



FINANCE DEPARTMENT

DATE: November 13, 2014

TO: SCOTT KRAUTER, Assistant Director of Public Works, City of Fresno, Public Works/Median Islands

FROM: BOB CALLISTRO, ^{BC}Supervising Buyer
Purchasing Division

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR WEEKLY LANDSCAPE MAINTENANCE SERVICES NO. 9273

Proposals for the above project were opened and recorded on August 26, 2014, should now be evaluated by your Department as part of the selection committee. Attached is an Evaluation of Proposals form which you are requested to complete and return to the Purchasing Division once the Selection Committee Report is finalized.

As background for your evaluation, we are enclosing a copy of canvas of proposal and copies of proposals of all proposals received. Please review the attached proposal and determine whether or not the sole proposer is responsible and is responsive to the intent of the specifications. Where applicable, note asterisk references on the attached Evaluation. If there are any questions, contact Purchasing Division immediately. DO NOT CONTACT ANY OF THE PROPOSERS.

Then complete the Evaluation of Proposals form following this checklist:

- Background section. Describe the reason for the project and include pertinent facts that would be informative to the City Council.
- Recommendation Section. Complete after the selection committee has determined the proposer that can provide best value in meeting the interest of the City and the objectives of the project.
- Signature of Department Head or Assistant Department Head.

The completed Evaluation of Proposals form should be returned to the Purchasing Division as soon as the committee report has been finalized, so we can obtain the City Manager's approval of your determination and post that determination no less than twenty-three (23) working days in advance of the date your department presents your staff report to the City Council.

BC/dr
Attachments



FINANCE DEPARTMENT

DATE: November 13, 2014

TO: SCOTT KRAUTER, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS, CITY OF
FRESNO, PUBLIC WORKS/MEDIAN ISLANDS

FROM: BOB CALLISTRO, ^{BC}Supervising Buyer
Purchasing Division

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR WEEKLY LANDSCAPE
MAINTENANCE SERVICES
PROPOSAL NO. 9273

Please add the following information to your Agenda Item:

Advertisement date of the project in Business Journal	7/21/14
Number of Building Exchanges received Fax Notice Inviting Proposals	<u>15</u>
Number of specs distributed to prospective proposers	<u>34</u>
Date of public proposal opening	<u>8/26/14</u>
Proposals will expire within 120 days of proposal opening:	<u>12/24/14</u>
Number of proposals received	<u>7</u>

Also, any issues will be noted below such as local preference, award issues, etc.

Reminder: Please email your draft Agenda Item to your buyer and the Purchasing Manager in Purchasing for review

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
WEEKLY LANDSCAPE MAINTENANCE SERVICES - RFP NO. 9273**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Diana Reynolds, Buyer II/Facilitator, City of Fresno, Finance Department– Purchasing
- Scott Krauter, Assistant Director of Public Works, Public works/Street Maintenance
- Aaron Aguirre, Public Works Manager, Public Works/Street Maintenance
- Martin Wendels , Project Manager, City of Fresno, Department of Public Utilities
- Ron Ames, Airports Operations Manager, City of Fresno, Airports Department
- Dave Furtado, Maintenance Supervisor, City of Fresno, Waste Water Treatment Plant
- Rene Watahira, Administrative Manager, Police Department

BACKGROUND

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals to provide professional weekly landscape maintenance services. The operator will be responsible for maintaining various areas through the City of Fresno on a weekly basis.

Proposals were submitted by the seven vendors according to the Request for Proposal August 26, 2014 deadline. Below is a summary of Proposals submitted by the seven vendors:

Vendor	\$ Proposal
Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc.	\$949, 846.04
All Commercial Landscape Service	\$1,265,732.00
Jakusz	\$1,007,344.00
Lincoln Training Center	\$6,874,837.84
Evergreen	\$1,013,340.64
Fresno Econmic Opportunities	\$2,476,686.68
Mow-N-Edge Corp.	non-responsive

COMMITTEE NOTES

Evaluation committee members were in agreement that all six proposers are capable of providing the City of Fresno with professional landscape services. Therefore, the selection was based on the differences in the vendors' written proposals, and site visits.

