

MEETING MINUTES
HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION (HCDC)

December 14, 2016
Fresno City Hall, Room 2165-A (2nd Floor)
2600 Fresno Street, Fresno, California 93721

Commission Members Present:

Barbara Fiske, Chairperson
Brad Hardie, Vice Chairperson
Marina Harutyunyan, Commissioner
Debra McKenzie, Commissioner
Bob Reyes, Commissioner

Commission Members Absent:

Barry Falke, Commissioner
Bob Farrar, Commissioner

Staff Members Present:

Sophia Pagoulatos, Planning Manager
Planning Division, Development and
Resource Management Department
Kelli Furtado, Assistant Director
Development and Resource
Management Department
Tracy Parvanian, Deputy City Attorney
III, City Attorney's Office
Talia Kolluri, Supervising Deputy City
Attorney, City Attorney's Office
Amber Piona, Planner I, Planning
Division, D.A.R.M.

Staff Members Present:

Jennifer K. Clark, AICP, HDFP, Director
Development and Resource Management
Department
Bonnie Christian, Recording Secretary

A. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Barbara Fiske at 5:09 p.m.

B. ROLL CALL

Chair Fiske took roll call. Commissioners Falke and Farrar were not present.

C. COMMUNICATIONS

None.

D. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION: Commissioner Reyes made a motion to approve the Agenda for December 14.

SECONDED: Commissioner McKenzie

AYES: Chair Fiske, Vice Chair Hardie, Commissioners Harutyunyan, McKenzie, and Reyes

NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None

E. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- 1) Minutes of the HCDC meeting of September 14, 2016 to be approved

MOTION: Vice Chair Hardie made a motion to approve the HCDC meeting minutes of September 14, 2016.

SECONDED: Commissioner Reyes

AYES: Chair Fiske, Vice Chair Hardie, Commissioners Harutyunyan, McKenzie, and Reyes

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: None

F. GENERAL ADMINISTRATION

- 1) WORKSHOP – Housing Element Amendment (no action requested)

Ms. Sophia Pagoulatos, Planning Manager, Development and Resource Management Department, introduced herself, and asked that the audience also make introductions. Ms. Pagoulatos stated the goals for the workshop, clarifying that the HCDC is not going to be taking action this evening; it is a workshop, and the draft Housing Element Amendment was released to the public the day before. She added that this meeting is to give a preview of what is in the Housing Element Amendment, and there is a 30-day comment period, the final day being January 13, 2017.

Ms. Pagoulatos described that a housing element is a State-mandated planning document for housing, the City's Housing Plan, a chapter of the City's General Plan. Every city must have a General Plan which guides its development for the next twenty-year horizon. The Housing Element is one of seven state-required elements of the General Plan. Only the Housing Element requires certification by a state agency, and that's the California Department of Housing and Community Development. Last April the City of Fresno adopted a Housing Element, which is required to be updated every eight years.

Ms. Pagoulatos detailed the purpose of a Housing Element as follows:

- To encourage development of a variety of housing opportunities. The goal and role of the City is to provide a favorable environment for the development of housing. It's not required to develop all of the housing that's called for in its plan.
- To provide housing opportunities for persons of lower and moderate incomes
- To address the quality of existing housing
- To minimize governmental constraints
- To promote equal housing opportunity for all residents

The six chapters of the City of Fresno Housing Element content was described:

- Introduction
- Needs Assessment
- Resources and Sites Inventory, a more complex way of saying the land for housing

- Constraints to Housing Development, how favorable and flexible to the development of a variety of housing types it is
- Progress toward implementing the previous Housing Element
- The Housing Plan – This chapter contains all the programs and the activities that the City is committing to do for the next Housing Element period

When talking about a housing element, Ms. Pagoulatos discussed the importance of understanding what affordable housing is, which is housing that costs no more than 30 percent of the annual income of the occupants. She listed the percentages of households in Fresno that are cost burdened. Ms. Pagoulatos stated the City is now amending its Housing Element, which was adopted in April of 2016, with the recommendations made by the State Department of Housing and Community Development after their review.

Ms. Pagoulatos highlighted three areas of amendments:

1) Adequate sites for housing

The Regional housing needs allocation is a number given to every city in California describing how many housing units the City needs to provide land capacity for over the upcoming eight years, and the City's capacity was for 23,565 total units. The State has done further analysis, and has looked at the prior Housing Element, and has asked that an additional 6,476 dwelling units be provided, which is in addition to the 23,565.

2) Mobilehome Park Conservation

The State wanted more clarification from the City on assisting with mobilehome park conservation, specifically, the City was to provide a list of financial resources to facilitate maintenance and preservation of mobilehome parks, and to do outreach and partner with other organizations and provide information and resources to mobilehome parks owners/managers, and residents. There is a survey form being provided for mobilehome residents to fill out.

3) Equitable Communities

Ms. Pagoulatos stated this was Program 27 in the City's Adopted Housing Element, and the State wanted more detail added to it. The program asked the City to identify areas of high need and target and integrated approach to service provision and investment in those neighborhoods. She included that the Mayor has had an initiative of Restore Fresno during most of her administration. She touched on how the desire is as the General Plan is implemented it be overseen by a General Plan Task Force. The presentation was concluded with explanation of how and when the processes will be completed regarding the Housing Element.

Chair Fiske opened the meeting for public comments, stating that we will not be timing the speakers.

Ms. Brunette Harris, with the Hope, Effort, Appropriately Thriving (H.E.A.T.) for Southwest Fresno Community, spoke regarding the 30-day period for planning. Her understanding from the guidelines is that there must be community input before anything is planned in a neighborhood. She wanted to know how it is that the City can plan things in the community and they don't ask the residents what it

is that they want; the City makes their own plans and the community doesn't have any input. They come with this book (Fresno General Plan 2015-2023 Housing Element) and tell the audience what the City's vision is.

