

**Parking Rate Study**  
**City of Fresno, California**

Prepared for  
The City of Fresno, CA

Prepared by  
Walter P. Moore and Associates, Inc.  
1301 McKinney  
Suite 1100  
Houston, TX

P03-16023-00

November 07, 2016

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**PARKING RATE STUDY ..... 1**

    City of Fresno ..... 1

    Introduction ..... 1

    Project Information ..... 1

    Methodology ..... 1

    Existing Conditions ..... 2

    Comparable Cities ..... 6

    Capital Asset Management Plan ..... 11

    Conclusions ..... 11

    Recommendations ..... 14

**ATTACHMENTS**

    Percentage Increase Spreadsheet .....

    Walter P Moore Camp Spreadsheet.....

**PARKING RATE SURVEY****City of Fresno, California– Parking Report****Introduction**

Walter P Moore (WPM) was retained by the City of Fresno, California to analyze the rates charged at the City’s on-street and off-street parking facilities. Walter P Moore was tasked with reviewing and providing recommendations for parking rates charged, on-street technology, and hours of operation. Additionally, Walter P Moore was asked to benchmark several other cities with similar parking operations.

**Project Information****Methodology****Reviewing Parking Rates**

Walter P Moore conducted a site visit to the City of Fresno on Monday August 8, 2016 and Tuesday, August 9, 2016 to observe the existing conditions, take note of garage/meter occupancies, and observe competing parking facilities. In addition, Walter P Moore researched the parking rates charged in similar parking facilities in the California cities of Sacramento, Santa Rosa, Bakersfield, and Stockton. Additionally we reviewed municipal parking in El Paso, Texas because they have a similar downtown event area with a new ball park and convention center.

**Basis of Parking Rates**

Parking rates are typically set based on the parking market in the immediate vicinity of the facility. If parking demand in the area is high, rates charged should also be high, and vice-versa. This depends on the user groups and conditions in the garage. For example, rates in a newer well-lit, clean, well designed garage that is easy to navigate and find a space in can charge a higher rate than an older, dark, dirty, and difficult to navigate facility that may be adjacent. Patrons will generally prefer to park in a well maintained facility vs a dark and dirty garage.

Amenities will can also affect rates charged. Sky-bridge or tunnel connections can justify a premium charge. Tiered pricing for monthly parking is utilized in some facilities. Tiered parking is charging different

rates based on location in a parking facility. For example, covered parking is a premium and should cost more than parking on the roof. Enforcement of tiered parking is necessary and can be difficult in some areas. Many parking facilities charge one rate for parking including spaces on the roof.

Typically, if a facility is filling to capacity every day, the rates are too low. If a facility is operating at 50% occupancy or less every day the rates are too high. Parking garages typically operate most efficiently when they are at 80% to 90% occupied. The remaining 10% - 20% cushion allows patrons to find a space more easily.

On-street parking rates should be set to encourage short-term use. Rates for off-street parking should be set higher than nearby off-street parking. On-street parking in areas where there are shops and restaurants should be attractive to diners and shoppers but priced high enough to dissuade employees from taking those spaces. On-street meters in the government or business areas must be priced accordingly and time limits strictly enforced. In areas where there is no readily available off-street parking then time limits can be longer and lower rates charged.

## Existing Conditions

The City of Fresno owns five parking structures in the downtown area. Walter P Moore visited each parking facility owned by the City of Fresno to verify rates and observe occupancy in the garages. We did not conduct an in-depth occupancy study of the garages and our observations represent a snapshot in time.

### **On-street Meter Operations.**

There are approximately 2,000 meters in the downtown Fresno area. The meters accept coin and most accept smart cards that are sold by the City at City Hall. The City does not utilize or offer mobile pay apps such as Parkmobile.

The City of Fresno operates approximately 2,000 on-street parking meters. The parking meters are \$0.75 per hour. There are various time period increments available including 30 minutes, 1 hour, 2 hours, 4 hours and 10 hours. Many meters also have maximum time limits allowed. Meters are

enforced from 6 a.m. until 6 p.m. Monday through Friday. Meters are free on weekends except on days when there are events in the Stadium or Convention Center areas. Meters are enforced between 6 a.m. and 10 p.m. on event days. It should be noted that the rates charged at meters on event days are the same as days with no events.

The meters accept coins or a prepaid parking meter card. Cards start at \$30.00 for 40 hours of meter time plus a \$3.00 activation fee. Additional time can be added at the time of purchase or a later date. Unused time can be reapplied to the card prior to the meter expiring. The City also offers a Meter Occupancy hang-tag permit that allows users to park at any City meter without depositing coins. Permits are \$120.00 per month.

