

# City of Fresno

*City Hall Council Chambers  
2600 Fresno Street*



## **Meeting Minutes - Draft**

**Wednesday, February 21, 2024**

**6:00 PM**

**Regular Meeting**

**In Person and/or Electronic  
City Hall Council Chambers**

## **Planning Commission**

***Chairperson – Peter Vang***

***Vice Chair – Brad Hardie***

***Commissioner – David Criner***

***Commissioner – Haley M Wagner***

***Commissioner – Kathy Bray***

***Commissioner – Monica Diaz***

***Commissioner – Jacqueline Lyday***

**THE PLANNING COMMISSION WELCOMES YOU TO COUNCIL CHAMBERS,  
LOCATED AT CITY HALL, 2600 FRESNO STREET, FRESNO, CALIFORNIA 93721.**

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION – Any interested person may appear at the public hearing and present written testimony or speak in favor or against the matters scheduled on the agenda. Public participation during Fresno City Planning Commission meetings is always encouraged and can occur in one of the two following ways:**

- 1. Participate In Person: Council Chambers, City Hall, 2nd Floor, 2600 Fresno Street, Fresno, CA 93721**
  - a. To speak during a Commission meeting in person: You may approach the speaker podium upon the Chair’s call for public comment.**
- 2. Participate Remotely via Zoom:**  
**[https://zoom.us/webinar/register/WN\\_I18M0bh8TbSGAo27i5ze1Q](https://zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_I18M0bh8TbSGAo27i5ze1Q)**
  - a. The above link will allow you to register in advance for remote participation in the meeting via the Zoom platform. After registering, you will receive a confirmation email containing additional details about joining the meeting.**
  - b. To speak during a Commission meeting while attending remotely in the Zoom application, click on the icon labeled “Participants” at the bottom of the screen. Then select “Raise Hand” at the bottom of the Participants window. Your digital hand will now be raised. You will be asked to “unmute” when your name is called to speak. You will not be visible via video and there will be no opportunity to share your screen.**

**All public speakers will have up to 3 minutes to address the Commission pursuant to Rule No. 13 of the Planning Commission Bylaws of the City of Fresno (available in the City Clerk’s Office).**

**SUBMIT DOCUMENTS / WRITTEN COMMENTS –**

- 1. E-mail – Agenda related documents and comments can be e-mailed to [PublicCommentsPlanning@fresno.gov](mailto:PublicCommentsPlanning@fresno.gov). Unless otherwise required by law to be accepted by the City at or prior to a Commission meeting or hearing, no documents shall be accepted for Commission review unless they are submitted to the Planning and Development Department at least 24 hours prior to the commencement of the Commission meeting at which the associated agenda item is to be heard.**
  - a. Attendees may also email comments to be read during the meeting. Please include the agenda date and item number you wish to speak on in the subject line of your email. Include your name and address for the record, at the top of the body of your email.**
  - b. Emails will be a maximum of 450 words.**
  - c. All comments received at least 24 hours prior will be distributed to the Planning Commission prior and during the meeting and will be a part of the**

official record.

**VIEWING PLANNING MEETINGS (non-participatory) – For your convenience, there are ways to view Planning Commission meetings live:**

- 1. Community Media Access Collaborative website: <https://cmac.tv/>**
- 2. Cable Television: Comcast Channel 96 and AT&T Channel 99**

**Should any of these viewing methods listed above experience technical difficulties, the Commission meeting will continue uninterrupted. Commission meetings will only be paused to address verifiable technical difficulties for all users participating via Zoom or in the Chambers.**

**The City of Fresno’s goal is to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Anyone requiring reasonable ADA accommodations, including sign language interpreters, or other reasonable accommodations such as language translation, should contact the office of the City Clerk at (559) 621-7650 or [clerk@fresno.gov](mailto:clerk@fresno.gov). To help ensure availability of these services, you are advised to make your request a minimum of 48 hours prior to the scheduled meeting.**

**I. ROLL CALL**

*Chair Vang called the meeting to order at 6:02 p.m.*

*Also present were Jennifer Clark, Phillip Siegrist, Israel Trejo, Rob Holt, Saul Perez, Steven Martinez, Janice Monroe, Kari Camino, Kristi Costa (CAO), Heather Thomas (CAO), Scott Mozier (DPW), Harmanjit Dhaliwal (DPW), & Dejan Pavic (DPU).*

*Chair Vang noted that all votes would be Roll Call Vote due to Commissioner Bray attending remotely using the "Just Cause" reasoning.*

- Present** 5 - Chairperson Peter Vang, Vice Chair Brad Hardie, Commissioner Kathy Bray, Commissioner Monica Diaz, and Commissioner Jacqueline G. Lyday
- Absent** 2 - Commissioner David Criner , and Commissioner Haley M. Wagner

**II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

*6:02 p.m.*

**III. PROCEDURES - PROCEDIMIENTOS - KEV SAB LAJ**

*6:03 p.m.*

*Chair Vang read procedures aloud.*

**IV. AGENDA APPROVAL**

*6:04 p.m.*

*Trejo reported no changes to the agenda.*

*Clark requested Commissioner Bray keep her camera on during the duration of the meeting. Due to technical difficulties, Bray logged out of the meeting and returned at 6:07 p.m.*

**On motion of Commissioner Diaz, seconded by Commissioner Lyday, the above AGENDA was APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairperson Vang, Vice Chair Hardie, Commissioner Bray, Commissioner Diaz, and Commissioner Lyday

**Absent:** 2 - Commissioner Criner , and Commissioner Wagner

**V. CONSENT CALENDAR**

N/A

**VI. REPORTS BY COMMISSIONERS**

6:07 p.m.

