

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE  
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR  
PROFESSIONAL INVENTORY SERVICES  
RFP NO. 10090**

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

ORIE RUBALCAVA – Senior Management Analyst, Fresno Area Express  
JOSEPH BURGEM – Chief of Facilities, Fresno Area Express  
ELIZABETH TORRES – Accountant-Auditor I, Fresno Area Express  
MELISSA GARZA-PERRY, Airports Property Manager, Fresno Yosemite Airport

**BACKGROUND**

Fresno Area Express (FAX) seeks a one-time service for the physical inventory of real property and equipment under FAX's control to satisfy the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) requirements of satisfactory continual control of federally funded assets.

**SIGNIFICANT EVENTS**

December 31, 2021 – Proposal Release  
February 28, 2022 – Proposal Opening  
March 1, 2022 – Reference Check  
March 7, 2022 – Committee Discussions  
March 10, 2022 – Committee Discussion with Bureau Veritas  
March 14, 2022 – Committee Final Evaluation

**EVALUATION CRITERIA**

FAX's solicitation included the following four evaluation criteria ranked in order of relative importance:

**1. Approach to Scope of Services**

- Approach to provide services as noted in *Appendix A*, Statement of Work
- Project Management Plan including inventory approach, methodology, and management, supervisor, auditor and counter instructions, and document control procedures
- Type of supervision and manner of direction to be exercised over staff
- Quality Control and Reporting Plan confirming Contractor's ability to provide the necessary Inventory Reports
- Deployment Strategy

**2. Company Qualifications, Experience & References**

- The firm's past experience and performance on comparable/similar inventory engagements
- References of recent clients for similar services

### **3. Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel**

- The professional, technical, and managerial qualifications and experience of Key Personnel named in the Proposal
- Demonstrated experience in providing the specified services for similar operations and/or entities, including comprehensive knowledge of the requirements, procedures, regulations and protocols pertaining to the physical inventory service as evidenced by resumes and client references.

### **4. Reasonableness of Cost**

- This portion of the proposal will be evaluated based on reasonableness of the proposed costs. Costs will be compared to costs the Agencies or other comparable public agencies have paid for similar services, and to what is considered to be the industry's standard and customary costs for the services. Proposed costs will also be compared to any independent cost estimates.

## **COMMITTEE NOTES**

**Bureau Veritas** – This company currently performs an array of management services to include inventory count. Bureau Veritas has demonstrated through its knowledge of FTA requirements and experience working on like projects that it provides best value to the City of Fresno. The proposer took no exceptions to the solicitation's terms and conditions.

**Grant Thornton** – This company currently performs an array of management services to include inventory count. Grant Thornton has demonstrated it has had numerous experiences with inventory counts and some experience with transit agencies. Overall, the committee did not believe the proposer had more like experience than its competitor. Grant Thornton did take exception to the solicitation's terms and conditions.

## **SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION**

The committee agreed that Bureau Veritas should be awarded this contract. Although, the two vendors both had exceptional qualifications, Bureau Veritas' transit experience on like projects and intimate knowledge of FTA requirements, provides the best value to the City of Fresno.