

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

Page 1

**FOR: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS REQUIREMENTS CONTRACT FOR LANDSCAPE
MAINTENANCE SERVICES – COMMUNITY FACILITIES DISTRICT NO. 15**

RFP No. 12500184

RFP Opening: 09/24/2024

PROPOSERS

(In alphabetical order)

TOTAL PROPOSAL AMOUNT

- | | |
|--|--------------|
| 1. Briner & Son Inc.
8287 E Olive Ave
Fresno, California 93737 | \$128,586.28 |
| 2. EMTS, Inc.
2972 Larkin Ave
Clovis, California 93612 | \$215,082.15 |
| 3. New Image Landscape Company
3250 Darby Common
Fremont, California 94539 | \$228,045.12 |

Each proposer has agreed to allow the City one hundred twenty (120) days from date proposals were opened to accept or reject their proposal.

DEPARTMENT CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION:

☒ Award a contract in the amount of \$ \$128,586.28
to Briner & Son Inc.
in accordance with the Selection Committee recommendation.

☐ Reject all proposals. Reason:

Remarks:

Department Head Approval



Title Assistant Director

Date 12-18-24

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

Page 2

**FOR: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS REQUIREMENTS CONTRACT FOR LANDSCAPE
MAINTENANCE SERVICES – COMMUNITY FACILITIES DISTRICT NO. 15**

RFP No. 12500184
RFP Opening: 09/24/2024

☒ Approve Dept. Recommendation

☐ Disapprove

☐ See Attachment

☒ Approve GSD/Purchasing Recommendation

☐ Disapprove

GENERAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

CITY MANAGER

 12/26/2024
Purchasing Manager Date

 12/27/24
City Manager or Designee Date

 12/27/24
For General Services Director Date

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
CITY OF FRESNO REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR
LANDSCAPE MAINTENANCE SERVICES – COMMUNITY FACILITIES DISTRICT NO. 15
RFP NO. 12500184**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Vince Patlan, Public Works Manager, City of Fresno, DPW – Landscape Maintenance
- Steve Toles, Superintendent, City of Fresno, DPW – Landscape Maintenance
- Erik Lafon, Project Manager, City of Fresno, DPW – Landscape Maintenance
- Adrian Gonzalez, Supervising Engineering Technician, City of Fresno, DPW – Land Planning and Subdivision Inspection Section
- Joseph Portale, Projects Administrator, City of Fresno, PARCS

FACILITATOR:

- Veronica Maresca, Procurement Specialist, City of Fresno, General Services Department – Purchasing

BACKGROUND

Community Facilities District No. 15 (CFD No. 15), also known as The East Copper River Ranch Maintenance District, funds the maintenance of public improvements, including landscaping services within its boundaries. Located near the northwest corner of East Copper Avenue and North Willow Avenue, CFD No. 15 covers maintenance of landscaped areas, trees, irrigation systems, median island improvements, and park landscaping. This includes tasks such as mowing, edging, fertilizing, pruning, and replacing trees and shrubs, as well as repairing and maintaining irrigation systems. The City of Fresno is responsible for providing these landscaping services, either directly or through contracted third-party providers.

The landscape area is primarily maintained by contractors under City contract and developers, while City crews maintain a small section of public trail. The goal of this RFP is to consolidate all landscape maintenance services into a single, comprehensive package, ensuring a high level of service and preserving the appearance of the area. It is anticipated that the scope of work will grow as development within CFD No. 15 progresses, incorporating new landscape areas into the contract.

This RFP was advertised in both the Business Journal and on Planet Bids on August 2, 2024.

Proposals were submitted by the following three contractors prior to the RFP deadline, September 24, 2024.

Contractor	Final Cost Proposal
Briner & Son	\$128,586.28 (includes add alternate)
EMTS	\$215,082.15 (includes add alternate)
New Image Landscape Company	\$228,045.12 (includes add alternate)

There were subsequent questionnaires and a Best and Final Offer requested on November 22, 2024. The final requested information was received on December 4, 2024.

COMMITTEE NOTES

The goal of the committee was to evaluate the proposals and make a determination as to what would be the best value for the City of Fresno. The committee members evaluated the proposers on 1) Cost as shown on the proposal form, 2) Ability to meet the stated service requirements, 3) Past Performance and Experience based on references, 4) Conformance to the terms and conditions of the RFP, 5) Financial Stability based on information provided on the Statement of Qualifications, and 6) Other related information.

The Committee met three times over the course of approximately two months to evaluate proposals submitted by three separate contractors. The committee meetings were held on 10/16/24, 10/29/24, and 12/09/24. The evaluation process included detailed reviews of all three proposals, discussions about the required service levels, additional requests for information, best and final offer requests, and a thorough vetting process with reference checks.

At the end of the selection process, the committee was unanimous in their decision to recommend Briner & Son for the following reasons:

- **Cost** – Two of the three proposals, from New Image Landscape Company and Elite Maintenance & Tree Service (EMTS), exceeded department estimate parameters. Briner & Son submitted the lowest proposal, which was \$86,495.87 lower than the next lowest proposal, making their proposal especially appealing given the limited funding available from the special tax collection.
- **Ability** – The Committee inquired about the number of individuals dedicated to the contract. Briner & Son offered a larger crew than both New Image Landscape Company and EMTS, which is critical for ensuring adequate service. EMTS's limited two-person team was deemed insufficient for the specified area.
- **Past Performance and Experience** – City staff have previous working relationships with EMTS and Briner & Son. With EMTS, City staff often had to spend considerable time inspecting serviced sites for corrections, leading to repeated service cycle delays. In contrast, Briner & Son, despite some irrigation issues, demonstrated a commitment to improvement and utilized a dedicated work order program for efficient issue resolution. The City staff has no prior experience with New Image Landscape Company.
- **Financial Stability** – All three proposals provided proof of solid company financial positions.

CONTRACTOR PROPOSAL SUMMARIES

Briner & Son (Final Proposal Amount: \$128,586.28) – Briner & Son have past working relationships with City staff and are familiar with the City's policies and procedures for landscape maintenance services. Their cost proposal was within the estimated limits for this contract. Additionally, while not part of the official evaluation criteria, it did not go unnoticed by the Committee that Briner & Son is the only one of the three proposers to be headquartered in the City of Fresno.

EMTS (Final Proposal Amount: \$215,082.15) – EMTS's cost proposal exceeded the contract estimate. The history of working with EMTS has revealed challenges, particularly with their limited

resource allocation, resulting in inadequately maintained landscapes. Their proposed two-person team was deemed insufficient for the contract needs.

New Image Landscape Company (Final Proposal Amount: \$228,045.12) – New Image's proposal exceeded the contract estimate. They did provide a solid proposal with strong references from other cities, showing their experience and ability to do the work. However, their high cost made it difficult to choose them over other proposers.

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION

The Committee carefully and thoroughly considered all aspects of the submitted proposals. Appropriate consideration was given to all criteria set for in the RFP. Ultimately, the Committee determined the Briner & Son proposal represented the best value for the City.