#### **On-Street Meter Occupancy Survey**

The City of Fresno provided Walter P Moore with a survey of meter usage in the downtown area. The survey covered 1974 meters and 9 areas (including the Federal Lot and North Lot & Promenade). The survey showed meter usage on weekdays and Saturdays. Based on the survey there are areas where meters showed zero utilization. These areas include:

- 600 block (both sides of street) Broadway 10 meters – These meters are located on the southeast edge of downtown and do not serve any nearby parking demand generators.
- 2000 block (odd) Calaveras 4 meters – there is free parking located across the street as well as a large surface lot serving the nearby business.
- 2100 Block (odd) of Inyo 3 meters – These are located in front of the Super 8 Motel. The meters on the even side of the street showed a 47.50% utilization on Saturdays while the odd side showed 0.00%.
- 1800 Block (both sides) of Mono 16 meters – This area is a warehouse area and far from generators. These meters may get some event parking revenue but do not generate revenue during the week or Saturdays.
- 1200 Block (Even) of O Street 5 meters – There is 2hr free parking located directly across the street from these meters. The meters (14) on the odd side of the street have very low occupancy (3.06%) on weekdays and 0% occupancy on Saturday.

- 1300 Block (Even) of O Street 12 meters – nearby business have surface lots for patrons. The odd side of the street meters have low (1.43%) weekday occupancy and 0% occupancy on Saturday.
- 2400 Block (Even) of Merced 9 meters – these meters have less than 1% occupancy level. There is free parking on the odd side of the street.
- 2100 Block (both sides) of Stanislaus 11 meters – these meters have 0% occupancy. There are spaces where meters have been removed and parking is free.
- 1900 Block (Odd) of Stanislaus 2 meters – these meters are located next to the Firestone store. The meters on the even side of the street have approximately 42.98% occupancy.
- 700 Block (Even) of Van Ness 4 meters – these are located next to a used car dealer and detail shop. There are no other parking demand generators nearby.
- 1500 Block (Even) of Van Ness 6 meters – these spaces are beside the PBS television studios which has a large surface lot on the other side of the building. There is a new housing project that has been constructed on the odd side of the street. This may create some demand for these spaces.
- 1600 Block (Even) of Van Ness 3 meters – these spaces may service the Arte Americas Center when there are events, they showed 0% occupancy during the meter survey.

#### **Off- Street Parking Facilities**

The City of Fresno owns 12 off-street parking facilities in the downtown area. This includes 5 parking structures and 7 surface parking lots. The Parking Garages are as follows:

- Garage 4 Tulare Ave & Fulton Mall (313 spaces)
- Garage 7 Van Ness and Inyo Avenues (587 spaces)
- Garage 8 Tulare & Van Ness Avenues (968 spaces)
- Garage 9 Van Ness Avenue and Merced Street (213 spaces)
- Convention Center Garage Inyo and “O” Streets (1,565 spaces)

All of the garages are open to the public and offer daily and monthly parking. Based on our observation, all of the garages with the exception of Garage 9 were at 50% occupancy or less.

The garages provide daily and monthly contract parking with the exception of Garage 9 at Van Ness and Merced Avenues which provides monthly contract parking only. And are generally open from 6 a.m. until 6 p.m., and until 10 p.m. during events.

Daily parking charges in each garage is as follows:

- \$3.00 first hour
- \$1.00 each additional hour
- \$9.00 maximum Monday through Friday 6 a.m. to 6 p.m.
- Free after 6 p.m. and on weekends except for Stadium events.
- Event rate \$5.00 in Garages 4, 7 and 8, \$10 in the Convention Center Garage.

Monthly permit parking rates in the garages are as follows:

- \$75.00 Uncovered
- \$90.00 Covered

We noticed that on-line information and information we were provided indicates that there is uncovered parking available in Garage 8. We were not able to find any uncovered parking in Garage 8 as it is a subterranean facility. Garage 9 also indicates that uncovered parking is available but also indicates that there may be a waiting list. We observed the uncovered parking area and found very few vehicles while the covered area had higher occupancy. There was no indication as to how the vehicles assigned to uncovered parking were identified or how this was being enforced.

The surface parking lots offer monthly and daily parking. The lots are also operation from 6 a.m. until 6 p.m. and free after 6 p.m. and on weekends. On days when there are events in the area, operation hours are extended to 10 p.m. Several of the lots have meters on them with 2 hour to 10 hour limits.

The surface lots include:

- Lot 2 Broadway and H Streets (210 spaces)
- Promenade Lot Tulare Avenue and R Street (750 spaces)
- Stadium Lot H & Kern Streets (525 spaces)
- Boxcar Lot H& Tuolumne Streets (525 spaces)

- Lot 3 Fulton and Mariposa Malls (22 spaces)
- Lot 6 Inyo St and Fulton Mall (58 spaces)
- Federal Lot 1 100 “O” Street at Fresno Street (90 metered spaces)

The parking rates charged on the surface lots are:

- \$3.00 first hour
- \$1.00 each additional hour
- \$9.00 maximum
- \$5.00 events
- \$0.75 per hour for meters

**Other Parking Rates**

There are several entities that have lower monthly permit rates such as:

- \$30.00 per space - U.S. General Services Administration (Garage 7)
- \$36.00 per space – Judicial Council of California (Garages 4 and 8)
- \$30.00 per space – SBA Project (Promenade lot)
- \$60.00 per space – Club One Casino (Garage 8)
- \$45.00 per space – Fresno County (Convention Center and various)
- \$35.00 per space – Fresno Housing Authority (Garage 7)
- \$45.00 per space – Fresno County Office of Education (Around 1111 Van Ness)
- \$25.00 per space – Fresno County (Stadium and Boxcar lot/)

**Comparable Cities**

**City Parking Comparison**

Walter P Moore researched the parking rates charged for on-street and off-street parking in municipal facilities in cities of similar size. Our findings are outlined below:

**Table 1. Comparable Cities On-Street Meters**

**Bakersfield, CA:**

Bakersfield has a lot of free parking downtown. There are no fees for on-street parking, however there are areas that have strict time limits.



