

City of Fresno

*City Hall
2600 Fresno Street
Fresno, CA 93721*



Meeting Minutes - Final

Monday, April 25, 2022

6:00 PM

Regular Meeting

**In Person and/or Electronic
Room 2165N (Conference Room A)**

Historic Preservation Commission

Chair - Jason Hatwig, LEED, AP, BD C

Vice Chair - Robin Goldbeck

Commissioners:

Christopher Rocha, Paul Halajian, AIA; Don Simmons, PhD; M.A.;

James Sponsler;

Staff:

Jennifer Clark, Director; Mary Raterman-Doidge, Senior Deputy City Attorney; Alicia C. Gonzales, Historic Preservation Specialist; Janice

Monroe, M.A. II

PUBLIC ADVISORY

THE CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND CITY HALL WILL BE OPEN TO THE PUBLIC AT A LIMITED CAPACITY.

THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION WELCOMES YOU TO ROOM 2165A, LOCATED IN CITY HALL, 2ND FLOOR, 2600 FRESNO STREET, FRESNO, CALIFORNIA 93721.

The meeting can also be viewed live at 6:00 P.M. on Comcast Channel 96 and AT&T channel 99.

Chambers, located in City Hall Room 2165A, are open for public participation.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate electronically because of reduced capacity of seating in the Chambers to allow for social distancing. Masks will be required for the vaccinated and unvaccinated.

Pursuant to the Executive Order, and in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in the Commission meeting, please contact the City Clerk's Office, 559-621-7650 within 48 hours of the meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The following options are available for members of the public who want to attend and /or address the Historic Preservation Commission:

1. eComment at <https://fresno.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>.

a) eComments is a tool for citizens to use to make comments on agenda items. It will be closed at the start of the meeting and will be a part of the official record. The User Agreement and Procedures document for eComment can be accessed by the URL <https://www.fresno.gov/cityclerk/>

b) eComments will be a maximum of 450 words.

OR

2. You are invited to a Zoom webinar.

a) If you would like to speak on an agenda item, you can access the meeting remotely from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone, or Android device.

Please use URL: <https://zoom.us/j/95457849931>

b) Those addressing the Commission must state their name and address for the record.

OR

3. Join by Phone

a) Dial:

US: 1 669 900 9128

Enter Webinar ID: 954 5784 9931

b) Those addressing the Commission must state their name and address for the record.

OR

4. Email

a) Attendees may also email comments to mike.sanchez@fresno.gov to be read during the meeting. Please include the agenda date and item number you wish to speak on in the subject line of your email (e.g., January 25, 2021 - Item A). And, please include your name and address for the record at the top of the body of your email.

b) Emails are not to exceed 150 words.

c) All comments received will be distributed to the Commission prior and during the meeting and will be a part of the official record.

Any interested person may appear at the public hearing and present written testimony, or speak in favor or against the matters scheduled on the agenda.

If you challenge these matters in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues you or someone else raised in oral or written testimony at or before the close of the hearing.

The City of Fresno thanks you in advance for taking all precautions to prevent spreading COVID-19 virus.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

At 6:03 PM the meeting was called to order by Chair Jason Hatwig.

Also present were Director of Planning and Development, Jennifer Clark, Senior Deputy City Attorney Mary Raterman-Doidge, Historic Preservation Specialist, Alicia Gonzales, and Management Analyst II, Janice Monroe.

Present 5 - Chair Jason Hatwig, Vice Chair Robin Goldbeck, Commissioner Christopher Rocha, Commissioner Don Simmons, and Commissioner James W Sponsler

Absent 1 - Commissioner Paul Halajian

II. PROCEDURES - PROCEDIMIENTOS - KEV SAB LAJ

For each matter considered by the Commission, there will first be a staff presentation, followed by a presentation from the project applicant. The Commissioners will then have the opportunity to ask questions of Staff and Applicant before opening to Public. Testimony from supporters of the project will then be taken, followed by testimony from those in opposition. Staff may provide a summation, if necessary. The applicant will have the right to a final rebuttal presentation prior to closing the public hearing, followed by consideration of the item and action, if any, by the Commission.

In accordance with section 13 of Article 2 of the Historic Preservation Commission Bylaws governing length of public debate, all public testimony from those in support and in opposition of the project will be limited to three minutes per person. All public testimony must be presented to the Commission at the podium (in person / electronically). Any testimony that references race, religion, ethnicity, economic status, national origin, or any other classification protected under state or federal law in a derogatory manner shall be deemed irrelevant and will not be considered by the Commission in making its determinations.

If you challenge these matters in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues you or someone else raised in oral or written testimony or before the close of the hearing.

