SUMMARY OF INFORMATION SUBMITTED BY PROPOSERS REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR FIRM FIXED-PRICE DESIGN-BUILD STORAGE TANK NESWTF BID FILE NO. 3531

Evaluation Criteria	Proposer: W.M. Lyles Co.	Proposer: Mountain Cascade, Inc.
Price offer (Last, Best, and Final)	\$11,758,200.00	\$11,323,010.00
Experience and Capabilities of Design-Builder/Firm(s)	 Very Experienced Has successfully performed several design- build projects Has teamed with the proposed design engineer (Provost & Pritchard) on multiple design-build projects (Note: Extensive list of similar projects provided by the Proposer) 	 Limited, Inadequate for project scope and goals No experience in performing design-build projects as a prime Has not completed a design build-project with the proposed design engineer (Note: A list of two (2) similar projects provided by the Proposer)
Experience and Capabilities of Key Personnel	Very experienced	Limited, Inadequate for project scope and goals
Financial Condition, Organization, Management, and Safety	Adequate	Adequate
Project Approach	Adequate, Consistent with 30% Design included in RFP	Adequate, Consistent with 30% Design included in RFP
Best Value	Superior	Less than adequate for the design- build project scope and goals
	(Note: Includes exceptional experience the City of Fresno has on the major capital improvement projects the Proposer currently is working on for the City)	