The City of Bakersfield operates one garage in which it offers the first two hours free, each hour after is \$1.00 to a \$10.00 maximum. Monthly parking is available for a fee of \$30 per month.

Republic Parking operates the parking facilities at the Meadows Field Airport in Bakersfield. The first 30 minutes are free, \$2.00 for each 30 minutes after, to a \$12.00 maximum. Long term storage is available for \$10.00 per day.

### **Sacramento, CA**

The City of Sacramento operates several parking structures and surface lots in the downtown area. Rates for garage parking are generally \$1.50 each half hour with a \$20.00 daily maximum charge. Weekend rates are \$1.50 each half hour with a \$5.00 daily maximum charge. Evening rates begin at 5:00 p.m. to 6:00 a.m. and are \$1.50 for each half hour to a maximum charge of \$5.00.

Contract parking rates in the garages are from \$115.00 to \$185.00 per month (depending on location). Carpool rates are also offered and range from \$97.50 to \$138.75.

The City of Sacramento has several surface lots in the downtown area. There is a flat daily rate of \$2.00 on most lots and a contract parking charge of \$45.00 per month.

On- street parking is controlled by parking meters. Generally, meters are free on Sunday throughout the downtown core are with the exception of Old Sacramento, where meters are enforced 7 days a week. Time zones and other restrictions are also enforced in all locations unless otherwise posted. The base meter rate is \$1.75 per 1 hour. In areas where there are long term meters, the rates are \$3.00 maximum for 10 hours and \$6.00 maximum for 10 hours (depending on location).

Sacramento also has tier-based meters called "SacParc Meters". SacPark meters allow time extensions that allow motorists to park past the posted time limit when they find themselves unexpectedly delayed.

Tier 1: \$1.75 per hour up to the posted time limit (Base Meter Rate)

Tier 2: \$3.00 for next hour after Tier 1 expires

Tier 3: \$3.75 for each hour parked thereafter

Parkers can use Parkmobile to make the initial payment. The app will remind them when any paid tier time is about to expire. The app allows for extension of times without having to return to the meter.

There are several types of on-street parking meters in use:

Single space digital meters (Duncan and McKay). These meters accept quarters, and meter debit cards.

Pay & Display meters. These meters accept nickels, dimes, quarters, \$1.00 coins and credit cards (American Express, Visa, MasterCard, and Discover).

IPS Smart Meters. These meters accept nickels, dimes, quarters, \$1.00 coins, credit cards and Parkmobile (requires a credit or debit card).

#### **City of Santa Rosa CA**

The City of Santa Rosa operates five parking structures, ten parking lots and on-street parking with a total of 4,585 parking spaces. Garage parking is \$0.75 per hour to an \$8.00 maximum. Monthly permits in the garages are \$62.00 to \$85.00 for unreserved and \$120.00 to \$140.00 for reserved spaces.

On-street parking meters and metered lots are \$1.00 per hour for cars/trucks and \$0.50 for motorcycles on the street. Non-reserved space monthly permits are available for \$62.00 to \$140.00 for on-street parking. Permits are also available for Commercial Loading Zones at \$104 per year and residential parking for \$20.00 per year. A construction meter bag will cost \$12 per day. The City of Santa Rosa also sells discounted voucher bundles at \$63.75 for 100 hours.

Santa Rosa uses a parking app called Passport. They had previously tried MobileNow but aborted the program in 2014. The Passport app doesn't require prepayment and notifies parkers via text message that their parking time is about to expire. Parkers can make payment with their smart phone for \$0.15 per transaction compared to the \$0.30 charged by MobileNow.

**City of Stockton CA**

Parking lots and garages in Stockton charge \$2.00 per hour of stay (\$10 to \$14 max) and between \$44 and \$75 for a monthly permit. Some of the garages might have a waiting list for long term parking.

There's also on-street parking available Downtown. Meters are priced at \$0.25 per 15 minutes. Parking can be paid through the Parkmobile app. The Parkmobile app will notify parkers via text when their parking time is near expiration. Parking can be extended through the parking app. There are time limits for parking in many areas and parking cannot be extended beyond the time limit.

Event parking around the Stockton Arena, the Bob Hope Theater and the Banner Island Ballpark ranges from \$10 to \$25 depending on location.

**El Paso, TX**

El Paso has both on-street and off-street parking spaces. On-street parking is enforced 8AM-6PM, Mon-Sat. It's free on Sundays everywhere and on Saturdays within the downtown shopping districts. The rate is \$0.50 for 30 minutes and \$1.00 per hour. Meters accept quarters, dollar coins, credit cards (Visa, MasterCard, and Discover) and city-issued debit cards called Smart Cards.

Downtown meters operate Mon-Friday 8a.m. to 6p.m.

