

City of Fresno

2600 Fresno Street
Fresno, CA 93721
www.fresno.gov



Meeting Minutes - Final

Wednesday, November 28, 2018

5:00 PM

Regular Meeting

Fresno City Hall, 2nd Floor
Room 2165N (Conference Room A)

Housing and Community Development Commission

Chair Barbara Fiske

Vice Chair Bob Reyes

Commissioners:

Barry Falke, Bob Farrar, Marina Harutyunyan, Chong Yang

Staff:

Jennifer K. Clark, AICP, HDFP, DARM Director

Kelli Furtado, Assistant DARM Director

Thomas Morgan, Housing Manager

Susie Williams, Recording Secretary

A) CALL TO ORDER

Chair Fiske called the meeting to order at 5:07 P.M.

B) ROLL CALL

Present 4 - Commissioner Bob Farrar, Chairperson Barbara Fiske, Commissioner Marina Harutyunyan, and Commissioner Chong Yang

Absent 2 - Vice Chair Bob Reyes, and Commissioner Barry Falke

C) COMMUNICATIONS

None.

D) APPROVAL OF AGENDA

On motion of Commissioner Farrar, seconded by Commissioner Harutyunyan, the agenda be approved. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

E) APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[ID18-1445](#) Approval of HCDC minutes for February 28, 2018

[ID18-1446](#) Approval of HCDC minutes for March 28, 2018

[ID18-1447](#) Approval of HCDC minutes for April 25, 2018

[ID18-1448](#) Approval of HCDC minutes for September 12, 2018

On motion of Commissioner Yang, seconded by Commissioner Farrar, the above minutes be approved. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

F) GENERAL ADMINISTRATION

[ID18-1449](#) Recommend approval of a \$2,568,000 HOME Investment Partnerships, Community Housing Development Organization Program Agreement with Self-Help Enterprises for the construction of the proposed Annadale Commons Apartments, a 40-unit affordable senior rental housing project at Annadale

Avenue and Elm Avenue in southeast Fresno

Housing and Community Development Project Manager, Corrina Nunez, introduced the project and recommended approval of the \$2,568,000 HOME CHDO Agreement with Self-Help Enterprises for its Annadale Commons Senior Housing project. Ms. Nunez explained that on July 11, 2018, Self-Help Enterprises was selected through a NOFA process to receive HOME Community Housing Development Organization (CHDO) funds for its proposed project and is a City-certified CHDO eligible to receive HOME CHDO funding. She provided details that the proposed Annadale Commons project will consist of 39 units of senior housing, one manager unit, a community center, bike lane and sidewalk improvements along Annadale, and solar panels to offset some of the common area utility costs. Ms. Nunez commented that qualifying senior tenants must be 60 years of age or older and have an income between 30 to 60 percent of area median income.

Ms. Nunez explained the estimated project cost is approximately \$14.2 million. Funding for the project will consist of HOME/CHDO funding, Housing Successor Agency funding, a land carryback not, impact fee waiver, a sponsor loan, an entitlement fee loan, and Low Income Housing Tax Credits. She noted three corrections to the staff report: page one should read southwest not southeast; page two the loan terms should read 1 not 2 percent interest, and the one-bedroom square footage changed from 584 sq. ft. to 760 sq. ft. and the two bedroom square footage changed from 845 sq. ft. to 1,011 sq. ft. Ms. Nunez concluded her comments by introducing, Tom Collishaw and Betsy McGovern-Garcia from Self-Help to answer any questions.

Chair Fiske repeated the changes to the staff report and then went out to the public for comment.

Brunette Harris, H.E.A.T. Southwest Fresno: Ms. Harris spoke in opposition to the item and stated the meeting paperwork was not made available on the City's website, or the City Clerk's Office for public review. She indicated that the community was not aware of the project, or any meetings. However, someone did come to talk about what the City wants, including widening of streets and taking parts of the community. Ms. Harris indicated that she

would need to go back to the Inspector General and advise that the City is not following the letter of the law.

Chair Fiske reiterated the HCDC materials are available on the City's website.

Dianne Smith, H.E.A.T. Southwest Fresno: Ms. Smith spoke in opposition of the item and stated the community needs to be informed of items before they go to the HCDC. While services for senior citizens are good, there is no stopping the project if there is a problem and the community is not being kept informed. She would like to see the District 3 Implementation Committee meeting again, because that kept community members informed. Ms. Smith stated she had been online and tried to pull up minutes, but found that City-wide information is not posted timely. She would like to see the posting of information sooner so that she can see what was passed.

Chair Fiske closed the public comment portion of the meeting and invited commissioners to address the item.

Commissioner Farrar asked representatives from Self-Help Enterprises to confirm if the project would be a "ground up" construction. Tom Collishaw, with Self-Help Enterprises confirmed that it would. Commissioner Farrar asked Mr. Collishaw to describe the mix of the 40 units. Mr. Collishaw stated that 32 are single bedroom units; eight are two bedroom units, for a total of 40 units. The 40 units would be available for seniors 60 years and older. Mr. Collishaw also stated there is a community room facility on the site.

