

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

Page 1

FOR: Request for Proposals for Requirements Contract for the Removal, Processing, and Beneficial Reuse or Other Environmentally Friendly Alternative Disposal of Biosolids

RFP No. 12401371

RFP Opening: 01/16/2024

PROPOSERS

(In alphabetical order)

PROPOSAL AMOUNT

1. Denali Water Solutions LLC
220 S. Commerce Ave
Russellville, AR 72801

25,000-50,000 \$48.66/ton
50,001-75,000 \$48.66/ton
75,001-100,000 \$65.00/ton
100,001-125,000 \$69.00/ton

2. Ecology Auto Parts, Inc.
14150 Vine Place
Cerritos, CA 90703

25,000-50,000 \$72.00/ton
50,001-75,000 \$72.00/ton
75,001-100,000 \$72.00/ton
100,001-125,000 \$72.00/ton

3. Holloway Environmental Solutions, LLC
2019 Westwind Drive, Suite B
Bakersfield, CA 93301

25,000-50,000 \$49.50/ton
50,001-75,000 \$48.50/ton
75,001-100,000 \$47.50/ton
100,001-125,000 \$45.50/ton

4. Synagro-WWT, Inc.
435 Williams Court, Ste 100
Baltimore, MD 21220

25,000-50,000 \$58.00/ton
50,001-75,000 \$47.87/ton
75,001-100,000 \$51.24/ton
100,001-125,000 \$53.86/ton

Each proposer has agreed to allow the City one hundred twenty (120) days from date proposals were opened to accept or reject their proposal.

DEPARTMENT CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION:

Award a contract in the amount of \$5,687,500 to Holloway Environmental Services
in accordance with the Selection Committee recommendation.

Reject all proposals. Reason:

Continued to next page

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

FOR: Request for Proposals for Requirements Contract for the Removal, Processing, and Beneficial Reuse or Other Environmentally Friendly Alternative Disposal of Biosolids

RFP No. 12401371
RFP Opening: 01/16/2024

Remarks:

The Evaluation Committee recommends that Holloway be awarded the contract for the full quantity of Biosolids. Holloway provides the most cost-effective option and confirmed their ability to provide high quality and dependable Biosolids removal services to the City. They also meet the requirement of beneficial reuse or other environmentally friendly alternative disposal of Biosolids.

Department Head Approval



Brock D. Buche, PE, PLS
Director of Public Utilities

Date 3/5/2024

Approve Dept. Recommendation

Disapprove

See Attachment

Approve GSD/Purchasing Recommendation

Disapprove

GENERAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

CITY MANAGER


Purchasing Manager 03/18/2024
Date


City Manager or Designee 3/31/24
Date

DocuSigned by:

Brian Barr 3/18/2024
General Services Director Date

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS REQUIREMENTS CONTRACT FOR THE REMOVAL,
PROCESSING, AND BENEFICIAL REUSE OR OTHER ENVIRONMENTALLY
FRIENDLY ALTERNATIVE DISPOSAL OF BIOSOLIDS
RFP NO. 12401371**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

James Jackson, Senior Procurement Specialist, Purchasing Division (Facilitator Only)
Kristina Matthews, Program Manager, Wastewater Management Division
Cory Asher, Wastewater Manager - Certified, Wastewater Management Division
Andrew Heckman, Operations Supervisor, Wastewater Management Division

BACKGROUND:

The goal of this request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals for the removal, processing, and beneficial reuse or other environmentally friendly alternative disposal of biosolids produced at the Fresno-Clovis Regional Wastewater Reclamation Facilities (RWRF). The RWRF has the potential to produce 120,000 wet tons (325 wet tons per day) of biosolids per year. This quantity is contingent upon seasonal fluctuation of incoming loads or different processing technologies. New estimates are showing that production is closer to 125,000 wet tons per year.

EVALUATION BY COMMITTEE:

Denali Water Solutions LLC

Denali has been in business for 28 years. They would exclusively land apply the City's biosolids to one of their registered land application sites in Merced County. The committee is concerned that when land application sites are not operating Denali will not be able to continue service. With no stated alternative option, we are concerned about their reliability to continuously remove our Biosolid. This along with their higher cost makes them not a suitable choice for the City.

Ecology Auto Parts, Inc

Ecology has had a dedicated waste transfer division since 2001. They have long-term partnerships with waste management facilities, composting sites, solid blending projects and land application. There were two different price options one for hauling of biosolids to Liberty Compost Facility (owned by Synagro) and one to Holloway Landfill. They also requested exceptions to the RFP in the areas of Indemnification, Force Majeure, Termination and CPI. Their proposal was the least cost-effective option.

EVALUATION COMMITTEE REPORT - RFP No. 12401371

February 2024

Page 2 of 2

Holloway Environmental Solutions LLC

Holloway is one of the City's current haulers of biosolids and has been in business for 29 years. With their current mine remediation and composite site to come online late 2024 we feel that they can easily handle the City's biosolids volume. The committee agreed that Holloway has the ability to meet all the requirements of the RFP and were the most cost-effective option.

Synagro-WWT Inc

Synagro is also one of the City's current biosolids hauler. They have been in the biosolids management sector for more than 40 years. Synagro owns and operates four compost facilities. The committee finds acceptability in Synagro's proposal yet during their current contract in January they had to reduce the number of loads they were able to pick up from the facility. They stated it was caused by flooding at their site. This led to the City having to temporarily store Biosolids at the facility. Synagro's history of service and price does not make them the best option for the City.

RECOMMENDATION:

The committee recommends that Holloway be awarded the contract for the full quantity of Biosolids. Holloway provides the most cost-effective option and confirmed their ability to provide high quality and dependable Biosolids removal services to the City. They also meet the requirement of beneficial reuse or other environmentally friendly alternative disposal of Biosolids.