

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE  
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL CUSTODIAL SERVICES AT CITY HALL  
RFP #9289**

**Introduction**

The City of Fresno solicited proposals to provide custodial services at City Hall. Work was to be performed including day and evening shift custodial services, totaling approximately 168,170 interior square feet and exterior areas totaling approximately 44,473 square feet. The contract requires both day and evening shifts weekday staffing; weekend and holiday staffing is limited to the day-shift only. The contract consists of two sections (schedules); Schedule 1: Routine Custodial Work and Supplies and Schedule 2: Project Work Orders. The specifications do not allow splitting schedules, having more than one contract in place would create confusion throughout the City. The term of the contract is three years with two one-year extensions.

**Committee Members:**

Mark Johnson, Facilities Manager, Public Works  
Rene Watahira, Administrative Manager, Police Department Business Division  
Brian Russell Public Works Manager, Public Works  
Eric Schwartz, Management Analyst II, Department of Public Utilities/Water Operations  
Alma Torres, Senior Budget Analyst, Finance Department  
Robin O'Malley, Management Analyst III, Public Works Department/Facilities Management  
Nancy Cabrera, Law Office Assistant, City Attorney's Office  
Jean Thomas-Runnels, Senior Buyer, Purchasing Finance Division – Facilitator

**Evaluation by Committee**

**Recommendation:**

The Committee recommends award of a three-year (3) contract with two (2) one-year extensions to Lincoln Training Center in the amount of \$323,736.72 for City Hall.

Commercial Cleaning Systems of Fresno, CA; Submitted the third lowest price of \$308,460. This proposer is the current supplier for City Hall and service has been inadequate. The proposer has two account managers supposedly assigned to cover City Hall but no one person has been designated on site at a supervisory level. The current contract for service at City Hall is \$311,480.76, which is \$3,021 above the submitted proposal amount. Facilities noted the poor service that City Hall has been receiving and tried to reach a compromise but supplier is only reactionary in their efforts. However, when this proposer is given a direct task service to performed, they complete it efficiently. Service to City Hall has declined and the supplier takes no initiative to service without a direct order. The committee found this proposal complied with all specifications. Their references were checked.

Imperial Maintenance Services, Inc. of Stockton, CA; Submitted the second lowest proposal in the amount of \$268,869.36. However, the committee found this proposal to be non-responsive. The proposer failed to submit the required documentation to validate the signature on behalf of the company being a corporation. The committee had concerns regarding their ability to provide adequate supplies; the proposers stated they would acquire the necessary supplies if awarded the proposal. Their references were checked and found to be acceptable.

Geil Enterprises dba Janitorial Inc. of Fresno, CA; Submitted the lowest price in the amount of \$266,631.84 this proposer also submitted a separate price for 2016 in the amount of \$288,825.72. The committee found this proposal to be in compliance with all the requirements in the RFP. However, the proposer had concerns with the tasks and frequencies specified in the specifications and during their presentation they stated their company would not be able to meet the schedule/frequencies without a change order. The City requested an on-site visit to see one of their customers; the Fresno County Office of Education Building, services appeared to be adequate. Their submitted references were contacted and the responses given for their overall performance was good.

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE  
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL CUSTODIAL  
SERVICES AT CITY HALL  
RFP #9289**

Lincoln Training Center of Fresno, CA; Submitted the third lowest price of. The committee found their proposal to be in compliance with all the requirements of the RFP process. Interviews were held and Lincoln was asked why they didn't submit a proposal for the Various Custodial RFP (9300), which was also bidding during this time. Their reply was, in order to provide the level of quality service to City Hall they could only submit a proposal on one at this time. Since this is the face of the citizens of the City of Fresno, they wanted to start with City Hall. The City then requested an on-site visit; the County of Fresno Brix Mercer Building was visited. This building is over Eighty (80) years old and the building cleanliness was impressive, this being a public high traffic building such as City Hall. According to the County representative, the building was in very poor condition when Lincoln took over the contract 8 months ago and in that time they were able to bring it up to excellent condition. This proposer has been in business over fifty (50) years as a non-profit company who employs people with physical and mental disabilities. They would assign twelve (12) employees to City Hall, with a Site Supervisor monitoring services daily. Taking into account the California Labor Code Sections (1060-1065) Displaced Janitor Opportunity Act; no current employees would lose their positions. The City would have direct contact to managers and staff at all times. Lincoln price submitted reflects new minimum wage requirement and therefore they would not be requesting an increase. Their references were checked and their overall performance was excellent.

