

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
PRINT AND MAIL SERVICES
(For Utilities, Business Tax, and Animal License)
RFP NO. 9641**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Yvonne Dedmore, Assistant Controller, City of Fresno Finance Department
- Brian Reams, Revenue Manager, City of Fresno Utilities Billing and Collection Division
- Connie Alfaro, Revenue Supervisor City of Fresno Business Tax Unit
- Ryan Whitaker, Central Print Supervisor, City of Fresno Graphic Reproduction Services
- Augustus Krider from the City's Purchasing Division was the facilitator to the Committee

BACKGROUND

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals to provide professional print and mail services to the Utilities Billing and Collections Division and the Business Tax Unit of the Finance Department. The operator will be responsible for print and mail services as per the specifications.

In response to the RFP, proposals were received from nine vendors by the March 22, 2022 deadline.

To evaluate the proposals, an RFP Review Committee (Committee) was created made up of staff from Utilities Billing and Collection, Business Tax, Finance Administration, and Central Printing. The Committee held its first meeting on April 22, 2022. At that meeting, the Committee members evaluated the nine proposers on 1) the ability to meet the stated service requirements, 2) costs as shown on the proposal cost detail, 3) experience with the services described, and 4) other related information provided by proposers. Four of the nine proposals were cost-prohibitive; thus, those vendors were eliminated from further consideration. At the same meeting, the Committee determined that interviews would be conducted with the following five (5) proposers from May 5, 2022 through May 10, 2022: Data Prose LLC, OSG, Infosend, Ray Morgan Company, and Level One LLC. The final Committee meeting to review notes from the interviews and finalize the vendor selection was held on May 17, 2022.

COMMITTEE NOTES

The following are the evaluations of each of the interviewed proposers' bids.

Level One (Total Annual Cost Proposal: \$241,264.00) - The vendor's cost proposal was among the higher offerings. It was also recently acquired by another vendor, causing the Committee to become concerned about the consistency of the services offered.

Ray Morgan Co. (Total Annual Cost Proposal: \$230,744.68) - The vendor's cost proposal was competitive with other proposals. However, its experience with print and mail service was not as extensive as other vendors considered.

OSG Billing Services (Total Annual Cost Proposal: \$275,723.60) -The vendor's cost proposal was highest of the five respondents that were interviewed. Additionally, as the incumbent vendor for the Utilities Billing and Collections Division and the Business Tax Unit, they have not provided

quality service in the past. Finally, OSG Billing Services has a production facility in Tempe, Arizona and headquartered in New Jersey.

InfoSend (Total Annual Cost Proposal \$254,378.00) – The vendor has provided print and mail services for twenty-five years. The committee was impressed by its California location, previous experience with municipalities, technology offerings, and close relationship with the USPS. However, its cost proposal was the second highest of the interviewed proposers.

DataProse LLC (Total Annual Cost Proposal \$206,874.40) - The vendor has provided print and mail services for over thirty years. They have a West Coast Production facility in Sacramento, extensive experience with municipalities, familiarity with the Sungard Naviline and Munis software programs, technology offerings, and close relationship with the USPS made it the preferred vendor. In addition, their cost proposal the lowest offered.

Summary Recommendation- The proposal from DataProse LLC is the best value and the most competitive of the bids. Based on the evaluation criteria, staff determined that DataProse LLC is capable of providing the level of service required to do this project.