Business Park Loan in the amount of \$1,220,801.51 between the City of Fresno and the California Infrastructure and Economic Development Bank (Subject to Mayor's Veto.)

*Councilmember Arias moved this item to the Contested Consent Calendar so the public and Council could fully understand what this item would do, if approved.*



*Council discussion on this item included: which funds would be used to pay off the loan; concerns about approving the payoff before mid-year budgets have been calculated; the ability to pay off the loan with salary savings from the General Fund as opposed to General Fund dollars appropriated for the Animal Shelter; providing consultant projections for sales tax to the Council;*

*Councilmember Arias motioned to approve the item with an amendment to utilize General Fund salary savings instead of Animal Shelter appropriations. The motion also included direction that staff not bring forward any new expenditures, that would spend mid year budgets, until after presentation of the mid-year budget to Council.*

**RESOLUTION 2023-002 ADOPTED AS AMENDED**

**On motion of Councilmember Arias, seconded by Councilmember Chavez, that the above Action Item be ADOPTED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Esparza, Maxwell, Perea, Karbassi, Arias, Chavez and Bredefeld

- 1.-I. [ID 23-15](#) Actions pertaining to the summary vacation of a portion of the southeast corner of North Parkway Drive and West Shields Avenue; a portion of North Parkway Drive, north of West Weldon Avenue; and a portion of North Marks Avenue, north of the Marks-Shields Connector (Council District 3)
1. Adopt finding of Categorical Exemption per staff determination, pursuant to Sections 15301/Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and 15305/Class 5 (Minor Alteration in Land Use Limitations) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines, Environmental Assessment Number PW00663-SR99-01 for the Southeast corner of North Parkway Drive and West Shields Avenue
  2. Adopt findings of Categorical Exemption per staff determinations, pursuant to Sections 15301/Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and 15305/Class 5 (Minor Alteration in Land Use Limitations) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines, Environmental Assessment Number PW00663-SR99-02 for a portion of North Parkway Drive, north of West Weldon Avenue
  3. Adopt findings of Categorical Exemption per staff determinations, pursuant to Sections 15301/Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and 15305/Class 5 (Minor Alteration in Land Use Limitations) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines, Environmental Assessment Number PW00663-SR99-03 for a

portion of North Marks Avenue, north of the Marks-Shields Connector

4. \*\*\*RESOLUTION - Ordering the summary vacation of a portion of the Southeast corner of North Parkway Drive and West Shields Avenue; a portion of North Parkway Drive, north of West Weldon Avenue; and a portion of North Marks Avenue, north of the Marks-Shields Connector (Subject to Mayor's Veto)

*Councilmember Arias moved this item to the Contested Consent Calendar to clarify that, due to the lack of pedestrian facilities, he would not support future development of shelters that would place children and families in the subject area.*

**RESOLUTION 2023-004 ADOPTED**

**On motion of Councilmember Arias, seconded by Vice President Perea, that the above Action Item be APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Esparza, Maxwell, Perea, Karbassi, Arias, Chavez and Bredefeld

- 1.-P. [ID 23-57](#) Declaring local state of emergency to address affordable housing and homelessness.

*Councilmember Chavez moved this item to the Contested Consent Calendar to gauge the interest and the will of Council to move forward with prioritizing policies to assist with the homelessness crisis.*

*In response to a questions, City Attorney Janz clarified that, at this stage, declaring an emergency would not be defensible and would not be binding upon the administration for a number of reasons mostly based on state law. He stated the recommended method to address the situation would be to declare a shelter crisis by resolution.*

*Council discussion on this item included: creating a process to legalize "mother-in-law units" that meet health and safety standards; creating a pre-approval model for new construction of affordable housing; the market forces and political decisions that have contributed to the homelessness and affordable housing problems; the possibility of utilizing the Convention Center to ease the crisis and the potential complications with that option; the benefits of adding ministerial approvals for affordable housing projects;*

*the possibility of preventing expiration of planning entitlements such as tentative maps; the status of the pending RFP for the Selland Arena and Convention Center; the lack of information the administration and others received about this agenda item prior to the meeting and the frustrations it created, and; the actions that can be taken under a shelter crisis.*

*Councilmember Arias requested a memo detailing the steps that must be taken to terminate any contracts for the use of the Convention Center and Selland Arena if they were to be used to address the homelessness issue.*

*No action was taken on this item.*

*DISCUSSED*

## **2. SCHEDULED COUNCIL HEARINGS AND MATTERS**

*There were no Scheduled Council Hearings and Matters on the agenda.*

## **3. GENERAL ADMINISTRATION**

*There were no General Administration items on the agenda.*

## **4. CITY COUNCIL**

- 4.-A.** [ID 23-25](#) RESOLUTION of the City of Fresno, California Honoring Fresno State Athletics and Urging Admission to a Power Five Conference.

