

Procurement Evaluation Form

Procurement Title: RFP RC for Radial Tire Leasing

Advertisement Date: 5/19/2025

Opening Date: 6/17/2025

Bid/Proposal Expiration Date: 10/15/2025

Number of Building Exchanges Notified: 2

Number of prospective bidders/proposers: 11

Format of bids received: Electronic

	<u>Bidders/Proposers</u>	<u>Amount</u>
1	Bridgestone Americas Tire Operations, LLC 200 4 th Avenue South Nashville, TN 37201	Original: \$1,379,799.17 Best & Final: \$1,314,607.47
2	Michelin North America, Inc. One Parkway South Greenville, SC 29615	Original: \$1,706,452.26 Best & Final: 1,646,640.34

Additional Information	Applicable	Not Applicable	Comments
Project Labor Agreement (PLA)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Local Preference	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Non-Responsive Findings	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Special Contract Terms (i.e., RC)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	3-year contract with (2) one-year optional extensions
Min/Max Terms	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Minimum total tire mileage shall be 175 million over the life of the contract. Maximum total tire mileage shall be 225 million over the life of the contract.
DBE Requirements	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	

Disadvantaged Business Enterprise Program Evaluation Analysis

The City of Fresno is committed to ensuring equal opportunity in its contracts and encourages the participation of Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBEs) and small businesses in all projects. Below is an evaluation of the recommended bidder/proposer's efforts to include DBEs in this contract.

A. Bidder/Proposer Outreach Efforts to DBEs and Small Businesses

A race-neutral approach was taken for this project, and no contract goal was applicable.

B. Items of Work Made Available to DBEs and Small Businesses

N/A

C. Responses and Consideration of DBE/Small Business Quotes

Per the completed DBE Bidders List:

- *Bridgestone Americas Tire Operations LLC: One non-DBE subcontracted listed*
- *Michelin North America Inc: No subcontractors listed*

D. Collaboration with Agencies, Organizations, or Groups

Bridgestone Americas Tire Operations LLC: Advertises for minority services and maintains an active listing of viable firms (ie APTRA Passenger Transport, SBA, and World Wide Minority Business Network)

Michelin North America Inc: Information not available

E. Information Sharing

N/A

F. Subcontractor Information (if applicable)

N/A

G. Contract Goal (If applicable)

N/A

By signing below, the DBE Coordinator confirms the recommended bidder/proposer is compliant to the DBE requirements and recommends awarding the contract:

Szarina Lozano
DBE/Small Business Coordinator

8/26/2025
Date

ngperal
Purchasing Manager

09/02/2025
Date

SELECTION COMMITTEE REPORT

For

RFP 12502217

Radial Tire Leasing Services



August 2025

Prepared by:

**Sharlee Flores, Senior Management Analyst
Department of Transportation/Fresno Area Express
2223 G Street
Fresno CA, 93706**

Selection Committee Sign-Off

The following Selection Committee voting members have read the enclosed report and concur with the findings as written:


Gus Sandate
Equipment Supervisor
Department of Transportation
Richard Baldon
Project Manager
Department of Transportation
Sandy Tawana-Dhillon
Management Analyst II
Department of Transportation

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

To support fleet operations and provide safe, reliable service to passengers, the Department of Transportation/Fresno Area Express (FAX) sought to establish a contract with a tire supplier for the leasing of transit radial tires, as well as tire maintenance services for our fixed-route bus fleet. A Request for Proposals (RFP) solicitation was prepared and advertised to perspective bidders on May 19, 2025. Copies of the specifications were requested and distributed to eleven (11) prospective proposers.

FAX included the following criteria to assess proposals:

- Past Performance and Experience: [35%]
- Price: [30%]
- Technical Approach and Reporting: [20%]
- Knowledge and Approach of Required Regulations [15%]

On June 17, 2025, FAX received two (2) proposals which were reviewed and deliberated by the Selection Committee. The results of the Selection Committee's evaluation are as follows:

Overall Scoring	
Bridgestone	Michelin
89	93

As Michelin received the highest overall average score, the Selection Committee unanimously recommends them for award of RFP 12502217, *Radial Tire Leasing Services*.

II. FACILITATORS & COMMITTEE MEMBERS

SHARLEE FLORES	<i>Committee Chair / Facilitator (Non-Voting)</i>
TAMRA TORRENCE	<i>Senior Procurement Specialist, Co-Facilitator (Non-Voting)</i>
STEFANEE RAMIREZ	<i>Advisor (Non-voting)</i>
GUS SANDATE	<i>Committee Member (Voting)</i>
RICHARD BALDON	<i>Committee Member (Voting)</i>
SANDY TAWANA-DHILLON	<i>Committee Member (Voting)</i>

III. SIGNIFICANT EVENTS

May 19, 2025 – Solicitation Posted
June 17, 2025 – Proposals Due
June 26, 2025 – Committee Meeting
July 21, 2025 – Committee Meeting
July 31, 2025 – Negotiations
August 8, 2025 – Negotiations

IV. EVALUATION CRITERIA

The Selection Committee evaluated the proposal based on five categories:

Past Performance and Experience: [35%]

The contractor's experience and history in radial tire leasing services relevant to FAX's needs. Including direct experience on projects of similar size, scope, and complexity. This may include client references, thoroughness, or any awards or recognition received for past performance.

Price: [30%]

Pricing score is based on the lowest price in relation to the price offered.

Technical Approach and Reporting: [20%]

Approach to quality and comprehensive inspection/testing plans, quality assurance procedures and response time capabilities and procedures. Proposers reporting approach, including documentation and data-tracking systems such as online report access capability as well as data collection and presentation.