Chair Fiske acknowledged that Ms. Harris' concerns were heard, and she believes there is movement to make this more transparent. She stated that she can't answer her question, not being clear on what is being asked. Ms. Harris responded that they have a date for the General Plan of 2008, and they're saying this is what their plan is coming from. Discussion continued and Chair Fiske asked if Ms. Harris could meet with Ms. Furtado, and if she would like for the commissioners to be present, she can invite them as well. Ms. Harris stated the HCDC has taken on the responsibility of being an agency of having community meetings, and they have not been in her community to have a meeting and she wants to know why.

Ms. Tracy Parvanian, Deputy City Attorney III, assured that all of the comments are being taken down by staff today, and generally, after the draft is submitted, they'll do responses to comments. Ms. Pagoulatos affirmed.

Commissioner Harutyunyan asked if Ms. Pagoulatos could address the previous comments, because she is aware of and has been part of several City initiatives that involve and engage the community. Commissioner Harutyunyan expressed that it is important the audience hear from Ms. Pagoulatos regarding public involvement. Vice Chair Hardie added comments about meeting locations. Ms. Pagoulatos answered that plans build on one another, so the Amendment to the Housing Element is something that follows from the most recently adopted Housing Element. There were nine community workshops in neighborhoods of Fresno before the Housing Element Draft was released. There was a lot of outreach for that.

Mr. Bill Hyatt spoke, addressing the inclusion of people with developmental disabilities as part of the Housing Element. He has further admiration for the availability of utilization of housing units for people in wheelchairs.

Ms. Adela Rodriguez spoke through a Spanish interpreter, stating they're asking the City to provide safe communities, they need parking lots for apartments, and green areas. The poverty levels are very high in her area, and they can't afford other types of housing. Sometimes they don't qualify as low-income tenants. They ask for a lot of prerequisites to qualify, especially for single mothers.

Ms. Estella Ortega spoke through a Spanish interpreter, stating she lives near Floradora and Cedar. Ms. Ortega asked if, before the City wipes everything out, they would ask the public to find out what they think about it. The apartments are highly deteriorated, the rent is very high, and when they complain to the landlords, they increase their rent. The schools in Fresno need to have better quality to be safe for the children, so they can graduate and they don't end up in poverty the way their parents have. The parks are not in good condition. The infrastructure and the roads are in poor condition, and there's pollution.

Ms. Maria Guzman spoke through a Spanish interpreter, stating she lives in the Addams Community, which she thinks is the poorest and most neglected community in Fresno. She feels that there is discrimination in the Addams Community. She doesn't want to see the new houses that are planned to be built in the manner that they have been built in the Addams area. She went on to describe the lack of sidewalks, explaining that handicap people have to walk in the middle of the street and move when they see a car coming. She spoke about the lack of lighting or drainage. She indicated that it's installed but now the City is charging the residents for it. She also

commented on the elementary school with over 900 students attending, and had concerns regarding the occupancy in the cafeteria which states a maximum of 250 people. She said the City hasn't done anything regarding that school.

Vice Chair Hardie asked what cross-streets she was referring to, and asked if it was City or County. Ms. Guzman replied McKinley and Hughes. She said there are kids coming from the City and the County. It's City property, yet there are no sidewalks or lighting.

As a retired school principal, Commissioner Reyes offered to connect Ms. Guzman with the appropriate Fresno Unified School District representative.

Ms. Ashley Werner, with Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability, spoke regarding the many infrastructure needs. She appreciated Chair Fiske bringing up the timeline review. Staff is out for the holidays, it's hard to do this work of engagement on complex topics and explain what's in this proposed draft, and then get meaningful input and provide that by the timeline. She encouraged direction by the Commission to staff to extend the period so that more community engagement could take place following the holidays. She also expressed the following concerns:

- There are serious infrastructure and school deficiencies in Southwest Fresno and the Jane Addams area;
- All new sites are in disadvantaged areas;
- The infrastructure needs section was stricken from draft amendment;
- The special needs housing section should include undocumented persons since they make up 20% of residents.

Mr. Jeff Roberts, with Granville Homes, spoke regarding the General Plan Task Force, and housing vouchers having restrictions as to where they can and can't be used. He asked about the 122 units located at Clinton and Blackstone and several other topics. Ms. Pagoulatos replied to each topic and indicated that she would provide additional responses through the formal response to comments.

Commissioner Harutyunyan inquired about the City's ability to apply for loans to rehabilitate mobilehomes as is done in the City of Clovis. Ms. Pagoulatos stated that she would investigate. Commissioner Harutyunyan suggested that the City of Fresno should look at what the City of Clovis is doing related to the Mobile Home Conservation Program.

Commissioner McKenzie asked why is downtown the only area for roll over. Chair Fisk was concerned that the rollover sites would negatively impact areas of concentrated poverty in the downtown area. Ms. Pagoulatos went into detail related to the roll over site inventory and capacity matters.

Chair Fiske closed the public comment section of the meeting.

Discussion ensued regarding schools and the high number of students in each classroom.

Ms. Parvanian reminded the commissioners that since this is a workshop, there is no action noted or required by the Commission on this evening.

G. INFORMATIONAL REPORTS

None.

H. COMMISSIONER ITEMS

None.

I. UNSCHEDULED ORAL COMMUNICATION

None.

J. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to bring before the Housing and Community Development Commission, the meeting adjourned at 6:47 p.m.

The next scheduled Commission meeting is on **January 11, 2016.**

Barbara Fiske, HCDC Chairperson

Kelli Furtado, Assistant Director
Development and Resource Management