Rainbow Brite, of Fresno, CA; Submitted the highest price of \$491,569.68. This proposer met all requirements of the RFP. This proposal was very good and the committee would encourage them to participate in other proposals for this type of service. However, this proposer stressed in order to do any carpet cleaning they would have to outsource since they do not do in house and this would cause a price change. This proposer doesn't have a recycling program in place but stated they could implement one if given the contract. The City requested an on-site visit to see one of their customers; the Fresno Airport Terminal, TSA section; this was a small one office area, no comparison to City Hall. However, the building cleanliness was good. The references were checked and their overall performance was good.

**Conclusion**

Lincoln Training Center submitted the proposal that complied with the specifications, meeting the best interest of the City and the objectives of this project. Their proposal meets all the RFP requirements and offers the best value to the City. This was based on the size of the company, past performances, and ability meet the requirements of the contract. During the proposal evaluation, staff determined that Lincoln Training Center provides the most responsive proposal to the City's needs and requirements. The committee, therefore, recommends award of the contract to Lincoln Training Center of Fresno, CA. in the amount of \$323,736.72 for City Hall Services

Attachments:

Evaluation Matrix

j:\rfp's\9289ch custodial services\9289custodialreportchevaluation committee1-13.docd by proposers

Summary of Information Submitted by Proposers					
PROPOSERS	Commercial	Imperial	Janitorial	Lincoln	Rainbow Brite
<b>CRITERIA</b>					
Monthly Cost	\$25,705.00	\$22,405.78	\$22,219.32	\$26,978.06	\$40,964.14
Yearly Cost	\$308,460.00	\$268,869.36	\$266,631.84	\$323,736.72	\$491,569.68
Ability to meet the stated service requirements	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Past Performance based on Statement of Qualifications	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Conformance to terms of the RFP	comply	comply	comply	comply	comply
Employee Selection, Training and Supervision	comply	comply	comply	comply	comply
<b>PROPOSER QUALIFICATION QUESTIONNAIRE</b>					
Years in business	26	25	14	50	26
Number of employees assigned to City	TBD	12	11	12	11
Reference Check - Completed	1 of 3	1 of 3	2 of 3	1 of 3	2 of 3
Any contract terminations within 3 yrs	None	None	None	None	None
Type of communication system between City & Staff: Minimum all employees provided pagers	24 hour dispatch, Customer Rep, & Mon-Fri: Field Sup, Gen Mngr, Acct Rep.	24-7 cell phones, fax, e-mail,	24-hr Customer care center, 24-hr hot line Account Mangers direct contact	Direct contact to Branch manager & janitors monitored daily by supervisor Periodic task program technology	cell phone; email, texting
Currently possess sufficient inventory to service contract	Yes - maintains inventory to service entire customer portfolio	No - will acquire the necessary supplies to begin contract	Yes	Yes - if given contract can supply	Yes
Firm's vacation and holiday policy	5-days to 15 / 6- Holidays	20/hrs paid after vacation after 1-yr and 40 hrs second year	9- holidays / can request 2-wks off prior to date of time off	10 -holidays per yr / eligible for vac after 90-days probation	11-holidays - 2 wks after 1/yr 5-yrs three wks; 4 wks-15yrs
Employee training program:	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Organization chart of key personnel provided	comply	comply	comply	comply	comply
Organization chart of proposed staffing provided	comply	comply	comply	comply	comply
Photograph of uniforms for employees	comply	comply	comply	comply	comply
Drug and Substance abuse program: Mandatory pre-employ test, Continuous observation	comply	comply	comply	comply	comply
Location	Fresno	Stockton, Ca.	Fresno	Fresno	Lemoore, Ca.
Current City of Fresno Business License	comply	No	Yes	No	Yes
Background Check	comply	comply	comply	comply	comply
Deficiencies/Exceptions		Missing corporate signature authorization	Stated pricing will change based on minimum wage increase (2016)		
Notes - Revised 1/7/15	Current Supplier	Non-Responsive			