

RECEIVED

2016 JAN 25 AM 10 53

Agenda Item: ID16-058 (10:00 A.M.-5)

Date: 1/28/16

CITY CLERK, FRESNO, CA

## FRESNO CITY COUNCIL



### Supplemental Information Packet Agenda Related Item(s) – ID16-058 (10:00 A.M.-5)

#### **Contents of Supplement: Letter of Support for Parkside Dairy/Golden State Company**

##### **Item(s)**

Attached please find a Supplement to File ID16-058 (10:00 A.M.-5). The title of the item is as follows:

HEARING to consider adoption of resolutions related to the designation of properties to the Local Register of Historic Resources  
5. RESOLUTION - Designating the Parkside Dairy/Golden State Company (Central Valley Cheese) Buildings located at 450 E. Belmont Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources.

##### **Supplemental Information:**

Any agenda related public documents received and distributed to a majority of the City Council after the Agenda Packet is printed are included in Supplemental Packets. Supplemental Packets are produced as needed. The Supplemental Packet is available for public inspection in the City Clerk's Office, 2600 Fresno Street, during normal business hours (main location pursuant to the Brown Act, G.C. 54957.5(2)). In addition, Supplemental Packets are available for public review at the City Council meeting in the City Council Chambers, 2600 Fresno Street. Supplemental Packets are also available on-line on the City Clerk's website.

##### **Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA):**

The meeting room is accessible to the physically disabled, and the services of a translator can be made available. Requests for additional accommodations for the disabled, sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or translators should be made one week prior to the meeting. Please call City Clerk's Office at 621-7650. Please keep the doorways, aisles and wheelchair seating areas open and accessible. If you need assistance with seating because of a disability, please see Security.

January 24, 2016

Council President Paul Caprioglio  
Members of the City Council  
City of Fresno

*delivered by email*

RE: Item ID16-058  
Council meeting of January 28, 2016

**Supporting** Resolution designating the Parkside Dairy/Golden State Company (Central Valley Cheese) Buildings located at 450 E. Belmont Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources.

RECEIVED  
2016 JAN 25 AM 10 01  
CITY CLERK, FRESNO CA

Dear Council President Caprioglio and Members of the City Council:

We are surprised to find that your agenda packet does not include a staff report on this item, so we write to ensure that Councilmembers are adequately briefed on the issues.

Three reasons strongly suggest a “yes” vote on this resolution:

**First: Adoption of this resolution is the only action consistent with mandatory environmental mitigation measures governing disposition of the buildings and use of the property.**

During the creation of the Tower District Specific Plan in 1989-1990, members of the Specific Plan Advisory Committee met with Mr. Shehadey about this property. As a result of that meeting, and what we learned from City planning staff Nick Yovino and Lois Johnson about the historic value of the property, we recommended – and the Fresno City Council adopted – the following *mandatory* mitigation measures<sup>1</sup>:

1. The project **shall** retain the existing building at the southwest corner of East Belmont and North Roosevelt Avenues as depicted on attached Exhibit “L-1.”
2. Retention and renovation of the facade of the existing building immediately south of the building at the southwest corner, as shown on Exhibit “L-1,” as is

<sup>1</sup> See, ATTACHMENT TO THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT ADDRESSING MODIFICATIONS TO THE DRAFT TOWER DISTRICT SPECIFIC PLAN. Note it incorrectly identifies the parcel as “144 E. Belmont,” but see Exhibit L-1 (map showing location at SW corner of Belmont and Roosevelt). Please note: the list of mitigation measures (p. 6) is only partial. The full list also imposes requirements for maintenance of the streetscape (item 6), and limitations on truck operations at that location (items 8 and 9).

physically possible and economically practical. If the facade fails due to structural distress it should be rebuilt to resemble the existing historical structure as closely as possible, using the remnant bricks from the fallen facade. All precautions in concert with common practices standard to the industry **shall** be taken to save the façade intact. However, no implicit guarantee can be given that the facade will not fail during the demolition and renovation process.