*The above item was introduced to Council by Council President Maxwell. Mayor Dyer and President Jiménez-Sandoval of California State University, Fresno, also spoke on this item.*

*RESOLUTION 2023-008 ADOPTED*

**On motion of Council President Maxwell, seconded by Councilmember Karbassi, that the above Action Item be ADOPTED.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Esparza, Maxwell, Perea, Karbassi, Arias, Chavez and Bredefeld

## **5. CLOSED SESSION**

*During open session, City Attorney Janz announced the items that would be discussed in closed session. Councilmember Bredefeld and*

*Councilmember Esparza each announced a conflict and recusal from closed session item 5-E (ID 23-43).*

*Council withdrew from open session to hear closed session items at 3:45 P.M.*

- 5.-A.** [ID 23-17](#) CONFERENCE WITH LABOR NEGOTIATORS - Government Code Section 54957.6  
City Negotiators: TJ Miller  
Employee Organizations:
1. International Union of Operating Engineers, Stationary Engineers, Local 39 (Local 39);
  2. Fresno City Employees Association (FCEA);
  3. Fresno Police Officers Association (FPOA Basic), Unit 4;
  4. International Association of Firefighters, Local 753, Unit 5 (Fire Basic);
  5. Amalgamated Transit Union, Local 1027 (ATU);
  6. International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 100 (IBEW);
  7. Fresno Police Officers Association (FPOA Management);
  8. International Association of Firefighters, Local 753, Unit 10 (Fire Management);
  9. City of Fresno Professional Employees Association (CFPEA);
  10. City of Fresno Management Employees Association (CFMEA);
  11. Operating Engineers, Local Union No. 3, Fresno Airport Public Safety Supervisors (FAPSS);
  12. Operating Engineers, Local Union No. 3, Fresno Airport Public Safety Officers (FAPSO);
  13. Unrepresented Employees in Unit 2 (Non-Represented Management and Confidential Classes): Airport Public Safety Manager, Assistant City Attorney, Assistant City Manager, Assistant Controller, Assistant Director, Assistant Director of Personnel Services, Assistant Director of Public Utilities, Assistant Director of Public Works, Assistant Police Chief, Assistant Retirement Administrator, Background Investigator, Budget Analyst, Budget Manager, Chief Assistant City Attorney, Chief Information Officer, Chief Labor Negotiator, Chief of Staff to Councilmember, Chief of Staff to the Mayor, City Attorney (City Negotiator, Council President Esparza), City Attorney Investigator, City Clerk (City Negotiator, Council President Esparza), City Engineer, City Manager (City Negotiator, Mayor Dyer), Community Coordinator, Community Outreach Specialist, Controller, Council Assistant, Deputy City Attorney II , Deputy City Attorney III, Deputy City Manager, Director, Director of Aviation, Director of Development, Director of Personnel Services, Director of Public Utilities, Director of Transportation, Economic Development Coordinator, Economic Development Director , Executive Assistant to Department Director, Executive Assistant to the City Attorney, Executive Assistant to the City Manager, Executive Assistant to the Mayor, Fire Chief, Governmental Affairs Manager, Human Resources Manager, Independent Reviewer, Internal Auditor, Investment Officer, Management Analyst II, Payroll Accountant, Payroll Manager, Police Chief, Principal Budget

Analyst, Principal Internal Auditor, Principal Labor Relations Analyst, Project Liaison/Program Administrator, Public Affairs Officer, Public Works Director, Retirement Administrator, Retirement Benefits Manager, Retirement Office Manager, Senior Budget Analyst, Senior Deputy City Attorney I, Senior Deputy City Attorney II, Senior Deputy City Attorney III, Senior Human Resources/Risk Analyst, Senior Law Clerk, Supervising Deputy City Attorney

*The above item was discussed in closed session. There were no open session announcements regarding this item.*

DISCUSSED

5.-B. [ID 23-44](#)

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - POTENTIAL LITIGATION  
Government Code Section 54956.9, subdivision (d)(2);

Case Name(s): Adventure Church, Inc. v. City of Fresno; Terance Frazier; Fresno Superior Court Case No. 22CECG04022

*The above item was discussed in closed session. There were no open session announcements regarding this item.*

DISCUSSED

5.-C. [ID 23-45](#)

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - POTENTIAL LITIGATION  
Government Code Section 54956.9, subdivision (d)(2);

Case Name(s): PW Fund B, LP; Span Development, LLC; Robin W. Martella Trust v. City of Fresno

*The above item was discussed in closed session. There were no open session announcements regarding this item.*

DISCUSSED

5.-D. [ID 23-46](#)

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - PUBLIC SECURITY -  
Government Code Section 54957(a): Discuss security of City Hall.

*The above item was discussed in closed session. There were no open session announcements regarding this item.*

DISCUSSED

5.-E. [ID 23-43](#)

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL-EXISTING LITIGATION  
Government Code Section 54956.9, subdivision (d)(1)

Case Name: *Nelson Esparza v. Garry Bredefeld*; Fresno Superior Court  
Case No. 22CECG01469

*The above item was discussed in closed session. Councilmember Esparza and Councilmember Bredefeld were recused from this item and were not present for the discussion. There were no open session announcements regarding this item.*

*DISCUSSED*

**ADJOURNMENT**

*Adjourned from closed session at 4:30 P.M. in the memory of Mr. Donal Lacy Gregory.*

**The above minutes were approved by unanimous vote of the City Council during the January 19, 2023, regular meeting with Councilmember Karbassi absent.**