

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
CITY OF FRESNO REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
RODENT CONTROL SERVICES AT VARIOUS FACILITIES AND PARKS - RFP NO.
12301318
(Committee Meetings held on 05-31-23 and 06-15-23)**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Sherri Cuadros, Procurement Specialist/Facilitator, City of Fresno, General Services Department - Purchasing
- Vince Patlan, Public Works Manager, City of Fresno, DPW - Landscape Maintenance
- Michael Flores, Landscape Superintendent, City of Fresno, DPW - Landscape Maintenance
- Brendan Mills, Parks Supervisor II, City of Fresno, PARCS
- Sarah Lambeth, Management Analyst II, City of Fresno, FAX
- Mark Rivas, Senior Management Analyst, City of Fresno, DPW - Streets, Landscape and Graffiti Divisions

BACKGROUND

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals to provide Rodent Control Services to the City of Fresno's Public Works Department, Landscape Maintenance Division. The proposer will provide all labor, materials, equipment, insurance, etc., to provide Rodent Control Services at Various Facilities and Parks as specified.

This RFP was advertised in both the Business Journal and on Plant Bids on April 7, 2023.

Proposals were submitted by the following two vendors according to the Request for Proposal May 16, 2023, deadline. There was a subsequent Questionnaire requested by the two candidates on June 6, 2023. Responses to the Questionnaires are attached. Detailed pricing proposals submitted by the top two candidates are included below:

| ITEM | DESCRIPTION | UOM | QTY | Allied Rodent Control | | EagleShield Pest Control | |
|------|--|----------|-----|-----------------------|--------------------|--------------------------|---------------------|
| | | | | UNIT PRICE | LINE TOTAL | UNIT PRICE | LINE TOTAL |
| 1 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Roeding Park – Exhibit "A" | WEEK | 52 | \$250.00 | \$13,000.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 2 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Kahlra Park – Exhibit "B" | WEEK | 52 | \$45.00 | \$2,340.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 3 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Veterans Memorial Auditorium – Exhibit "C" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 4 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Neilsen Park – Exhibit "D" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 5 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Chandler Park – Exhibit "E" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 6 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Hinton Park – Exhibit "F" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 7 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Inspiration Park – Exhibit "G" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 8 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Regional Sports Complex – Exhibit "H" | WEEK | 52 | \$250.00 | \$13,000.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 9 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Logan Park – Exhibit "I" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 10 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Spano Park – Exhibit "J" | WEEK | 52 | \$45.00 | \$2,340.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 11 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Eaton Plaza Park – Exhibit "K" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 12 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Figarden Loop Park – Exhibit "L" | WEEK | 52 | \$45.00 | \$2,340.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 13 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Orchid Park – Exhibit "M" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 14 | Rodent Control Service - Section I | 1/4 ACRE | 12 | \$85.00 | \$1,020.00 | \$75.00 | \$900.00 |
| | | | | SECTION I: | \$48,600.00 | | \$134,072.00 |
| 15 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Woodward Park – Exhibit "N" | WEEK | 52 | \$250.00 | \$13,000.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 16 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Al Radka Park – Exhibit "O" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 17 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Sunnyside Park & Buffer – Exhibit "P" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 18 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Robinson Park – Exhibit "Q" | WEEK | 52 | \$35.00 | \$1,820.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 19 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Jensen River Ranch – Exhibit "R" | WEEK | 52 | \$250.00 | \$13,000.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 20 | Weekly Rodent Control Service Einstein Park – Exhibit "S" | WEEK | 52 | \$45.00 | \$2,340.00 | \$197.00 | \$10,244.00 |
| 21 | Rodent Control Service - Section II | 1/4 ACRE | 12 | \$85.00 | \$1,020.00 | \$75.00 | \$900.00 |
| | | | | SECTION II: | \$34,820.00 | | \$62,364.00 |
| | | | | TOTALS: | \$83,420.00 | | \$196,436.00 |

COMMITTEE NOTES

The committee members evaluated the proposers on 1) Cost as shown on the proposal form, 2) Ability to meet the stated service requirements, including possessing all necessary pesticide applicator licenses and or certifications, 3) Past Performance and Experience based on references and experience, 4) Conformance to the terms and conditions of the RFP.

Allied Rodent Control (Total Bid Amount: \$83,420.00) – The quote was in line with expectations and because Allied Rodent Control is the City's current vendor, most of the committee was familiar with their performance.

EagleShield Pest Control Inc. (Total Bid Amount: \$196,436.00) – The consensus among the committee members was that while EagleShield Pest Control provided an impressive overall proposal, the pricing proposed was potentially cost prohibitive.

The first committee meeting took place on Wednesday May 31st and was held primarily to confirm both bidders had submitted complete and acceptable proposals, to evaluate and compare the two submissions, and discuss the findings. Allied Rodent Control is the current vendor and several of the committee members reported that they have had positive experience and good results with Allied's service. The committee was unfamiliar with EagleShield Pest Control. Both vendors met the proposal requirements, however, each vendor excelled in different areas of the bid packages. The committee was impressed by the overall professionalism and thoroughness of the EagleShield Pest Control proposal. While Allied Rodent Control was able to provide customized site by site estimates, which resulted in pricing more in line with the Division's expectations in comparison. The consensus from the committee was that a second meeting was required to review feedback from references the two vendors had provided as well as to give both vendors a chance to answer some follow up questions, which the committee decided would be beneficial before a final decision was made.

The second committee meeting took place on Thursday, June 15th. The committee reviewed reference feedback as well as the vendor follow-up questionnaires. Purchasing was able to get three reference checks complete for Allied Rodent Control and two for EagleShield Pest Control. Both vendors were able to supply references with current rodent control service agreements. All references supplied by the vendors provided positive feedback. The follow-up questionnaires were returned by both vendors and the committee was satisfied by the answers provided. There were no red flags that would prohibit either vendor from servicing the City. The committee determined that both vendors provided strong proposals, but the pricing provided by Allied Rodent Control proved to be the key differentiator.

Summary Recommendation – After carefully reviewing both proposals and conducting proper follow-up, the committee unanimously voted to recommend Allied Rodent Control's proposal. Considering all four of the criteria outlined in the RFP, it was clear that both proposals represented a solid solution for the City. However, while this was not a low bid contract, Allied Rodent Control's overwhelming advantage price, a 58% discount over EagleShield Pest Control's proposal, was just too much to overlook. Also, because Allied Rodent Control is the City's current vendor and has provided good service, the committee felt like they provided little risk relative to performance. It's because of these two reasons that the committee feels Allied Rodent Control represents the best value for the City.