*None (Bray was not present for this item).*

**VII. CONTINUED MATTERS**

N/A

**VIII. NEW MATTERS**

**VIII-A** [ID 24-233](#) Hearing to consider Text Amendment Application No. P23-03987 and related Environmental Finding:

1. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of the Finding of No Possibility of Significant Adverse Effect as prepared for Environmental Assessment No. P23-03987 dated December 27, 2023.
2. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Text Amendment Application No. P23-03987 amending Section 4304 of Chapter 15 of the Fresno Municipal Code relating to the language of the required findings for subdivision map revisions.

6:07 p.m.

*Robert Holt (Planner) made a presentation on the background of the Text Amendment and the importance of revising Fresno Municipal Code 15-4304.A. He talked about outreach to the Council District Committees, language changes and Staff's recommendations.*

*No public comment was provided.*

**On motion of Vice Chair Hardie, seconded by Commissioner Diaz, that**

the above Action Item be **APPROVED**. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 5 - Chairperson Vang, Vice Chair Hardie, Commissioner Bray, Commissioner Diaz, and Commissioner Lyday

**Absent:** 2 - Commissioner Criner , and Commissioner Wagner

**VIII-B** [ID 24-211](#)

Consideration of Rezone Application No. P23-03475, Development Permit Application No. P23-00186, and related Environmental Assessment No. P23-03475/P23-00186, pertaining to approximately 1.96 acres of property located on the north side of East Gettysburg Avenue between North First and North Second Streets (Council District 4) - Planning and Development Department.

1. **RECOMMEND ADOPTION** (to the City Council) of Environmental Assessment No. P23-03475/P23-00186, dated January 26, 2024, a Mitigated Negative Declaration for the proposed project pursuant to California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines; and,
2. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Rezone Application No. P23-03475, requesting authorization to rezone the subject property from the *O/CZ (Office/conditions of zoning)* zone district to the *O (Office)* zone district in order to remove conditions of zoning tied to the approximately 1.96 acres of property located at 3147 East Gettysburg Avenue; and
3. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Development Permit Application No. P23-00186, requesting authorization to construct an approximately 11,360 square foot medical office (clinic) building and one pad for a future 5,010 square foot future medical office (clinic) building on the subject property, subject to compliance with the Conditions of Approval dated February 21, 2024.

6:12 p.m.

*Holt made a presentation explaining the proposed project, showing the location, conditions of zoning, results of outreach and Staff's recommendations.*

*Brian Pope (Applicant) talked about the history of the application, the traffic impact, and the parking layout.*

*Diaz asked for clarification on the type of medical office and the business*

hours.

*Public comment:*

*One person spoke in favor, noting the community's need for this type of facility.*

*No one spoke in opposition.*

**On motion of Commissioner Bray, seconded by Commissioner Diaz, that the above Action Item be APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairperson Vang, Vice Chair Hardie, Commissioner Bray, Commissioner Diaz, and Commissioner Lyday

**Absent:** 2 - Commissioner Criner , and Commissioner Wagner

**VIII-C** [ID 24-234](#) Hearing to Consider Plan Amendment-Rezone Application No. P19-05889, Development Permit Application No. P20-01559, and related Environmental Assessment No. P19-05889/P20-01559 pertaining to approximately 4.83 acres of property located on the northwest corner of East Tulare Street and North Helm Avenue (Council District 7) - Planning & Development Department.

1. **RECOMMEND ADOPTION** (to the City Council) of the Mitigated Negative Declaration as prepared for Environmental Assessment No. P20-01559/P19-05889, dated February 5, 2024, for the proposed project pursuant to the State of California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA); and,
2. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Plan Amendment Application No. P19-05889, requesting authorization to amend the Fresno General Plan and Roosevelt Community Plan to change the planned land use designation for the subject property from Medium Low Density Residential to Urban Neighborhood; and
3. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Rezone Application No. P19-05889, requesting authorization to amend the Official Zoning Map of the City of Fresno to rezone the subject property from the RS-4 (*Residential Single-Family, Medium Low Density*) zone district to RM-2 (*Residential Multi-Family, Urban Neighborhood*) zone district in accordance with the Plan Amendment Application; and

- 4. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Development Permit Application No. P20-01559, requesting authorization to construct a multi-unit housing development comprised of 112 affordable dwelling units for seniors.

6:23 p.m.

