

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

FOR: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR CATERING AND CONCESSION SERVICES AT THE FRESNO CONVENTION AND ENTERTAINMENT CENTER

RFP No. 12400335
RFP Opening: 05/16/24

PROPOSERS

(In alphabetical order)

TOTAL PROPOSAL AMOUNT

- | | |
|---|--------------|
| 1. Pardini's Inc.
2257 W. Shaw
Fresno, CA 93711 | See Proposal |
| 2. SMG Food and Beverage, LLC
300 Conshohocken State Road
West Conshohocken, PA 19428 | See Proposal |

Each proposer has agreed to allow the City one hundred twenty (120) days from date proposals were opened to accept or reject their proposal.

DEPARTMENT CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION:

Award a contract at the agreed-upon share of proceeds and a concession management fee of \$5,500 monthly (\$66,000 annually) plus 6.5% of gross concession sales to Pardini's Inc., in accordance with the Selection Committee recommendation.

Reject all proposals. Reason:

Remarks:

Department Head Approval

Signed by:

Ruth F. Quinto

DD41CCEDEDA043D...

Title Asst City Manager

Date 8/21/2024

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

FOR: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR CATERING AND CONCESSION SERVICES AT THE FRESNO CONVENTION AND ENTERTAINMENT CENTER

RFP No. 12400335
RFP Opening: 05/16/24

Approve Dept. Recommendation

Approve GSD/Purchasing Recommendation

Disapprove

Disapprove

See Attachment

GENERAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

CITY MANAGER

DocuSigned by:
Sandra Gamez 8/21/2024
815B08866855486...
Purchasing Manager Date

[Signature] 8/21/24
City Manager or Designee Date

DocuSigned by:
Brian Barr 8/21/2024
9880727517AD479...
General Services Director Date

REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR CATERING AND CONCESSION SERVICES AT THE FRESNO CONVENTION AND ENTERTAINMENT CENTER

RFP NO. 12400335

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

AARON AGUIRRE –Director, PARCS Department

BRIAN BARR – Director, General Services Department

KELLY RAFFERTY – External member with former arena/stadium management responsibilities

MICHAEL ROGERS – Assistant City Manager, Office of the Mayor & City Manager

RUTH F. QUINTO, CPA – Assistant City Manager, Office of the Mayor & City Manager

FACILITATOR:

MELISSA PERALES – Purchasing Manager, Purchasing Division/General Services Department

BACKGROUND:

The City of Fresno solicited proposals from qualified concession service providers to provide food, beverage, and merchandise concession services at the Fresno Convention and Entertainment Center which includes Selland Arena, Valdez Hall, Saroyan Theater, and the Convention Center. The request is for a three (3) year contract with two (2) optional one-year extensions.

The City advertised the RFP on Planet Bids on April 25, 2024, and in the Business Journal on May 3, 2024.

There were 290 potential proposers automatically notified by Planet Bids, five of which downloaded the RFP documents. At the conclusion of the RFP opening, two proposers submitted proposals as follows:

1. Pardini's, Inc.
2. SMG Food and Beverage, LLC dba SAVOR

SIGNIFICANT EVENTS:

RFP Release: April 25, 2024

Opening: May 16, 2024

Committee Evaluation: June 14, 2024

Proposer Interviews: June 17, 2024

Final Committee Selection: June 17, 2024

EVALUATION CRITERIA AS LISTED IN THE RFP:

1. Experience and past performance based on references and information provided.
2. Ability to meet the stated service requirements.

3. Conformance to the terms and conditions of the RFP.
4. Financial stability based on information provided.
5. Ability to prepare and provide a variety of culturally ethnic dishes for a diverse local community or list of caterers you will partner with to prepare and provide Hmong, Indian, Armenian, Mexican, Chinese, and Filipino, other cultural ethnic dishes on a large scale, this would include special meals to meet religious dietic needs.
6. Cost as shown on the proposal form.
7. Other related information.

EVALUATION COMMITTEE NOTES:

Pardini's, Inc.

Pardini's, Inc. (Pardini's) submitted a comprehensive proposal with two fee options, as required by the RFP:

- Option 1 Concession Events:
 - Food & N/A Beverages: 27% of Gross Sales
 - Alcohol: 35% of Gross Sales
- Option 2 Management Fee:
 - Monthly Management Fee: \$5,500
 - Management Incentive Fee: 6.5% of Gross Sales

The committee recommends Option 2.

Pardini's demonstrated a clear capacity to provide the requested services. During the committee meeting, members found Pardini's proposal to be detailed and concise, providing all necessary information for a thorough evaluation.

On June 17, 2024, an interview was held with Pardini's representatives, including the Founder/Chief Executive Officer, the Partner/Chief Operations Officer, and the Partner/Culinary Director. They discussed their proposal in detail and highlighted their staffing abilities along with their positive impact on the local community. Pardini's organization chart showed a stable local workforce of approximately 150 employees, with many having been with the company for multiple years, including higher-level positions, bartenders, wait staff, and event staff. Pardini's also collaborates with a network of preferred local vendors to offer diverse cuisines, demonstrating their commitment to local community engagement. They showcased a strong understanding of the cost proposal and recommended the most suitable option for the contract, aligning with the committee's preferences.

Overall, Pardini's exhibited dedication to the local community, a robust ability to provide the required services, and an in-depth understanding of the City's needs. Their proposal is more cost-effective than SMG's, and the committee believes Pardini's high standards and alignment with the City's objectives make them the best fit for the concession services contract.

SMG Food and Beverage, LLC dba SAVOR

SMG Food and Beverage, LLC dba SAVOR (SMG) submitted one proposal along with two alternative proposals:

- Original Cost Proposal: \$1,290,000.00

- Alternative #1: \$1,325,000.00
- Alternative #2: \$1,850,000.00

Each of SMG's proposals contained varying capital contributions, service fee percentages, and additional contract requirements specific to their terms. During the committee meeting, members discussed several concerns regarding SMG's submission.

Firstly, there were errors identified in the proposals, which raised doubts about their attention to detail. Additionally, Alternative #2 was excluded as it required the City to tie a separate management services contract to this concessions contract, which is not aligned with the RFP requirements or the City's needs. The multiple alternative proposals introduced ambiguity and appeared out of sync with the RFP requirements. SMG's proposal was overly high-level and lacked the detail necessary to accurately assess their operational capabilities.

Furthermore, the committee felt that SMG did not adequately demonstrate their ability to meet the specific service requirements. In the interview held on June 17, 2024, with SMG, only the General Manager attended. It was clear this individual did not have intimate knowledge of the proposal submitted by SMG or the requirements of the RFP. SMG's absence from the interview process was particularly notable, as it indicated a possible disinterest or lack of commitment to securing the contract. The General Manager mentioned plans to source key positions from other cities and states and to use temp agencies for bartenders and wait staff, which did not instill confidence in their ability to provide consistent and reliable service.

Additionally, all three of SMG's cost proposals were significantly higher than those of Pardini's. Overall, the committee concluded that SMG's proposal did not meet the standards and needs outlined in the RFP, making them a less suitable choice for the concession services contract.

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION

The committee unanimously agreed that Pardini's, Inc. offers the best value and fit for the City. They demonstrated a thorough understanding of the City's needs, provided a detailed and clear proposal, and showed strong local staffing and vendor partnerships. Their cost proposal was more competitive and aligned with the City's budget constraints.

Therefore, the committee recommends awarding Pardini's, Inc. a three (3) year contract with two (2) optional one (1) year extensions, at the agreed-upon share of proceeds and a concession management fee of \$5,500 monthly (\$66,000 annually) plus 6.5% of gross concession sales.