

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE  
REQUEST FOR QUOTES FOR COMPREHENSIVE ECONOMIC  
DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY**

**RFQ NO. 12301676**

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS:**

- Lance Lippincott - Director, City of Fresno Economic Development Department
- Kelly Trevino - Assistant Director, City of Fresno Economic Development Department
- Lisa Henslee – Executive Assistant, City of Fresno Economic Development Department

**FACILITATOR:**

- N/A

**BACKGROUND**

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFQ) was to solicit quotes to provide professional services for the City of Fresno. The contractor will be responsible for providing assistance and guidance to the City of Fresno for the formation of a compliant U.S. Economic Development Administration (EDA) Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy (CEDs).

Proposals were received from the below listed vendors as of the bid close date of March 31, 2023:

- Beacon Economics
- Chabin Concepts, Inc.
- Kosmont Companies
- Natelson Dale Group
- CVL Economics
- Thomas P. Miller and Associates, LLC

**SIGNIFICANT EVENTS**

Bid Opening - March 3, 2023

Bid Close – March 31, 2023

Final Committee Evaluation – April 12, 2023

**EVALUTION FOR DETERMINATION**

The committee reviewed the six proposals, which ranged in cost from \$80,000.00 to \$100,000.00. The committee members evaluated these six proposers on:

- 1) Cost as shown on the proposal form

- 2) Conformance to the terms and conditions of the RFQ
- 3) Ability to meet the stated service requirements
- 4) Past performance and experience based on references and experience indicated in RFQ submissions.
- 5) Financial stability based on information provided in the statement of qualifications.
- 6) Other related information.

## **COMMITTEE NOTES**

### **Beacon Economics**

Beacon Economics has been providing economic services from impact analyses to CEDS for the last sixteen (16) years. Beacon Economics staff has a combined 65+ years of economic development experience, and provided a listing of CEDS completed in other similar jurisdictions in California and Nevada. Beacon is located and operates out of Los Angeles, but has engaged with other economic development organizations in the Central Valley.

### **Chabin Concepts, Inc.**

Chabin Concepts, Inc. (Chabin) has been providing economic development services including CEDS for over 25 years. Chabin has a history of successful projects for the City of Fresno, County of Fresno, Fresno County Economic Development Corporation, County of Merced, and other entities in the Central Valley. A listing of fourteen (14) other projects was provided for reference. Chabin is located in Chico, and has extensive experience with EDA compliant CEDS projects.

### **Kosmont Companies**

Kosmont Companies was established in 1986, and has been providing economic development services for more than 37 years. Kosmont has worked on projects in the Fresno area since 2005, and most recently assisted in the formation of an Enhanced Infrastructure Finance District centered around Downtown and the Blackstone Avenue BRT corridor. A thorough listing of other comparable projects was included in the RFQ response for reference. Kosmont is located in Manhattan Beach, California and, as stated previously, are familiar with the Central Valley.

### **Natelson Dale Group**

The Natelson Dale Group is a boutique economic development firm that has been in operation since 1974. With primary practice areas focusing on planning and implementation of strategic plans, the Natelson Dale Group rates as one of the more experienced entities to submit a response to the RFQ. The Natelson Dale Group includes more than seventeen (17) CEDS projects for reference in their submittal, and has conducted work in Central Valley jurisdictions. The Natelson Dale Group operates from Yorba Linda, California.

## **CVL Economics**

Founded in 2021, CVL Economics is one of the newest firms to submit a response to the RFQ. Four (4) projects are included for reference in the submission, although only one of the projects that they have undertaken was a CEDS. CVL Economics is headquartered in Los Angeles, and does not appear to have undertaken any work in the Central Valley as of the date of their submission.

## **Thomas P. Miller and Associates, LLC**

Thomas P. Miller and Associates, LLC (Miller) was founded in Indianapolis in 1989 by Thomas Miller, who continues to serve in the company. Miller provides a broad range of strategic services centered around economic development, workforce development, evaluation, housing studies, and several other related fields. Past project references were provided for three projects that were completed in Utah, Virginia, and Pennsylvania. Miller is located in Indianapolis, Indiana and did not reference any work in the Central Valley as of the date of their application.

## **SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION**

The committee agreed unanimously that Chabin Concepts, Inc., was best suited for this RFQ. Although all applicants are well qualified to perform the work stipulated to in the RFQ, Chabin provided the highest rated response based on timeliness, experience, and cost.