Downtown El Paso has a number of off-street parking locations. The average hourly rate is \$3.00-\$4.00 and the average 24-hour rate is \$8.00-\$8.50. The average price for a monthly permit will be around \$60-\$65.

There are a few locations with monthly permits as high as \$75.00

Event parking is \$5.00 to \$10.00 depending on location. The City Council is currently (as of the date of this report) considering designating an "entertainment parking area" and raising the fee at parking meters in this designated area to a flat fee of \$5.00 after 6:00 p.m. for certain events.

El Paso also has a parking debit card that can provide 15 minutes of parking for each time it is inserted in a digital parking meter. There is also a pay by cell app that is good at all 2000 meters around town and allows payment through the use of a debit or credit card. There is no cost to

download the app however there is a \$0.35 convenience fee added to the transaction. Parkers can add time from anywhere using their cell phone. You cannot extend your time past the posted time limits.

Meters in downtown are free on Saturday, Sunday and holidays. Meters outside of downtown (in the Cincinnati entertainment district) operate Mon-Sat. 8-6.

Table 1 below outlines the on-street meter rates charged in the comparable cities:

**Table 1. Comparable Cities On-Street Meters**

On-Street Meters	Bakersfield CA	Sacramento CA	Santa Rosa CA	Stockton CA	El Paso TX	Fresno CA
0-30 Mins	\$0.00	\$1.75	\$1.00	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$0.30
1 Hr	\$0.00	\$1.75	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$0.75
2 Hrs	\$0.00	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$2.00	\$2.00	\$1.50
10 Hrs (per hr)	\$0.00	\$3.00 - \$6.00	\$1.00 ea addl hr	\$0.25 ea addl 15 mins	\$0.50 ea addl 30 mins	\$0.75
Meter Permit	No	No	\$63.00 - \$140.00	No	No	\$120.00
Meter Smart Card	No	No	No	No	Yes	\$30.00
Mobile App	No	ParkMobile	Passport	ParkMobile	Park El Paso	No

Table 2 below outlines the off-street parking rates charged for monthly contract and daily parking in the comparable cities:

**Table 2. Comparable Cities Off-Street Parking Facilities**

Off-Street Garages	Bakersfield CA	Sacramento CA	Santa Rosa CA	Stockton CA	El Paso TX	Fresno CA
0-30 Mins	\$0.00	\$1.50	\$.75	\$1.00	\$0.50	\$3.00
1 Hr	\$0.00	\$3.00	\$0.75	\$2.00	\$1.00	\$3.00
2 Hrs	\$0.00	\$4.50	\$1.50	\$4.00	\$2.00	\$4.00
Ea Hr After	\$1.00 ea addl hr	\$1.50 ea addl 30 mins	\$0.75 ea addl hr	\$2.00 ea addl hr	\$0.50 ea addl 30 mins	\$1.00 ea addl hr
Max	\$10.00	\$20.00	\$8.00	\$10.00 - \$14.00	No	\$9.00
Event	NA	NA	NA	\$10.00 - \$25.00	\$5.00 - \$10.00	\$5.00
Monthly	\$30	\$115.00 - \$185.00	\$62.00 - \$85.00	\$44.00 - \$75.00	\$60.00 - \$65.00	\$75.00 - \$95.00

### Walter P Moore’s Capital Assessment Management Plan (CAMP)

Walter P Moore developed a CAMP that details a deferred management plan for the off-street parking facilities. The CAMP shows the cost of deferred maintenance in the CAMP to be a total of \$9,810,000 over a period of 10 years. The first fiscal year the CAMP cost are estimated at \$1,910,000, with cost decreasing each year. See attached CAMP spreadsheet.

### Conclusions

#### On-Street Parking Conclusions

Walter P Moore has reviewed the existing conditions in the City of Fresno and the comparable cities and we have reached the following conclusions:

- The current on-street parking meter rates do not encourage parking in the off-street facilities. When on-street meters are \$0.75

per hour and structured parking rates are \$3.00 for the first hour and \$1.00 for each hour after, patrons who desire to park for a couple of hours will search for a parking meter rather than parking in a garage. Short term off-street parking should be priced less than the on-street parking meters. The low on-street rates encourage downtown employees to take parking that should be available for customers. This is evidenced by the high occupancy rates of the on-street meters and the low occupancy rates in the garage.

- Rates for meters are not dynamic and do not allow the City to take advantage of high demand periods. With new technology (“smart” meters) the City could take advantage of high parking demand during peak hours or during events by utilizing demand pricing. Demand pricing is when the meter rates can be adjusted up or down at specific times or days based on the demand. This type of system will enhance meter revenue particularly around the Convention Center and the Stadium.
- The Meter Occupancy Permit charge per month of \$120.00 should be reviewed. This allows patrons to utilize meters on a daily basis. There several options that should be considered:
  - Raise the cost of the Meter Occupancy Permit
  - Eliminate the Meter Occupancy Permit
  - Provide for meters in garages or off-street lots only
- There are approximately 85 meters identified in the Meter Survey conducted by the City of Fresno with 0% occupancy on both weekdays and Saturday. These meters either have free parking close-by or do not have any parking demand generators in the vicinity. These meters are located on the edge of the Central Business District and most are a considerable distance from any significant parking demand generators. These meters should be removed. (It should be kept in mind that the Meter Survey provided appears to only cover 3 days and occupancy levels may increase on certain days or events).

