

**EVALUATION OF BID**  
**PROPOSALS**

FOR: THORNE AVENUE WATER MAIN PROJECT

Bid File No.3617  
Bid Opening: 11/12/19

---

<b><u>BIDDERS</u></b>	<b><u>TOTAL NET BID AMOUNT</u></b>
1. West Valley Construction Company, Inc. 2793 S Golden State Boulevard Fresno, CA 93725	\$410,984.00 <i>MP</i>
2. Dawson-Mauldin, LLC 1071 E Nebraska Avenue Selma, CA 93662	\$477,439.00 <i>MP</i>
3. Bill Nelson G.E.C., Inc. 1099 E. Champlain Avenue Suite A, PMB #269 Fresno, CA 93720	\$524,710.00 <i>MP</i>
4. Lyles Utility Construction, LLC 1200 N. Plaza Drive Visalia, CA 93291	\$526,418.00 <i>MP</i>
5. Emmett's Excavation, Inc. 1477 Menlo Avenue Clovis, CA 93611	\$533,072.00 (Nonresponsive) <i>MP</i> (List of Subcontractors does not match Subcontract Information – Detail)
6. Floyd Johnston Construction Co., Inc. 2301 Herndon Avenue Clovis, CA 93611	\$583,956.00 <i>MP</i>

---

Each bidder has agreed to allow the City sixty-four (64) days from date bids are opened to accept or reject their bid proposal. Purchasing requests that you complete the following sections and return this bid evaluation to the Purchasing Unit at the latest by Monday, December 9, 2019 5:00 P.M.

The Engineer's Estimate for this expenditure is \$312,900. The contract price is 31% above the Engineer's Estimate. If the overage is greater than 10% or only one bid was received, give explanation:

The bid amount is 31% above the anticipated Project budget of \$310,000. A review of bid items show the following items had higher than anticipated costs: ductile iron pipe water mains, jack and bore steel casing crossings, traffic control and miscellaneous facilities and operations. The finding of the review is that the bid amounts are generally in line with other recently bid and awarded projects

**EVALUATION OF BID  
PROPOSALS**

Page 2

FOR: THORNE AVENUE WATER MAIN PROJECT

Bid File No.3617  
Bid Opening: 11/12/19

---

**BACKGROUND OF PROJECT** (To be completed by Evaluating Department/Division. Explain need for project/equipment):

The Department of Public Utilities, Water Division has identified approximately 163 linear feet of existing 12-inch water main located in North Throne Avenue, south of West Napa Avenue as being at risk of continued failure. The existing water main that runs under the Union Pacific Railroad (UPRR) right-of-way is unprotected and experiencing repeated failures. This section of water main requires immediate replacement. The proposed replacement water main will be installed within a steel casing, thus protecting the City from a possible UPRR's railway line collapse should a future water main failure ever occur. Relocation of an of 8-inch water main serving 302 North Thorne Avenue will be relocated from UPRR's right-of-way as well, as part of the Project.

**DEPARTMENT CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION:**

Award a contract in the amount of \$ 410,984  
to West Valley Construction, Inc.  
as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder.

Remarks:

Reject all bids. Reason:

**EVALUATION OF BID**  
**PROPOSALS**

FOR: THORNE AVENUE WATER MAIN PROJECT

Bid File No.3617  
Bid Opening: 11/12/19

Department Head Approval

AD

Title Assistant Director

Date 12/24/19

- Approve Dept. Recommendation     Approve Finance/Purchasing Recommendation  
 Disapprove     Disapprove  
 See Attachment

FINANCE DEPARTMENT

CITY MANAGER

[Signature] 12/26/2019  
Purchasing Manager    Date

[Signature] 12/31/19  
City Manager or Designee    Date

[Signature] 12/26/19  
Finance Director    Date

**FISCAL IMPACT STATEMENT**

PROGRAM:

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u>	<u>TOTAL OR CURRENT</u>	<u>ANNUALIZED COST</u>
Direct Cost	<u>\$410,984</u>	<u>                    </u>
Indirect Cost*	<u>\$120,000</u>	<u>                    </u>
TOTAL COST	<u>\$530,984</u>	<u>                    </u>
Additional Revenue or Savings Generated	<u>          \$0          </u>	<u>          \$0          </u>
Net City Cost	<u>\$530,984</u>	<u>                    </u>
Amount Budgeted (If none budgeted, identify source)	<u>\$530,984</u>	<u>                    </u>
<u>*Indirect Costs</u>		
Internal Construction	<u>\$52,000</u>	<u>          0          </u>
Inspection	<u>\$60,000</u>	<u>          0          </u>
Contract Compliance	<u>\$2,000</u>	<u>          0          </u>
Other	<u>\$6,000</u>	<u>          0          </u>