

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
MONTHLY LANDSCAPE SERVICES - RFP NO. 9271**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Diana Reynolds, Buyer II/Facilitator, City of Fresno, Finance Department– Purchasing
- Gary Watahira, Purchasing Manager, City of Fresno, Finance Department-Purchasing
- Scott Krauter, Assistant Director of Public Works, Public works/Street Maintenance
- Aaron Aguirre, Public Works Manager, Public works/Street Maintenance
- Tony Hernandez , Parks Manager, City of Fresno, Department of Parks, Recreations & Community Services/Parks Planned Maintenance

BACKGROUND

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals to provide professional monthly landscape services. The operator will be responsible for maintaining various areas through the City of Fresno on a monthly basis.

Proposals were submitted by the four vendors according to the Request for Proposal June 3, 2014 deadline. Below is a summary of Proposals submitted by the four vendors:

| <u>Vendor</u> | <u>\$ Proposal</u> |
|--|--------------------|
| Lincoln Training Center | \$555,543.36 |
| Fresno Economic Opportunities Commission | \$974,149.00 |
| Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. | \$585,162.00 |
| Mow-N-Edge Corp. | \$486,718.27 |

COMMITTEE NOTES

Evaluation committee members were in agreement that all four proposers are capable of providing the City of Fresno with professional landscape services. Therefore, the selection was based on the differences in the vendors' written proposals, and site visits.

In the first committee meeting, FEOC and Mow-N-Edge were eliminated. FEOC currently maintains some areas in the City of Fresno but have had some issues in dealing with the public. Their proposal was found to be too expensive. Mow-N-Edge turned in a proposal that was incomplete and contained

errors in their total amounts that were submitted. The committee narrowed down their selection to two viable candidates: Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. and Lincoln Training Center based on their submitted proposals.

The two remaining proposers were asked to submit a list of locations that they currently service for the committee's inspection. The locations that were selected for inspection were sites that were comparable to the City of Fresno's sites that are listed in this RFP. A visiting team then went out to view the properties and take pictures that were later presented to the committee.

Three sites were visited for Lincoln Training Center. Upon inspection, their sites had weeds and untrimmed bushes. Their employees were using non-commercial equipment. There were no transporting vehicles present. Only one individual was wearing a polo type shirt with Lincoln Training Center's logo.

Two sites were visited from Elite Maintenance & Tree Service's list. The shrubs were trimmed and walkways cleared, the area appeared recently maintained. The company owns professional equipment.

The evaluation committee met and reviewed the findings from the site visits. Each member agreed that based on the site visits, pictures and submitted proposals, Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. will provide the best value for the City of Fresno.

ELITE MAINTENANCE & TREE SERVICE INC.

The committee unanimously agreed that Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. will provide the best value to service the needs of the City of Fresno's landscape sites professionally. This was reflected in their proposal and subsequent site visits which focused on meeting each of the Monthly Landscape Services RFP criteria. The committee was impressed with their solid grasp of the needs of the City of Fresno and their general manager Jamie Rust. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

LINCOLN TRAINING CENTER AND REHABILITATION WORKSHOP

Lincoln Training Center is headquartered in South El Monte, California. They have 19 years of experience in landscaping including experience in janitorial services. Their proposal had a great landscape maintenance service plan but most of their experience seems to be in the janitorial area. They didn't appear to have the ability to meet the demands required of the City of Fresno even though their proposal reflects that they met the RFP criteria. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

FRESNO ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES COMMISSION

The FEOC has provided the City of Fresno with landscape maintenance service for 10+ years with their Local Conservation Corps (LCC) work crews. The committee felt that although the FEOC would definitely be able to perform the requirements of this RFP satisfactorily, their pricing was extremely high. The City of Fresno has had issues in the past with their work crews dealing with the general public, which was reported to the FEOC. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

MOW-N-EDGE CORPORATION

Mow-N-Edge turned in a very unorganized proposal. It lacked detail regarding their company and appeared incomplete in some areas. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

RECOMMENDATION:

The committee unanimously agrees and reconfirms their findings that Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. will be able to provide the most effective and efficient professional Monthly Landscape Services as well as the best value based on their proposal and site visits. Therefore, the committee recommends that Elite Maintenance & Tree Service Inc. be awarded the Monthly Landscape Services contract.