

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
REMOVAL, PROCESSING, AND BENEFICIAL REUSE OR OTHER
ENVIRONMENTALLY FRIENDLY ALTERNATIVE DISPOSAL OF BIOSOLIDS
RFP NO. 9468**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

Mike Brown, Buyer/Facilitator, City of Fresno, Finance Dept. – Purchasing
Eric Casares, Associate Vice President, Carollo Engineers
Dan Cravens, Operations Supervisor, City of Fresno - Wastewater Management Division
Rick Staggs, Wastewater Manager, City of Fresno – Wastewater Management Division

BACKGROUND:

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals for the removal, processing, and beneficial reuse or other environmental friendly alternative disposal of a portion of the biosolids produced at the Fresno/Clovis Regional Wastewater Reclamation Facilities (RWRF). The RWRF produces up to 100,000 wet tons (250 to 300 wet tons per day) of biosolids per year. This quantity may vary contingent upon seasonal fluctuation of incoming loads, or application of new or different processing technologies. The primary goal in this RFP was to develop one or more programs for the beneficial reuse of this portion of the biosolids produced at the RWRF.

EVALUATION BY COMMITTEE:

Synagro Technologies, Inc.

Synagro is a California leader in cost-effective solution systems, processes, technologies and facilities that transform natural waste and wastewater challenges into safe, beneficially reusable options that are environmentally and people-safe, sustainable and beneficial to the environment.

The committee was in agreement that Synagro had the ability to meet all requirements of the RFP and in fact has been doing business with the City of Fresno, Wastewater Management Division for over a decade. Synagro's past performance has been acceptable and without problems or concerns. Their proposal was competitive and the most cost effective.

Holloway Environmental Solutions, LLC

Holloway has been in the landfill/reclamation business for 22 years. Holloway performs open pit mining operations. And to refill these open areas back to their natural state, Holloway has a defined fill plan that allows biosolids and fly-ash to be comingled

together in order to kill any residual parthenogens and to reduce additional moisture within the biosolids. Holloway will then cap the remaining 3 feet with natural soil, this bring the area back to its natural state and will allow Holloway to perform agricultural operations and add future composting facilities (currently in the permitting process) on top of the reclaimed mine area.

The committee agreed that this is new, innovative use of Biosolids is both valuable and beneficial. Holloway's history of performance was acceptable and their proposal was competitive and the most cost effective.

New Earth, USA

New Earth has been in the Biosolids management business for decades, with additional; experience in Compost Facility development.

While the committee finds acceptability in New Earth's proposal, relative to their history of performance and fiscal competitiveness, Biosolids land application is the least effective in achieving the RWRF goal of beneficial reuse.

RECOMMENDATION:

The committee recommends that Synagro be awarded a portion of the contract, for the volume quantity of 50,001 to 75,000 tons, for the removal, processing, and beneficial reuse or other environmentally friendly alternative disposal of Biosolids. and, Holloway Environmental Solutions be awarded a portion of the contract, for the volume quantity of 25,000 to 50,000 tons, for the removal, processing, and beneficial reuse or other environmentally friendly alternative disposal of Biosolids.

For the following reasons:

1. Both proposals are cost competitive.
2. Both proposers represented and confirmed their ability to provide high quality and dependable Biosolids Removal services to the COF Wastewater Management Division.
3. Both Synagro and Holloway Environmental meet or surpass the RWRF requirement of beneficial reuse or other environmentally friendly alternative disposal of Biosolids.

Additionally, the committee believes that awarding portions of the contract to two of the qualified bidders ensures uninterrupted service should any unforeseen circumstances occur.