Commissioner Harutyunyan asked the staff and Self-Help Enterprises representatives to describe the community outreach and other efforts related to future tenants. Ms. Nunez commented that there are currently three senior projects nearby, with a collective waiting list of over 200 seniors. Mr. Collishaw indicated that the property management, firm as well as Self-Help Enterprises would conduct that outreach. He indicated his disappointment also that members of the public were not aware of the community outreach conducted. Mr. Collishaw further explained that previous community

outreach was done to communicate the project to community members and in return receive their input. He stated there were five meetings held in coordination with the Transformative Climate Community (TCC) efforts, noticing was sent to the Southwest Fresno Strategic Plan Committee, and several local meetings were held in the Southwest Fresno Community, at least one coordinated with the district's Councilmember who was present.

Betsy Garcia, from Self-Help Enterprises provided additional information related to two community meetings that were hosted at the Mary Ella Brown Community Center. She indicated that outreach was done with the families who utilize the community center as well as a mailing that reached households within a 500 foot radius of the project site. In addition, flyers and outreach was conducted with clients of the nearby Clinica Sierra Vista Health Clinic.

Ms. Garcia also indicated that additional TCC funding was planned to do sidewalks and bike lanes. She clarified that there were no property takes associated with that project and that it was all planned in the right-of-way and there would be no disruption to homes.

Commissioner Yang asked Mr. Collishaw and Ms. Garcia to describe feedback received from the attendees at the various outreach meetings outlined. Ms. Garcia stated the attendees were in support of the senior housing project. This project was discussed in conjunction with a single-family 30 lot project which generated more concerns by the community related to community presence and homeowner education.

Chair Fiske asked Ms. Garcia to speak about the history of the project. Ms. Garcia noted that this is a former Redevelopment Agency (RDA) property. She further stated the RDA approached Self-Help Enterprises with the opportunity for development, and in return they put forth a proposal.

Commissioner Yang asked about the training that was not provided by Clinica Sierra Vista, and whether or not Self-Help Enterprises plans to provide that portion of training for the senior tenants. Ms. Garcia stated Self-Help Enterprises will provide financial literacy and counseling as well

as budgeting and financial management for the seniors. She stated they also leverage other services such as computer classes and exercise classes offered through community partners.

Commissioner Harutyunyan asked if the senior housing component is already equipped with aging in place components. Ms. Garcia responded they are going a step further than the required accessibility components and providing universal design elements which include grab bars, wider doorways, no step entries, and accessible sinks to facilitate seniors as they age in these units, so that they can be successful in remaining in their unit.

Commissioner Yang led additional dialogue regarding the affordability of the units, with some of the one bedroom units averaging \$309 per month for those on fixed income. Commissioner Yang added that the project is providing a lot to the community and is pleased to see that it will be at an affordable price.

Commissioner Farrar asked for a construction timeline should the project be approved. Ms. Garcia stated that the item before the HCDC is the last layer of funding needed. If successful, Self-Help Enterprises is prepared to pull permits in December 2018, with a 12-month construction schedule beginning in March 2019, they plan to be open by March 2020.

On motion of Commissioner Yang, seconded by Commissioner Harutyunyan, the above item be approved. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

[ID18-1450](#) Approval of Housing and Community Development Commission Meeting Schedule for Calendar Year 2019

Upon call for public comment there was none.

On motion of Commissioner Farrar, seconded by Commissioner Yang, the above item be approved. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

G) INFORMATIONAL REPORTS

Housing and Community Development Assistant Director, Kelli Furtado, stated the previous HCDC Meeting, scheduled for November 14, 2018, was cancelled due to a lack of quorum and a result of the presenter's schedule,

the workshop on Homelessness Efforts by the Mayor's Office will be rescheduled for a later date. She also stated there is a vacancy on the HCDC and encouraged the commissioners to reach out to individuals or networks that may be interested in serving in this capacity. Applications are available at the City Clerk's Office, and on the City's website.

H) COMMISSIONER ITEMS

None.

I) UNSCHEDULED ORAL COMMUNICATION

Brunette Harris, H.E.A.T. Southwest Fresno: Ms. Harris stated she would like to know why the HCDC still passes things and doesn't care about what the community says. She stated that the HCDC is supposed to come and hold meetings in the community, and that has not been done. She asked why they approved everything that was put in front of them, and that the lady who spoke about the project lied. Ms. Harris stated that it appears the HCDC rushes, and the feds should shut it all down and not give any money, indicating that Trump can't stand California anyways. She went on to state that she doesn't have representation, and while she could stay home, she is here. Ms. Harris stated that the HCDC needs to do their job, and that the planning in Southwest Fresno area is gentrification. She expressed frustration that individuals leave the medical clinic discussed because they don't get medical help and that grown adults receive care along with kids at Gaston school.

Diane Smith, H.E.A.T. Southwest Fresno: Ms. Smith commented on the systematic blighting of Southwest Fresno and discussed a recent article in The Atlantic that discussed the Mason-Dixon Line and Railroads. The plans from the 1960's are the same plans that need the community. She stated her confusion over the Successor Agency that used to be the Redevelopment Agency, but it is really the City Council because they are the same thing, with Council wearing two hats. Ms. Smith went on to indicate that she does not feel her community is being represented by the elected councilmember, and is expecting changes with the incoming councilmember. She indicated that new councilmember's start like they want to do right, but it won't continue. Ms. Smith described that seniors

*don't go to meetings, they get tired of coming, that is why there is no input.
She expressed her frustration that the TCC project has \$70 million
designated to 93706 but how it is being decided is systematically blighting
Southwest Fresno.*

J) ADJOURNMENT

Chair Fiske adjourned the meeting at 5:48 P.M.

The next scheduled HCDC meeting is January 9, 2019.