- There are other meters included in the survey that had less than 10% occupancy on weekdays and Saturdays. These meters should be reviewed and removed if occupancy continues to be below 10%. (It should be kept in mind that the Meter Survey provided appears to only cover 3 days and occupancy levels may increase on certain days or events).
- The meters at the core of the Central Business District, particularly around the government buildings experience the highest demand.
- Rates charged to the public for monthly parking in the off-street facilities are within the range of what we found in comparable Cities. Raising the rate charged for public monthly parking will not increase occupancy in the garages and may have a detrimental effect. Raising the rates for on-street meter parking will increase garage occupancy.
- There are a number of monthly contracts that deeply discounted. Some are discounted 60%. The majority of these are contracts are with government entities and the rates are controlled by contract. In some cases the price may be adjusted annually based on CPI or 3% whichever is less. It appears that many of these rates have not been adjusted since the start of the contract. All monthly contracts should be increased by the allowable rate. New contracts should include rate increases.
- Raising the daily parking rates will not increase occupancy in the garages and will have a detrimental effect on parking revenues and occupancy.
- The off-street parking facilities are not generating sufficient revenue to pay for the Walter P Moore recommended CAMP deferred maintenance. The proposed increase of 33% in meter rates charged could be used to off-set the deferred maintenance costs.

## Recommendations

Based on our review of the existing conditions, the research of comparable cities, and our conclusions, Walter P Moore provides the following recommendations for the City of Fresno parking facilities:

- Raise on-street meters (all time increments) to a minimum of \$0.50 for 30 minutes, \$1.00 per hour. In particular high demand areas, meter rates may be increased to \$1.50 per hour. Based on a 33% increase (from \$0.75 to \$1.00) the projected increase in annual profit is \$281,260 (over 2016 reported profits).
- Raise the off-street meters on the Federal lot to match the on-street meter rates above. Based on a 33% increase (from \$0.75 to \$1.00) the projected additional profit increase over the 2016 reported profits is \$35,000.
- The total projected increase in annual profit (\$316,190) could be utilized to off-set the cost of the deferred maintenance program (\$1,910,000 first fiscal year) as described in the Walter P Moore Capital Asset Management Plan.
- The Meter Occupancy Permit should be increased from \$120 to \$150.00 to reflect the change in meter rates. The same meter permit should be offered for garage/off-street meters to encourage garage usage.
- A mobile payment application should be considered. This will allow patrons to pay-by-phone. There are several mobile pay-applications in the marketplace. The City should seek proposals from the different vendors and consider the application that best suits the needs of the City and its parkers.
- Replacing single space meters with “smart” multi-space meters that allow for easier and faster enforcement. The “smart” meters will also allow for the addition of tiered or demand pricing. There are a variety of “smart” meters on the market. There are solar powered models that do not require infrastructure to install. The



City should request presentations from several vendors to better understand the features available in each meter. The City should then have a specification written that describes the desired features of the meters and a request for proposals drafted that is suitable for competitive bidding of the equipment and software.

- Eliminate the meters or move that have shown zero occupancy. These meters are not producing revenue, but must still be monitored. They are probably costing more to monitor than the revenue they bring in. In addition to the zero occupancy meters, there are meters that indicate less than 10% occupancy during the survey, These meters should be monitored closely to determine if they are producing enough revenue to justify keeping them.
- Consider lowering the short term rates in the off-street facilities. Rates are currently \$3.00 per hour, reducing the rates to \$1.00 for each half hour will help to increase occupancy in the garages. For example:
  - 1<sup>st</sup> 30 minutes            \$1.00
  - 31 – 60 minutes            \$2.00
  - 61 – 90 minutes            \$3.00
  - 91 – 120 minutes           \$4.00
  - 121 – 150 minutes         \$5.00
  - Each additional hour       \$1.00
  - Maximum                    \$9.00

This rate structure reaches the maximum rate after 5.5 hours rather than 7 hours as with the current rate structure. Lowering the short term rates charged for off-street parking will entice some of the parkers currently utilizing meters to park in the garages.

- The deeply discounted parking rates should be increased to a minimum of \$60.00 wherever possible. The current rates charged to the public of \$75.00 to \$95.00 should not be raised at this time. Based on a 20 day month a \$75.00 monthly contract rate equates to \$3.75 per day for parking. This is a considerable discount of the \$9.00 daily parking fee.



