

REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUIREMENTS CONTRACT REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS ZERO EMISSION VEHICLE
TRANSITION PLANNING CONSULTANT

RFP NO. 12302342

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

CLIFFORD TRAUGH – Administrative Manager, General Services Department

DUANE MYERS – Fleet Manager, General Services Department

ANN KLOOSE – Division Manager, Public Works Department

FACILITATOR:

MELISSA PERALES – Purchasing Manager, Purchasing Division

BACKGROUND:

The City of Fresno solicited proposals from qualified consultants to develop a zero-emission vehicle transition plan for the municipal fleet and facilitate compliance with the California Air Resource Board Advanced Clean Fleet Regulation. At the conclusion of the RFP opening, nine consultants submitted proposals as follows:

1. TRC Solutions, Inc	\$147,221.00
2. Black & Veatch Management Consulting, LLC	\$177,300.00
3. AECOM Technical Services, Inc	\$179,458.00
4. ICF Incorporated, LLC	\$150,342.00
5. Matrix Consulting Group	\$93,260.00
6. Joint Venture (SEVT Energy)	\$105,400.00
7. H2B2 Electrolysis Technologies	\$184,155.00
8. Frontier Energy, Inc	\$243,099.00
9. Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc	\$159,242.00

SIGNIFICANT EVENTS:

RFP Release: March 29, 2023

Opening: May 9, 2023

Committee Evaluation: August 14, 2023

EVALUATION COMMITTEE:

TRC Solutions, Inc

Committee members discussed how very well prepared, extremely experienced, and exceptional communicators their entire team was. In addition to providing the most comprehensive responses to all nine questions, their team has more combined experience than the others and they have local ties to the community as well as a former City Manager and City Fleet Manager. They provided very impressive examples of similar work in LA and Fresno County for their fleet transition plans. They demonstrated more hands-on experience and knowledge regarding the California Air Resource Board (CARB) rules, barriers, and opportunities for our planned fleet conversion. In fact, they were able to reach out via text during the interview to ask a subject matter expert for additional real time information regarding the implementation of CARB rules. Their responses to engaging with staff was favorable and extensive and gave a clear picture of what to expect if they were hired. They offered information about their software and modeling tools that was easy to understand. They are very dialed into the auto and vehicle manufacturers, the City's Utility (PG&E) and financial markets.

Black & Veatch Management Consulting, LLC

Much like TRC Solutions, Inc, Black & Veatch also had an experienced team assembled who were all very good communicators and did very well in answering the questions. They provided extensive examples of like work performed including Tucson, Columbus, Clark County NV, and SMUD. They were also very dialed into the CARB requirements and had extensive experience working with PG&E to include being knowledgeable about the delays and challenges faced due to the Utility. They did not seem as favorable to Hydrogen as an option and gave lots of reasons why they wouldn't recommend it. They too seemed to understand the City RFP and the scope of work being requested and were clearly prepared to answer all questions. However, they did spend a lot of time talking about the City's need to also consider resiliency assessments to prepare for planned power outages like PG&E's Public Safety Power Shutoffs (PSPS). They weren't aware that Fresno has never experienced a PSPS event.

AECOM Technical Services, Inc

The team at AECOM Technical Services, Inc did provide some good examples of experience with other public agencies like LAWPC and the County of San Mateo who they are engaged with providing similar work. They also had a good approach to how they would undertake an assessment for incorporating hydrogen into the fleet. There were shortfalls in some of their responses that were of concern and may have indicated a lack of preparation. Their responses were very focused on data entry and data results which may limit them on the other skills needed to develop a plan. Their team also initially did not understand our questions on CARB requirements and timeline concerns. They offered nothing on how the City could deal with these requirements.

ICF Incorporated, LLC

ICF Incorporated, LLC also had a diverse team of individuals; however, they did not appear as prepared in synch or aligned on responses as the other teams of consultants during the question period. Some of their ideas were innovative as far as wanting to add a “DAC equity analysis” and “side by side” grid analysis, however the concern would be that they would add a lot of tasks that could increase the cost of the services. They did not make the case that they were up to all tasks nor that we would have a user-friendly plan that could be implemented at the conclusion of their work.

Matrix Consulting Group

Matrix Consulting Group’s proposal gave us the impression that the company is more focused on the Finances industry, and not as deep into the Emissions industry as the other bidders.

Joint Venture (SEVT Energy)

Joint Venture’s (SEVT Energy) proposal was not as well done, it seemed to lack the depth and effort put in by the other bidders.

H2B2 Electrolysis Technologies

H2B2 Electrolysis Technologies’ proposal was not as well done, it seemed to lack the depth and effort put in by the other bidders.

Frontier Energy, Inc

Frontier Energy, Inc’s proposal was over budget.

Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc

Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc took exception to the City of Fresno Insurance requirements.

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION

The committee unanimously agreed that TRC Solutions, Inc would be the best value and fit for the City’s needs. Therefore, recommends Council award TRC Solutions, Inc a contract not-to-exceed \$147,221 with a contingency of \$10,000, at the City’s discretion based upon performance and adherence to contract requirements.