III. APPROVE MEETING MINUTES

III-A [ID 22-591](#) March 28, 2022 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

6:06pm

On motion of Commissioner Sponsler, seconded by Vice Chair Goldbeck, that the above MINUTES have be APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chair Hatwig, Vice Chair Goldbeck, Commissioner Simmons and Commissioner Sponsler

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Halajian

Abstain: 1 - Commissioner Rocha

IV. APPROVE AGENDA

6:07pm

On motion of Commissioner Simmons, seconded by Vice Chair Goldbeck, the above AGENDA was APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Hatwig, Vice Chair Goldbeck, Commissioner Rocha, Commissioner Simmons and Commissioner Sponsler

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Halajian

V. CONSENT CALENDAR

N/A

VI. CONTINUED MATTERS

N/A

VII. COMMISSION ITEMS

6:08PM

VII-A [ID 22-573](#) HEARING TO CONSIDER Application P22-01285 for revisions to the Casa Di Fortuna residential complex which include the preservation of original historic wall features of the Jose Garcia Brewer Adobe building located at 5860 W Santa Ana Avenue (HP # 227) (APN 51054020).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) take the following actions:

1. **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** of revised exhibit Application P22-01285 for the revisions to the Casa Di Fortuna residential complex

which include the preservation of original historic wall features of HP# 227 the Jose Garcia Brewer Adobe, subject to the following conditions of approval:

- a. Any proposed thematic interpretive material, memorabilia, artifacts, plaques, or historical displays associated with the historical walls will be reviewed by the Historic Preservation Specialist prior to its installation.
- b. Staff will be allowed to photograph before, during and upon completion of the project; and
- c. Any changes to the approved project will be submitted to the Historic Preservation Specialist prior to the commencement of any related work.

6:08PM

Rick Ransom (engineer) & Ian Robertson (architect) were present and available for comment/question.

Commissioners and Staff discussed the need to change the status of the local registry from a historic resource to a historic monument now that a building would no long be in place. Director Clark explained that after HPC recommends mitigation measures and entitlement is complete the Commission can update the listing. Senior Deputy Raterman-Doidge noted that the item would return to the Commission for this change.

On motion of Commissioner Rocha, seconded by Vice Chair Goldbeck, that the above Action Item be APPROVED AS AMENDED.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Hatwig, Vice Chair Goldbeck, Commissioner Rocha, Commissioner Simmons and Commissioner Sponsler

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Halajian

VIII-B [ID 22-592](#)

CONTINUE TO MAY 23, 2022
HEARING TO CONSIDER AND MAKE FINDINGS on applications B22-03490 for the removal, reroof and roof mounted solar installation to the Ed & Chrissie Riggins Home a Contributing Resource to the Wilson Island Historic District located at 655 E. Pine Avenue (APN 45111107).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) take

the following actions:

1. **ADOPT** a finding of Categorical Exemption pursuant to Sections 15301/Class 1 and 15303/Class 3 of the California Environmental Quality Act guidelines
2. **APPROVE**: Application B22-0349 for the removal and reroof the Ed & Chrissie Riggins Home a Contributing Resource to the Wilson Island Historic District located at 655 E. Pine Avenue (APN 45111107).
3. **APPROVE**: Application B22-04126 for the installation of roof mounted solar to the Ed & Chrissie Riggins Home a Contributing Resource to the Wilson Island Historic District located at 655 E. Pine Avenue (APN 45111107), subject to the following conditions of approval:
 - a. Applicant will revise to the scope of work and roof plan to ensure that no solar panels are installed on the primary roof which is visible from the public-right-of way on E. Pine Ave.
 - b. Staff will be allowed to photograph before, during and upon completion of the project; and
 - c. Any changes to the approved project will be submitted to the Historic Preservation Specialist prior to the commencement of any related work.

6:22 PM

Staff continued item to May, 23, 2022 meeting

- VII-C** [ID 22-565](#) HEARING TO CONSIDER Application B22-02948 for the façade renovations to HP# 292 the Fresno Daily Expositor building located at 1031 Fulton St. (APN 46621304).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) take the following actions:

1. **ADOPT** a finding of Categorical Exemption pursuant to Section 15331 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation) of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines.
2. **APPROVE**: Application B22-02948 for the façade renovations to HP# 292 the Fresno Daily Expositor building located at 1031 Fulton St. (APN 46621304) subject to the following conditions of approval.
 - a. Staff will be allowed to photograph before, during and upon completion of the project; and

- b. Any changes to the approved project will be submitted to the Historic Preservation Specialist prior to the commencement of any related work

6:22pm

Shaunt Yemenjian (architect) and Henry Liu (property owner) were present and available for comment/question.

Applicants discussed the history of the building and scope of work. Due to the extent of job, cost of reconstruction is anticipated to exceed the originally predicted budget. They asked the Commission for any available resources for financial assistance while they solidify the costs of the project. Chair Hatwig reminded the applicants that if they need to change the plan for the facade they would have to return to the Commission.