## SCOPE QUALIFICATIONS

### PARKING DEMAND ANALYSIS SCOPE QUALIFICATIONS

1. The report prepared as part of the parking rate analysis is dependent upon information provided to Walter P Moore by Client and others. The accuracy of the report is dependent upon the accuracy of this information.
2. If there are changes to the rates charged after completion of the parking rate analysis, the conclusions of the parking rate analysis and any report may no longer be valid. An updated parking rate analysis should be performed.
3. If Client or its agents becomes aware of any change, inaccuracy, inconsistency or error in the information provided to Walter P Moore used to perform the parking rate analysis or in preparations of the report, Client must immediately notify Walter P Moore. Any such deviations in the information provided will materially affect the conclusions in the parking rate analysis and such conclusions may no longer be valid. An updated rate analysis should be performed.
4. The report is to be used in whole and not in part, None of the contents of this report may be reproduced or disseminated in any form for external use by anyone other than Client without the written permission of Walter P Moore



	YEAR											
	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	Total Cost	
PARKING GARAGES	GARAGE 4	\$ 274,000	\$ 89,000	\$ 251,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 369,000	\$ -	\$ 153,000	\$ -	\$ 1,136,000
	GARAGE 7	\$ 652,000	\$ 1,317,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 585,000	\$ 74,000	\$ -	\$ 124,000	\$ 10,000	\$ 2,762,000
	GARAGE 8	\$ 307,000	\$ -	\$ 509,000	\$ 955,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 354,000	\$ 491,000	\$ 390,000	\$ -	\$ 3,006,000
	GARAGE 9	\$ 384,000	\$ -	\$ 285,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 290,000	\$ 959,000
	CONVENTION CENTER GARAGE	\$ 120,000	\$ -		\$ -	\$ 811,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 225,000	\$ 1,156,000
	<b>ALL GARAGES</b>	<b>\$ 1,737,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,406,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,045,000</b>	<b>\$ 955,000</b>	<b>\$ 811,000</b>	<b>\$ 585,000</b>	<b>\$ 797,000</b>	<b>\$ 491,000</b>	<b>\$ 667,000</b>	<b>\$ 525,000</b>	<b>\$ 9,019,000</b>
PARKING LOTS	BOXCAR LOT	\$ -	\$ 122,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 70,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 192,000
	FEDERAL LOT	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 29,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 19,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 48,000
	STADIUM LOT	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 70,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 70,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 140,000
	PROMENADE LOT	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 65,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 65,000	\$ -	\$ 130,000
	LOT 2	\$ 173,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 38,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 38,000	\$ 249,000
	LOT 6	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 21,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 11,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 32,000
	<b>ALL LOTS</b>	<b>\$ 173,000</b>	<b>\$ 122,000</b>	<b>\$ 185,000</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 38,000</b>	<b>\$ 70,000</b>	<b>\$ 100,000</b>	<b>\$ 65,000</b>	<b>\$ 38,000</b>	<b>\$ 791,000</b>
<b>COMBINED COSTS</b>	<b>\$ 1,910,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,528,000</b>	<b>\$ 1,230,000</b>	<b>\$ 955,000</b>	<b>\$ 811,000</b>	<b>\$ 623,000</b>	<b>\$ 867,000</b>	<b>\$ 591,000</b>	<b>\$ 732,000</b>	<b>\$ 563,000</b>	<b>\$ 9,810,000</b>	

\*FY 17 Budget includes \$474,400 for Garage 7 Improvements (Bond Proceeds) and \$571,800 (General Fund) for General Parking Improvement. Total FY 17

Appropriations \$1,046,200

	# of Parking Spaces	FISCAL YEAR - 2017		
		Method 1 <sup>1</sup>	Method 2 <sup>2</sup>	Method 3 <sup>3</sup>
GARAGE 4	313	\$105,289	\$53,637	\$113,600
GARAGE 7	587	\$197,459	\$100,590	\$276,200
GARAGE 8	968	\$325,622	\$165,880	\$300,600
GARAGE 9	213	\$71,650	\$36,500	\$95,900
CONVENTION CENTER GARAGE	1,565	\$526,444	\$268,183	\$115,600
BOXCAR LOT	525	\$176,603	\$89,966	\$19,200
STADIUM LOT	525	\$176,603	\$89,966	\$14,000
PROMENADE LOT	750	\$252,290	\$128,522	\$13,000
LOT 2	210	\$70,641	\$35,986	\$24,900
LOT 3 <sup>4</sup>	22	\$7,400	\$3,770	\$0
<b>Non-Meter Total</b>	<b>5,678</b>	<b>\$1,910,000</b>	<b>\$973,000</b>	<b>\$973,000</b>
FEDERAL LOT	90	\$0	\$4,800	\$4,800
LOT 6	58	\$0	\$3,200	\$3,200
<b>Metered Lot Total</b>	<b>148</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$8,000</b>	<b>\$8,000</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>5,826</b>	<b>\$1,910,000</b>	<b>\$981,000</b>	<b>\$981,000</b>

<sup>1</sup>Method 1 - Allocates 2016 Walter P. Moore CAMP costs based on pro-rated share of parking spaces.

<sup>2</sup>Method 2 - Allocates one-tenth of the total Walter P Moore CAMP costs based on pro-rated share of parking spaces.

<sup>3</sup>Method 3 - Allocates one-tenth of the total Walter P Moore CAMP costs based on the referenced cost for that parking service.

<sup>4</sup>Lot 3 not included in the Walter P Moore study, but included for cost allocation by space.

<sup>5</sup>Average annual Parking Debt Service Payment \$2,638,800: Convention Center \$1,925,300; Combined Lots \$624,200; Garage 7 \$89,300.

