



FINANCE DEPARTMENT

DATE: February 23, 2016

TO: AARON AGUIRRE,
PUBLIC WORKS MANAGER, PUBLIC WORKS/MEDIAN ISLANDS

FROM: BOB CALLISTRO, Supervising Buyer
Purchasing Division

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR MEDIAN ISLAND LANDSCAPE MAINTENANCE
PROPOSAL NO. 3444

Proposals for the above project were opened and recorded on February 24, 2015, should now be evaluated by your Department as part of the selection committee. Attached is an Evaluation of Proposals form which you are requested to complete and return to the Purchasing Division once the Selection Committee Report is finalized.

As background for your evaluation, we are enclosing a copy of canvas of proposal and copies of proposals of all proposals received. Please review the attached proposal and determine whether or not the sole proposer is responsible and is responsive to the intent of the specifications. Where applicable, note asterisk references on the attached Evaluation. If there are any questions, contact Purchasing Division immediately. DO NOT CONTACT ANY OF THE PROPOSERS.

Then complete the Evaluation of Proposals form following this checklist:

- Background section. Describe the reason for the project and include pertinent facts that would be informative to the City Council.
- Recommendation Section. Complete after the selection committee has determined the proposer that can provide best value in meeting the interest of the City and the objectives of the project.
- Signature of Department Head or Assistant Department Head.

The completed Evaluation of Proposals form should be returned to the Purchasing Division as soon as the committee report has been finalized, so we can obtain the City Manager's approval of your determination and post that determination no less than twenty-three (23) working days in advance of the date your department presents your staff report to the City Council.

BC/dr
Attachments



FINANCE DEPARTMENT

DATE: February 23, 2016

TO: AARON AGUIRRE,
PUBLIC WORKS MANAGER, PUBLIC WORKS/MEDIAN ISLANDS

FROM: BOB CALLISTRO, Supervising Buyer
PURCHASING DIVISION

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR MEDIAN ISLAND LANDSCAPE
MAINTENANCE
BID FILE 3444

Please add the following information to your Agenda Item:

Advertisement date of the project in Business Journal	<u>1/27/16</u>
Number of Building Exchanges received Fax Notice Inviting Proposals	<u>8</u>
Number of specs distributed to prospective proposers	<u>14</u>
Date of public proposal opening	<u>2/16/16</u>
Proposals will expire within 120 days of proposal opening:	<u>06/24/15</u>
Number of proposals received	<u>4</u>

Also, any issues will be noted below such as local preference, award issues, etc.

Reminder: Please email your draft Agenda Item to your buyer and the Purchasing Manager in Purchasing for review

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
MEDIAN ISLAND MAINTENANCE - RFP NO. 3444**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Diana Reynolds, Buyer II/Facilitator, City of Fresno, Finance Department– Purchasing
- Aaron Aguirre, Public Works Manager, Public Works - Landscape Division
- Tony Hernandez , Parks Manager, City of Fresno, Parks Department – Planned Maintenance
- Vincent Patlan, Parks Supervisor II, City of Fresno, Public Works - Landscape Division

BACKGROUND

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals seeking experienced vendors capable of providing median island landscape maintenance services. The operator will be responsible for maintaining various areas throughout the City of Fresno.

Proposals were submitted by four (4) vendors responding to the Request for Proposal February 16, 2016 deadline. Below is a summary of Proposals submitted by the four (4) vendors:

Vendor	\$ Proposal
Elite Maintenance and Tree Service	\$304,795.68
All Commercial Landscaping	\$550,148.00
FEOC	\$837,608.00
Clean Cut Landscape	\$811,848.00

COMMITTEE NOTES

Evaluation committee members are in agreement that only one proposer is capable of providing the service listed in the City of Fresno with median island landscape maintenance RFP. While costs were a major contributing factor, the selection was also based on the vendors' written proposals and staffing levels needed to fulfill the scope of work.

During the committee meeting Clean Cut Landscape and FEOC were immediately eliminated from consideration due to their pricing being more than double the projects available budget. While All Commercial's base bid was within the project budget, their entire proposal exceeded the available budget, therefore eliminating them as a viable option. In addition to their pricing the above vendors did not state how they were going to achieve the traffic control requirements, nor did they have a subcontractor listed who could perform the work. With the dangers associated with this project, traffic control was a critical element to the successful vendor's proposal.

Each member agreed that based on the proposals, references and past projects, Elite Maintenance and Tree Service (EMTS) will provide the best value for the City of Fresno. The award will cover the entire City of Fresno Public Works Division's eight listed service areas throughout the City.

Elite Maintenance and Tree Service

The committee unanimously agreed that EMTS will provide the best value to the City of Fresno Public Works' median island landscape maintenance needs. This was reflected in their proposal which illustrated adequate staffing, a certified traffic control vendor, successful performance on past City of Fresno Public Works projects and holding the required contractor's license requested in the RFP. With

over 3.6 million square feet of landscaped medians to maintain, EMTS' experience and organizational structure is in place to meet the requirements set forth in the RFP.

All Commercial Landscaping

The committee felt that All Commercial Landscaping would be able to perform the requirements of this RFP satisfactorily, but their pricing was too high and exceeded the department's available budget. Their pricing was \$150,000 more than the available project budget and ultimately eliminated them from consideration for this RFP. In addition to their price being too high, their proposal lacked details and provided schedules and services they would provide even though that work was not listed in this RFP.

Clean Cut Landscape

The proposer provided a bid to perform the work that was more than double the project's available budget, in addition to leaving critical information out of their proposal. This uncertainty generated some doubt from the committee that the proposer would be able to get the work completed. Their proposal was missing an organizational chart and lacked organizational structure, which essentially made the committee feel as if they would struggle to meet the requirements in the RFP.

FEOC

The proposer also provided a bid that was more than double the project's available budget. Their proposal lacked details and structure on how work would be completed and who would perform the traffic control function. The uncertainty of past work performance generated some uncertainty amongst the committee, but ultimately their price eliminated them from consideration.

RECOMMENDATION:

The committee unanimously agrees and reconfirms their findings that EMTS will be able to provide the most effective median island landscape maintenance services as well as the best value based on their proposal. Therefore, the committee recommends that EMTS be awarded the Median Island Landscape Maintenance contract.