On motion of Commissioner Sponsler, seconded by Commissioner Rocha, that the above Action Item be APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Hatwig, Vice Chair Goldbeck, Commissioner Rocha, Commissioner Simmons and Commissioner Sponsler

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Halajian

- VII-D** [ID 22-566](#) STAFF UPDATE regarding re-roof application B22-03167 of the Gregory Home, a Porter Tract Historic District Contributing Resource (HD# 7), located at 1011 E. Yale Ave. (APN 44408416).

6:45pm

Gonzales explained the application was approved at Director's discretion.

- VII-E** [ID 22-577](#) REVIEW AND COMMENT on the revisions to the design proposal and treatment for the Belmont Overcrossing for the California High Speed Rail (CHSR) pursuant to FMC Section 12-1606 (5) and 12-1606 (5.1).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) take the following actions:

1. **Comment** on revisions to the design proposal and treatment for the Belmont Overcrossing for the California High Speed Rail pursuant to FMC Section 12-1606 (5) and 12-1606 (5.1).
 - a. Historic Preservation and Public Works will be allowed to photograph before, during and upon completion of the project; and
 - b. Any changes to the approved project will be submitted to the Historic Preservation Specialist prior to the commencement of any related work.

6:46pm

Ashley Katchadourian (contractor representation for HSR) presented a rendering and retaining wall schematic.

Chair Hatwig recounted sitting on a previous subcommittee with Halajian to prepare the design of High Speed Rail. Simmons recognized the efforts made for the residents in the treatment of the walls. Commissioners requested more information on the barriers and Katchadourian answered their questions.

A member of the public, Matthew Woodward, asked about the grade of the road in Katchadourian's schematics and she explained it was 6%.

- VII-F** [ID 22-511](#) WORKSHOP on the reconstruction of the Abacus, previously located at Guarantee Savings & Loans (CitiBank) located 4191 N Blackstone Avenue (APN 43409202).

7:09pm

Farrell Martin (consultant) offered a revised plan and remained available for comment/question.

Commissioners supported the proposed vegetation (real & faux) and suggested changing the color of fence and potentially increasing the setback of fence to 12-18 inches from abacus.

- VII-G** [ID 22-574](#) STAFF UPDATE on Regular Monthly Topics:
1. Current & Proposed Historic District Updates
 2. Demolition/Repair Updates

3. Economic Incentives

7:25pm

1. *Commissioner Simmons requested the complete list Proposed Historic Districts to confirm properties beyond the recent Priority List. Commission discussed the need to update all expired survey information. Director Clark reported there has been no progress to the Proposed Historic Districts due to the increase in regular Building applications. Commissioners voiced concerned with the prolonged status of the HPC approved Proposed Armenian District waiting for City Council's recommendation. Raterman-Doidge suggested reaching out to individuals' councilmembers and/or mayor. Clark suggested next meeting the Commission discuss what they would like Staff to bring to Council.*

2. *Gonzales updated on demolition at American Self Storage Company (HP#100) and Chaffee Zoo.*

3. *Gonzales updated on current status of Mitigation Fund Applications and reminded that Mills Act Applications are due by 5/1/2022.*

VI-H [ID 22-594](#) STAFF UPDATE on Code Enforcement case# E19-09827, located at 319 N Calaveras St. (APN 45915208).

7:50pm

Multiple Commissioners admitted to reporting the infraction to Code Enforcement and noted that only 2 of the 4 windows were replaced. Commissioners voiced concern for the inconsistent enforcement with similar locations nearby.

Due to several experiences of property owners unaware of the Historic status of their property, the Commission suggested increasing educational opportunities for the new property owners when purchasing a Historic property, as well as offering a workshop for realtors in Historic Preservation Month. Commissioner Rocha suggested increasing the accessibility of Historic Plaques.

VIII. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

N/A

IX. UNSCHEDULED ITEMS

8:02pm

IX. - A. Members of the Commission

Commission Simmons acknowledged Commissioner Rocha's recent marriage at a Historic property.

Commissioners formed a subcommittee (Rocha and Sponsler) for identification of historic resources other than a plaque to increase awareness of general public and increase community pride.

Commissioners discussed an appreciation that the City was showing an interest in buying historic properties such as the Tower Theatre, but wanted increased attention to their existing properties. They reported concern that the burden is placed on non-profits rather than the City.

IX. - B. Staff

Clark reported that emails would go out to the Commission soon about fun events for Historic Preservation month available to HPC and the public.

IX. - C. General Public

N/A

X. NEXT MEETING

5/23/2022

XI. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned at 8:13pm.

2022 HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULE

JANUARY 24, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
FEBRUARY 28, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
MARCH 28, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
APRIL 25, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
MAY 23, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
JUNE 27, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
JULY 25, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
AUGUST 22, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
SEPTEMBER 26, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
OCTOBER 24, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
NOVEMBER 28, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING
DECEMBER 26, 2022- 6:00 P.M. MEETING