	# Garage of Stalls	CAMP Cost	Price/Stall/Month
Method 1 (Sever Capital - Pro-rata share of Parking)			
Garages	5,678	\$1,910,000	\$28.03
Metered Lots	148	\$0	\$0.00
Method 2 (Total Capital/10 - Pro-rata share of Parking)			
Garages	5,678	\$973,000	\$14.28
Metered Lots	148	\$8,000	\$4.50
Method 3 (1/10 Total Capital by Garage/Lot)			
GARAGE 4	313	\$113,600	\$30.24
GARAGE 7	587	\$276,200	\$39.21
GARAGE 8	968	\$300,600	\$25.88
GARAGE 9	213	\$95,900	\$37.52
CC GARAGE	1,565	\$115,600	\$6.16
BOXCAR LOT	525	\$19,200	\$3.05
STADIUM LOT	525	\$14,000	\$2.22
PROM. LOT	750	\$13,000	\$1.44
LOT 2	210	\$24,900	\$9.88
LOT 3 <sup>4</sup>	22	\$0	\$0.00
FEDERAL LOT	90	\$4,800	\$4.44
LOT 6	58	\$3,200	\$4.60
Parking Debt Service <sup>5</sup>			
Garages/Lots	5,678	\$2,571,766	\$37.74
Metered Lots	148	\$67,034	\$37.74
<b>Total</b>	<b>5,826</b>	<b>\$2,638,800</b>	<b>\$37.74</b>

October 2016  
City of Fresno  
Projected Parking Rate Increase 3%-10%

	2016 Total Revenue	2016 Expenses	2016 Net Operating Budget	Increase in Revenue	Potential Profit & Loss	Increase in Revenue	Potential Profit & Loss	Increase in Revenue	Potential Profit & Loss		Calculated Revenue Increase to Breakeven	% Inc in Revenue Necessary for Break Even	Calculated Revenue Increase to Realize Profit	% Inc in Revenue Necessary for 5% Profit
Off Street Parking	*Data provided by CoF	*Data provided by CoF	*Data provided by CoF	3%	3%	5%	5%	10%	10%	2016 Expenses		%	5%	%
Garage 4	\$ 102,365	\$ 142,728	\$ (40,363)	\$ 105,436	\$ (37,292)	\$ 107,483.25	\$ (35,245)	\$ 112,601.50	\$ (30,127)	\$ 142,728	\$ 40,363.00	39%	\$ 42,381.15	41%
Garage 7	\$ 102,849	\$ 370,747	\$ (267,898)	\$ 105,934	\$ (264,813)	\$ 107,991	\$ (262,756)	\$ 113,133.90	\$ (257,613)	\$ 370,747	\$ 267,898.00	260%	\$ 281,292.90	274%
Garage 8	\$ 790,814	\$ 596,978	\$ 193,836	\$ 814,538	\$ 217,560	\$ 830,355	\$ 233,377	\$ 869,895	\$ 272,917					
Garage 9	\$ 101,239	\$ 141,626	\$ (40,387)	\$ 104,276	\$ (37,350)	\$ 106,301	\$ (35,325)	\$ 111,363	\$ (30,263)	\$ 141,626	\$ 40,387.00	40%	\$ 42,406.35	42%
Convention Center	\$ 219,207	\$ 673,964	\$ (454,757)	\$ 225,783	\$ (448,181)	\$ 230,167	\$ (443,797)	\$ 241,127.70	\$ (432,836)	\$ 673,964	\$ 454,757.00	207%	\$ 477,494.85	218%
Convention Center SE	\$ 365,155	\$ 49,660	\$ 315,495	\$ 376,110	\$ 326,450	\$ 383,413	\$ 333,753	\$ 401,671	\$ 352,011					
Lot 2	\$ 109,280	\$ 93,846	\$ 15,434	\$ 112,558	\$ 18,712	\$ 114,744	\$ 20,898	\$ 120,208	\$ 26,362	\$ -	\$ -			
Promenade Lot	\$ 152,498	\$ 387,927	\$ (235,429)	\$ 157,073	\$ (230,854)	\$ 160,123	\$ (227,804)	\$ 167,747.80	\$ (220,179)	\$ 387,927	\$ 235,429.00	154%	\$ 247,200.45	162%
Stadium Lot														
Boxcar Lot	\$ 73,896	\$ 219,400	\$ (145,504)	\$ 76,113	\$ (143,287)	\$ 77,591	\$ (141,809)	\$ 81,286	\$ (138,114)	\$ 219,400	\$ 145,504.00	197%	\$ 152,779.20	207%
Lot 3	\$ 8,233	\$ 10,977	\$ (2,744)	\$ 8,480	\$ (2,497)	\$ 8,645	\$ (2,332)	\$ 9,056	\$ (1,921)	\$ 10,977	\$ 2,744.00	33%	\$ 2,881.20	35%
Federal Lot(water tower) Meters	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -					
Fresno Baseball SE Lot	\$ 244,390	\$ 88,703	\$ 155,687	\$ 251,722	\$ 163,019	\$ 256,610	\$ 167,907	\$ 268,829	\$ 180,126					
Mechants Lot														
Kidney Lot														
Chinatown														
Total Off Street Parking	\$ 2,269,926	\$ 2,776,556	\$ (506,630)	\$ 2,338,024	\$ (438,532)	\$ 2,383,422	\$ (393,134)	\$ 2,496,919	\$ (279,637)	\$ 1,187,082	\$ 1,246,436			