In the first committee meeting Lincoln Training Center, FEOC, Evergreen and Mow-N-Edge were eliminated. Lincoln Training Center submitted the highest proposal. FEOC currently maintains a majority of the areas in this RFP, their proposal was found to be cost prohibitive as well. The committee

felt that Evergreen's proposal was weak; they did not include a list of equipment or an organizational chart. Mow-N-Edge turned in a proposal that was non-responsive; they did not include Addendum 4 which changed the whole bid proposal page. The committee narrowed down their selection to three viable candidates: All Commercial Landscape Services, Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. and Jakusz based on their submitted proposals.

The three remaining proposers were asked to submit a list of locations that they currently service for the committee's inspection. The locations that were selected for inspection were sites that were comparable to the City of Fresno's sites that are listed in this RFP. A visiting team then went out to view the properties and take pictures that were later presented to the committee.

After the site visits and references were called, the evaluation committee met and reviewed the findings. Jakusz was eliminated; their financials were questionable; the committee didn't feel secure that Jakusz would be able to meet an increased work load. Pictures were presented from each of the final three proposer's work sites and discussed. Each member agreed that based on the site visits, pictures and submitted proposals, All Commercial Landscape Service and Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. will provide the best value for the City of Fresno. The award will be split by quadrants with Elite being awarded the Northwest Quadrant and All Commercial Landscape Service the rest of the quadrants.

ALL COMMERCIAL LANDSCAPE SERVICE

The committee unanimously agreed that All Commercial Landscape Service will provide the best value to service the needs of the City of Fresno's landscape sites professionally for the Northeast, Southeast, and Downtown quadrants. This was reflected in their proposal, subsequent site visits, photos presented and references which focused on meeting each of the Weekly Landscape Maintenance Services RFP criteria for both commercial and roadside landscapes. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

ELITE MAINTENANCE & TREE SERVICE INC.

The committee also unanimously agreed that Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. will provide the best value to service the needs of the City of Fresno's landscape sites professionally for the northwest quadrant. This was reflected in their proposal, subsequent site visits and photos which focused on meeting each of the Weekly Landscape Maintenance Services RFP criteria for primarily roadside landscapes. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

JAKUSZ

Jakusz has a lot of municipal experience but were eliminated at the second committee meeting. Their proposal was missing an organizational chart and list of equipment. Site visits were made and the results were not that of the City of Fresno standards. Some of the sites had weeds throughout the flower beds, uneven edging and trees that needed trimming. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

LINCOLN TRAINING CENTER AND REHABILITATION WORKSHOP

Lincoln Training Center is headquartered in South El Monte, California. They have 19 years of experience in landscaping including experience in janitorial services. Their proposal had a great landscape maintenance service plan but most of their experience seems to be in the janitorial area. They didn't appear to have the ability to meet the demands required of the City of Fresno even though their proposal reflects that they met the RFP criteria. They submitted the highest cost proposal for this RFP.

EVERGREEN

Evergreen was eliminated at the first committee meeting. Their proposal lacked detail and was missing an organizational chart and list of equipment. Their cost proposal and spreadsheet were thousands of dollars apart. This made it difficult to pass them through to the next round.

FRESNO ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES COMMISSION

The FEOC has provided the City of Fresno with landscape maintenance service for 10+ years with their Local Conservation Corps (LCC) work crews. The committee felt that although the FEOC would definitely be able to perform the requirements of this RFP satisfactorily, their pricing was relatively high. The City of Fresno has had issues in the past with their work crews dealing with the general public, which was reported to the FEOC. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

MOW-N-EDGE

Mow-N-Edge was found to be non-responsive because they failed to include Addendum 4 with their proposal. This changed the entire bid proposal page which made their proposal incomplete. Their submittal could not be evaluated.

RECOMMENDATION:

The committee unanimously agrees and reconfirms their findings that All Commercial Landscape Service and Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. will be able to provide the most effective and efficient professional Weekly Landscape Maintenance Services as well as the best value based on their proposal and site visits. Therefore, the committee recommends that All Commercial Landscape Services and Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. be awarded the Weekly Landscape Maintenance Services contract with Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. maintaining the Northwest quadrant and All Commercial Landscape Service maintaining the remaining quadrants.