Knowledge and Approach of Required Regulations [15%]

Proposer demonstrates knowledge of all required regulations and approach to meet regulations. Team members/tire technicians have relevant certifications and training. Certifications from recognized organizations demonstrating a commitment to staying up to date with regulations and industry standards. Drug and alcohol testing program is FTA compliant.

The criteria scoring is as follows:

PAST PERFORMANCE AND EXPERIENCE		
Proposer	Comments	Criteria Score
Bridgestone	The Proposer demonstrated good experience and has many contracts of similar size and scope, but lacked feedback from references.	28
Michelin	The Proposer demonstrated great staff experience and explained training in detail. Great detail provided to substantiate ability to meet FAX's needs.	34

TECHNICAL APPROACH AND REPORTING		
Proposer	Comments	Criteria Score
Bridgestone	The Proposer did not demonstrate technical approach or reporting well because most responses stated, "will share upon request".	17
Michelin	The Proposer demonstrated great detail in technical approach and reporting methods.	20

KNOWLEDGE AND APPROACH OF REQUIRED REGULATIONS		
Proposer	Comments	Criteria Score
Bridgestone	The Proposer provided detailed responses for some of the questions, but left some vague responses for approach.	14
Michelin	The Proposer detailed approach and understanding of required regulations well. Has a dedicated team solely responsible for discovering new technologies. Staff trainings were described well.	15

PRICE
The scoring for price was based on the lowest price in relation to the offered price. The formula is as follows: $\text{Price Scoring} = \text{lowest price/offered price} \times 100 \times 30\%$ The results are as follows: Bridgestone Criteria Score – 30 Michelin Criteria Score – 24

V. NEGOTIATIONS

The Selection Committee recommended negotiations to allow minor change to the contract's General Commercial Liability policy (with approval from the City's Risk Management Department) and requested best and final offers from both vendors. Negotiations were held with both vendors and an additional request for an approved equal was granted regarding tire size. Both vendors provided lowered pricing in their best and final offers.

VI. OVERALL SCORES

The overall scores for the proposers are as follows:

Overall Scoring	
Bridgestone	Michelin
89	93

VII. RECOMMENDATION

After independent evaluation of the proposals and group deliberation, the Selection Committee determined that Michelin meets the interest of the City and the objectives of the services. The committee recommends awarding a three-year contract, with options for two (2) one-year extensions to Michelin for a total not to exceed \$1,646,640.34 for the three base years of the contract. The two (2) one-year optional extensions will be tied to a PPI for yearly increases, but the total will not exceed \$3,000,000 for the five possible years.

Department Recommendation

(To be completed by the Department)

Background *(Explain the need for the procurement below.)*

FAX operates a fixed-route bus fleet of 138 heavy-duty compressed natural gas (CNG) battery electric buses (BEBs), and hydrogen fuel cell electric buses (FCEBs), which provide 363 days of transit service to the residents of the City and County of Fresno each year, accruing over 34,000,000 vehicle miles. Having an effective tire maintenance and replacement program is critical to ensuring bus safety and reliability. It is also a large cost component of bus maintenance; therefore, FAX follows the industry practice of leasing from a qualified tire supplier. The lease structure is based on the aggregate mileage accrued by the fleet, and a multi-year contract is used to provide continuity of service and quality.

☒ Award a contract as follows:

Bidder/Proposer	Award Amount
Michelin North America, Inc.	Not to exceed \$3,000,000 for a total of five possible years.

The Budget Allocation for this expenditure is \$479,900 for the first year, and will escalate annually at a rate of 10% per year for future years, for a total of \$2,929,837 across 5 years. The contract price is not to exceed \$3M, which is 2.34% above. *(If the overage is greater than 10% provide an explanation below.)*

☐ Reject all bids/proposals. *(If electing to reject all, provide an explanation below.)*

Anticipated Council Date: 9/25/2025

Fiscal Impact Statement
(To be completed by the Department)

Indicate the **total fiscal impact** of the action requested, including operating and capital costs. Indicate costs for the current fiscal year and continuing costs in future years. Include all related costs.

Is the contract funded in the current year budget and/or through reallocation of existing Department resources:

☒ Yes ☐ No

If no, how will this item be funded? (Provide an explanation below.)

N/A

Is the action funded by a grant received by the City?

☒ Yes ☐ No

If yes, provide the following:

Additional Information	Comments
Grant Name	FTA Program 5307 annual allocation
Grantor name, granting agency, or office name (if any)	Department of Transportation – Federal Transit Administration
Fiscal year of the funding award	Allocation – federal fiscal year 2025 (and ongoing annually)
Date grant agreement was approved by Council	Master agreement and annual certifications and assurances attested by CAO 6/10/25.

Fiscal Impact Table:

Type	Current Year Estimate	Annual Continuing Costs Thereafter	Number of Years
Operating	\$530,199.87	\$2,469,800.13 (4 years)	5
Capital	\$0	\$0	0
Total	\$530,199.87	\$2,469,800.13	5
Describe all 'soft-cost' expenses: N/A			
Annual costs are budgeted to increase at a rate of 10% annually, over the 5-year contract term. Total for annual continuing costs shown above include 4 contract years.			

Approvals

The signature below constitutes approval from the department head.



Department Head

Director

Title

8/29/2025
Date

The signatures below constitute approval of the department recommendation.



Purchasing Manager

09/02/2025
Date



for BB
General Services Department Director

9/2/25
Date



City Manager

9/4/25
Date