

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

Page 1

**FOR: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS REQUIREMENTS CONTRACT LOGGING SERVICES FOR
CAMP FRESNO & CAMP FRESNO JUNIOR**

RFP No. 12301339

RFP Opening: 04/11/2023

PROPOSERS

(In alphabetical order)

TOTAL PROPOSAL AMOUNT

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Arbor Pros, LLC
1350 Stardust St
Reno, Nevada 89503 | \$1,307,650.00
Last, Best, Final \$149,130.00 |
| 2. Fleming And Sons, LLC
37370 Auberry Rd
Auberry, California 93602 | \$654,200.00
Last, Best, Final \$196,325.00 |
| 3. P31 Enterprises, Inc.
2015 Challenger Ave, Suite A
Oroville, California 95965 | \$1,609,178.26
Last, Best, Final \$281,731.67 |
| 4. San Joaquin Forest Products
Po Box 215
Prather, California 93651 | \$1,672,550.00
Last, Best, Final \$278,075.00 |

Each proposer has agreed to allow the City one hundred twenty (120) days from date proposals were opened to accept or reject their proposal.

DEPARTMENT CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION:

☒ Award a contract in the amount of \$ 149,130.00
to Arbors Pros, LLC

in accordance with the Selection Committee recommendation.

☐ Reject all proposals. Reason:

Remarks:

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

Page 2

**FOR: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS REQUIREMENTS CONTRACT LOGGING SERVICES FOR
CAMP FRESNO & CAMP FRESNO JUNIOR**

RFP No. 12301339

RFP Opening: 04/11/2023

Department Head Approval



Title Director

Date 9.11.2023

☒ Approve Dept. Recommendation

☐ Disapprove

☐ See Attachment

☒ Approve GSD/Purchasing Recommendation


☐ Disapprove

GENERAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

CITY MANAGER


Purchasing Manager 09/12/2023
Date


City Manager or Designee 9/12/23
Date


Brian Barr (Sep 12, 2023 14:03 PDT)
General Services Director Sep 12, 2023
Date

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
CITY OF FRESNO REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
LOGGING SERVICES FOR CAMP FRESNO RFP
NO. 12301339
(Committee Meetings held on 04-14-2023 and 08-10-2023)**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Brendon Mills – Parks Supervisor II
- Lawrence Garabedian – Division Manager
- Mike Carbajal – Operation Manager – PARCS
- Shelby Macnab – Business Manager – PARCS

FACILITATOR:

- Sherri Cuadros – Procurement Specialist – GSD
- Tamra Torrence - Senior Procurement Specialist – GSD

BACKGROUND

On March 14, 2023, the City of Fresno Department of Parks, After-School, Recreation and Community Services (PARCS) solicited proposals to provide logging services for Camp Fresno and Camp Fresno Junior sites. The trees have been identified by the U.S. Forest Service for removal. The logging services to be performed are hazard tree felling, logs and tree removal, stump grinding, slash treatment, site restoration, and traffic control.

On March 29, 2023, at 11:00 a.m., the City held a virtual prospective bidders conference with the option to call-in. Prospective proposers were encouraged to attend since City Staff were present to answer any questions regarding the Specifications.

On April 11, 2023, proposals were due electronically via Planet Bids and publicly opened and recorded. The City received four responses:

1. Arbor Pros, LLC
2. Flemmings and Sons LLC
3. P31-Enterprises, Inc.
4. San Joaquin Forest Products LLC

On April 14, 2023, a Committee Review was conducted that evaluated the four responses. The Committee Review concluded in a request that all four vendors resubmit their pricing information.

On July 26, 2023, the City sent out a notice requesting for last, best and final proposals due no later than 5:00pm, August 7, 2023.

On August 10, 2023, a Review Committee met to evaluate the last, best and final responses. Three of four committee members were present. The Committee recommended Arbor Pros LLC to be selected for the logging services.

SIGNIFICANT EVENTS:

RFP Release – March 17, 2023
Bidders Conference – March 29, 2023
RFP Opening – April 11, 2023
Committee Review – April 14, 2023
Committee Meeting – August 11, 2023

EVALUATION CRITERIA:

1. Cost as shown on the proposal form.
2. Ability to meet the stated service requirements.
3. Past Performance and Experience based on References and experience shown on "Statement of Qualifications and Experience."
4. Conformance to the terms and conditions of the RFP.
5. Financial Stability based on information provided in the Statement of Qualifications
6. Other related information.

COMMITTEE NOTES:

Arbor Pros LLC – This company is based out of Reno-Tahoe and specializes in residential/commercial tree services. The owner and operator has two certifications, ISA Certified Arborist and WE-12235A. The proposal demonstrated the ability to complete the service requirements and the last, best and final proposal was the lowest cost.

Fleming and Sons LLC – This company is based out of Auberry, CA. This company is a tree service company operating as a tree service entity with a focus on activities including logging, hazard tree removal, tree trimming, fuels reduction, site clearing, and site restoration specializing in logging, hazard tree removal, tree trimming, fuel reduction and more. Fleming and Sons LLC has experience in working with the City of Fresno with Camp Fresno from 2019 to present. The proposal demonstrated relevant experience, though the cost was slightly higher than low-bidder.

P31 Enterprises, Inc – This company is based out of Oroville, CA. This company demonstrated a full range of tree services. Proposed services exceeded the available budget.

San Joaquin Forest Products LLC – This company is based out of Prather, CA and specialized in California logging, habitat restoration and forest product harvesting. The proposal demonstrated relevant experience and abilities, but was the highest cost submitted. Proposed costs for services exceeded the available budget.

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION:

Based upon the proposal responses and the committee review and analysis the committee recommends the requirements contract to be awarded to Arbor Pros LLC.