3. The new construction in the infill areas on the east side of the property **shall** be compatible with the existing structure as shown on Exhibit “L-2.”
4. The new construction contemplated immediately west of the facade described above **shall** be no higher than the height of the facade for a minimum of twenty feet west of the facade.

The mitigation measures in 1990 explicitly anticipated that Producers would be using the property for truck parking. Therefore, those measures require Producers to protect surrounding residences from excessive noise and other impacts, and to ensure that the view from local streets will continue to include the Mission Revival brick façade and the unique and beautiful corner building.

This is the kind of maintenance of effort we all expect from our neighbors on our own streets: it is certainly not too much to ask of Producers Dairy – even if they did not have access to High Speed Rail funding to pay a good chunk of what it will cost to comply with the City’s 25-year-old mitigation measures.



**Second:** Adoption of this resolution is the only logical action in light of the property’s clear qualification for listing in our City’s Local Register of Historic Resources.

The Fresno City Municipal Code, section 12-1607, sets out criteria for designating a property for inclusion in the City's historic register, providing in pertinent part:

(a) HISTORIC RESOURCES: Any building, structure, object or site may be designated as an Historic Resource if it is found by the Commission and Council to meet the following criteria:

(1) It has been in existence more than fifty years and it possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association, and:

...

(iii) It embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values;

...

As the staff report to the Historic Preservation Commission noted, "The brick masonry buildings at this location are 85 years of age and thus are far older than the minimum of 50 years required for listing on the Local Register. Although windows are boarded and some architectural treatment on the former 1929 corner building has been removed, the integrity of the buildings remains high."

The report goes on to describe the distinctive characteristics of type, period, and method of construction, the relative rarity of Mission Revival style commercial buildings in Fresno, and this particular example as "a late and rare expression in masonry brick of the Mission Revival style in Fresno." Especially pertinent here, the report noted, "The original buildings (1929/1930/1932) form a unique streetscape."

Applying the criteria set forth in the City's ordinance code, the staff's bottom line was: "Staff recommends that the Commission find that the Mission Revival style masonry brick buildings constructed in 1929-1932 and located at 405-450 E. Belmont Avenue are eligible for listing on the Local Register of Historic Resources under Criterion iii."

As the Council is aware, a decision to deny Historic Register status will mean the demolition of this neighborhood-defining historic resource. Especially where mandatory mitigation measures already require vigorous efforts to preserve the historically significant features of the property, we trust in your Council to safeguard this resource with a historic register designation.

**Third: Adoption of the resolution confirms that the Council respects and values citizens' participation.**

This Council has selected citizens with significant subject-matter expertise, and delegated to them the responsibility to vet and make recommendations to you regarding issues of particular interest—in this case the members of the Historic Preservation Committee and the Tower District Design Review Committee. Both of those bodies have recommended historic designation for this property.

Taken one at a time, decisions like this may seem insignificant. However, as

HPC and TDDRC members have had long experience considering, and as economists will be quick to tell you, single-parcel decisions about land use, design, and streetscape changes have long-term cumulative effects on property values. We are sure you realize that only business owners exploiting devalued property prices would care to open shop within sight of a facility that presents nothing but a wall of truck trailers to the street. Certainly homeowners on the block will experience immediately the impact of this change in their primarily residential neighborhood.

Therefore, we urge you to take advantage of the time, effort, and perspective of your appointed committees, and the expertise and insight of your staff, and adopt the resolution designating the Producers property at Roosevelt and Belmont for inclusion in the Local Register of Historic Resources.

Thanking you for your consideration of these matters, we remain,

Very truly yours,

Patience Milrod

Bruce Owdom

Don Simmons

cc: Douglas Sloan  
Jennifer Clark  
Karana Hattersley-Drayton  
Mike Clifton