*Holt made a presentation covering the location, General Plan map, the development proposal, neighborhood outreach and Staff's recommendations.*

*Tommy Meza (Applicant) was available for comments and questions.*

*The Commission discussed with Meza details of affordable housing thresholds, selection process, and the funding of the project.*

*Public Comment:*

*One person spoke in favor of the project, encouraging the potential of job opportunities for local workers.*

*No one spoke in opposition.*

*Diaz confirmed with Meza that the Non-Profit would continue to hold the title.*

**On motion of Chairperson Vang, seconded by Commissioner Diaz, that the above Action Item be APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairperson Vang, Vice Chair Hardie, Commissioner Bray, Commissioner Diaz, and Commissioner Lyday

**Absent:** 2 - Commissioner Criner , and Commissioner Wagner

**VIII-D** [ID 24-244](#)

HEARING to Consider Plan Amendment and Rezone Application No. P21-01960, Conditional Use Permit Application No. P21-01959, Conditional Use Permit Application No. P21-03251, Planned Development Permit Application No. P21-03252 and related Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR), State Clearinghouse (SCH) No. 2021100443 pertaining to ±22.4 acres of property located on the northeast corner of West Herndon Avenue and North Riverside Drive (Council District 2) - Planning &

Development Department.

1. **RECOMMEND CERTIFICATION** (to the City Council) of Final Environmental Impact Report (SCH No. 2021100443), for the proposed Costco Commercial Center Project;
  - a. Recommend adoption of the Findings of Fact and Statement of Overriding Considerations pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15091; and,
  - b. Recommend adoption of the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15097; and,
  
2. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Plan Amendment Application No. P21-01960, requesting authorization to amend the Fresno General Plan and Bullard Community Plan to change the planned land use designation for the subject property from Community Commercial to General Commercial, and reclassify West Herndon Avenue, from North Riverside to North Hayes Avenue, from an Expressway to a Super Arterial; and,
  
3. **RECOMMEND BILL** (to the City Council for introduction and adoption) to approve Rezone Application No. P21-01960, requesting authorization to amend the Official Zoning Map of the City of Fresno to rezone the subject property from the CC/EA/UGM/cz (*Community Commercial/Expressway Overlay/Urban Growth Management*) zone district to the CG/UGM/cz (*Commercial General/Urban Growth Management/conditions of zoning*) zone district in accordance with the Plan Amendment Application; and
  
4. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Conditional Use Permit Application No. P21-01959, requesting authorization to construct a ±219,216 square-foot Costco warehouse retail building, with a ±4,800 square-foot carwash and a ±13,000 square-foot fuel canopy with 32 fuel pumps, subject to compliance with Draft Conditions of Approval dated February 21, 2024.
  
5. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Conditional Use Permit Application No. P21-03251, requesting authorization to establish a State of California Alcoholic Beverage Control (ABC) Type 21 alcohol license that will allow the sale of beer, wine, and distilled spirits for consumption off the premises where sold, subject to compliance with Draft Conditions of Approval dated February 21, 2024.
  
6. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** (to the City Council) of Planned

Development Permit Application No. P21-03252, requesting authorization to modify parking lot development standards to allow for 36.5-foot-tall parking lot light fixtures rather than 25-foot-tall fixtures.

6:34 p.m.

*Steven Martinez (Planner) made a presentation discussing the project overview, including each application, location, renderings, zoning and land use. He explained environmental impacts, public outreach and Staff's recommendations.*

*The applicants team made a presentation covering several topics. The first topic consisted of the environmental impact and the corresponding mitigation measures proposed. Next, they provided a background on Costco, talking about the relocation/location choice, Costco membership, community involvement and clarification that this would not be the largest Costco. They continued to present on the proposed project improvements, off-site improvements, truck patterns/access, exterior design and fuel site. They concluded their presentation on the planning process, highlighting the timeline, General Plan, community outreach, zoning and hours of operation.*

*Lyday asked for clarification on the plans for the old building.*

*Public comment*

*One person spoke in favor of the project, emphasizing the history of the land.*

*One person spoke in opposition voicing concern about CEQA Mitigation, specifically VMT, the rezone, and consideration of alternatives.*

*During applicant rebuttal, the consultants reported emission thresholds and detailed evaluation of the consistency with the Climate Action Plan.*

*When making his motion, Vang stated that Costco is a steward of the community and encouraged the public to speak when the item is heard at City Council.*

**On motion of Chairperson Vang, seconded by Commissioner Diaz, that the above Action Item be APPROVED. The motion carried by the**

following vote:

**Aye:** 4 - Chairperson Vang, Commissioner Bray, Commissioner Diaz, and Commissioner Lyday

**Absent:** 2 - Commissioner Criner , and Commissioner Wagner

**Abstain:** 1 - Vice Chair Hardie

**IX. REPORT BY SECRETARY**

7:15 p.m.

*Clark warned the Commission the next meeting agenda was full and reminded them of the importance of notifying Staff of their attendance when trying to identify quorum.*

**X. SCHEDULED ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

*None*

**XI. UNSCHEDULED ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

*N/A*

**XII. ADJOURNMENT**

*Chair Vang adjourned the meeting at 7:18 p.m.*