	2016 Total Revenue	2016 Expenses	2016 Profit & Loss	33% inc. in revenue (\$0.25 per hour)	less 2016 Expenses	Total Potential Profit	Total Potential Profit Increase (Over 2016)
On Street Meters	\$ 852,306	\$ 284,006	\$ 568,300	\$ 1,133,566.98	\$ 284,006	\$ 849,561	\$ 281,261
Federal Lot Citations/Meters	\$ 105,846	\$ -	\$ 105,846	\$ 140,775.18	\$ -	\$ 140,775	\$ 34,929
Parking Enforcement	\$ 2,269,888	\$ 1,932,302	\$ 337,586	No increase	No increase		
<b>Totals</b>						\$ 990,336	\$ 316,190

Assumes expenses stay the same  
Assumes Parking enforcement fines and revenues remain the same.  
Assumes the on-street meter rates are increased 33% (or \$0.25 per hour)

October 2016  
City of Fresno  
Projected Parking Rate Increase 15%-20%

	2016 Total Revenue	2016 Expenses	2016 Net Operating Budget	Increase in Revenue	Potential Profit & Loss	Increase in Revenue	Potential Profit & Loss	Increase in Revenue	Potential Profit & Loss
Off Street Parking	*Data provided by CoF	*Data provided by CoF	*Data provided by CoF	15%	15%	20%	20%	25%	25%
Garage 4	\$ 102,365	\$ 142,728	\$ (40,363)	\$ 117,720	\$ (25,008)	\$ 122,838	\$ (19,890)	\$ 127,956	\$ (14,772)
Garage 7	\$ 102,849	\$ 370,747	\$ (267,898)	\$ 118,276	\$ (252,471)	\$ 123,419	\$ (247,328)	\$ 128,561	\$ (242,186)
Garage 8	\$ 790,814	\$ 596,978	\$ 193,836	\$ 909,436	\$ 312,458	\$ 948,977	\$ 351,999	\$ 988,518	\$ 391,540
Garage 9	\$ 101,239	\$ 141,626	\$ (40,387)	\$ 116,425	\$ (25,201)	\$ 121,487	\$ (20,139)	\$ 126,549	\$ (15,077)
Convention Center	\$ 219,207	\$ 673,964	\$ (454,757)	\$ 252,088	\$ (421,876)	\$ 263,048	\$ (410,916)	\$ 274,009	\$ (399,955)
Convention Center SE	\$ 365,155	\$ 49,660	\$ 315,495	\$ 419,928	\$ 370,268	\$ 438,186	\$ 388,526	\$ 456,444	\$ 406,784
					\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
					\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
Lot 2	\$ 109,280	\$ 93,846	\$ 15,434	\$ 125,672	\$ 31,826	\$ 131,136	\$ 37,290	\$ 136,600	\$ 42,754
Promenade Lot	\$ 152,498	\$ 387,927	\$ (235,429)	\$ 175,373	\$ (212,554)	\$ 182,998	\$ (204,929)	\$ 190,623	\$ (197,305)
Stadium Lot	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Boxcar Lot	\$ 73,896	\$ 219,400	\$ (145,504)	\$ 84,980	\$ (134,420)	\$ 88,675	\$ (130,725)	\$ 92,370	\$ (127,030)
Lot 3	\$ 8,233	\$ 10,977	\$ (2,744)	\$ 9,468	\$ (1,509)	\$ 9,880	\$ (1,097)	\$ 10,291	\$ (686)
Federal Lot(water tower)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Fresno Baseball SE Lot	\$ 244,390	\$ 88,703	\$ 155,687	\$ 281,049	\$ 192,346	\$ 293,268	\$ 204,565	\$ 305,488	\$ 216,785
Mechants Lot	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Kidney Lot	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Chinatown	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Total Off Street Parking	\$ 2,269,926	\$ 2,776,556	\$ (506,630)	\$ 2,610,415	\$ (166,141)	\$ 2,723,911	\$ (52,645)	\$ 2,837,408	\$ 60,852

	2016 Total Revenue	2016 Expenses	2016 Profit & Loss	33% inc. in revenue (\$0.25 per hour)	less 2016 Expenses	Total Potential Profit	Total Potential Profit Increase (Over 2016)
On Street Meters	\$ 852,306	\$ 284,006	\$ 568,300	\$ 1,133,567	\$ 284,006	\$ 849,561	\$ 281,261
Federal Lot Citations/Meters	\$ 105,846	\$ -	\$ 105,846	\$ 140,775	\$ -	\$ 140,775	\$ 34,929
Parking Enforcement	\$ 2,269,888	\$ 1,932,302	\$ 337,586	No increase	No increase		
<b>Totals</b>						\$ 990,336	\$ 316,190

Assumes expenses stay the same  
Assumes Parking enforcement fines and revenues remain the same.  
Assumes the on-street meter rates are increased 33% (or \$0.25 per hour)