REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR ACCESS CONTROL
RFP No. 3813

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

FRANK D VAWTER – Assistant Director, Information Services Department
BRANDON YOST –Information Services Manager, Fresno Police Department
MATTHEW JACOBS – Network Systems Specialist, Information Services Department
SONNY KAVOIAN – Information Services Supervisor, Information Services Department
ZACHARY SERRANO – Cyber Security Manager, Information Services Department

FACILITATOR:

SANDRA GAMEZ – Procurement Supervisor, Department of Finance
JAMES JACKSON – Senior Procurement Specialist, Department of Finance

BACKGROUND

The City of Fresno's (City) Information Services Department (ISD) administers and maintains the City's access control system. This system controls access to controlled doors and gates across the City. Currently the system is used at twelve sites and controls over 254 doors and gates. This has been in place since 2009 and it no longer meets the City's needs. Recommendations received from a security review of City Hall, have prompted ISD to solicit proposals for a replacement system. Working with major stakeholders ISD developed a list of requirements for the design, procurement, installation of, and migration to a replacement system.

In the scoping of our needs for a replacement system ISD, working in conjunction with other major system stakeholders, outlined the following features that we felt were important to our new system and successful integration of this system:

- Maintain support for all existing doors and gates
- Integration with the City's Active Directory system
- Integration with the City's video surveillance system such that access controlled doors with cameras pointed at them be able to marry the video of door being accessed with the identity of the card being used to access the door.
- Reusing as much of the existing hardware and wiring as possible, to minimize costs.
- Role-Based Access Control (RBAC)
- Support for current card and key fob types, as well as modern, more secure, card types.
- Robust reporting

- Ability to meet the unique data cabling challenges at the PD Headquarters and Annex buildings
- On-premises server
- Possible future integration with intrusion detection systems

EVALUATION METRICS

In order to establish what we believe represented best value for the City, the following factors were identified for evaluation:

1. Cost – the reasonableness and competitiveness of the total price for services rendered to the City.

2. Ability to Meet the Stated Service Requirements - the providers' ability to deliver on the stated requirements in the Scope of Work (SOW), based on review of the documents provided, supplemental question (RFP Proposal Questions – separate doc), demonstrations, etc.

3. Past Performance and Experience – based on the references and experiences shown on "Statement of Qualifications and Experience"

4. Conformance to the terms and conditions of the RFP

5. Financial Stability – based on the Statement of Qualifications and Experience.

6. Other related information - aspects of the products or services offered, above the standards of the RFP, that improved the overall value proposition

COMMITTEE NOTES

EKC Enterprises Inc. – EKC's proposal was close to the mean at $538,600.00. Their proposal lacked major features such as integration with Active Directory and, based on provided materials, indicated that integration with the camera system was not a native feature in their software.

HCI Systems Inc. – HCI represented the lowest cost provider, at $283,964.00. However, neither HCI nor their software vendor, was able to demonstrate integration with two key components of our requirements: Active Directory and the Pelco camera system. Further, given HCI's dramatically lower costs as compared to all other competitors and the mean cost, the committee felt that HCI may not have properly scoped the project and would not be able to achieve the desired outcome.

Johnson Controls – Johnson Controls' proposal was the second highest at $612,200. Their proposal represented the most complete solution proposed, integrating with our video systems, laying the foundation for an intrusion detection system integration, and including addressing a variety of wiring challenges at PD HQ and Annex. Further, the

committee felt that the value created by the synergies between their proposed access control system and the City's existing video surveillance platform, both being owned by Motorola, was an important factor.

Netgain Networks Inc. – Netgain Networks' proposed replacement cost of $398,093.41 made them the second lowest bidder. Their proposal included a number of exclusions and limitations which were not consistent with the outcomes that we wished to create with this new system.

Valitus Technologies Inc. – Valitus Technologies' proposal was near the mean at $539,538.29. ISD has worked with their partner, Cosco, on our existing access control system. Upon review of the system staff determined that the user interface for the access control software was not intuitive and that integration with our camera system was not as straight forward as we would have liked.

West Coast Security Inc. – West Coast represented the higher cost provider at $811,370.87, noting that their proposal included 5 years of software maintenance. Their proposal had a number of exclusions that may have resulted in increased cost. At the time of proposal West Coast indicated that an integration with our brand of video surveillance system was not yet available but a priority for them and their access control vendor.

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION

Based upon the bid documents, bidder interviews, demonstrations and reference checks, the committee recommends that the proposal from Johnson Controls be selected for award. The Committee believes that the value proposition in Johnson Controls' bid is the strongest among all proposers. While their price is higher than the median range, our assessment has shown that the products they propose to use, the level of integration with existing systems, their local presence and the corporate relationship between the proposed access control system, and the provider of our video surveillance systems creates meaningful value for the City.