

RECEIVED

Agenda Item: File ID 20-00487 (3-A)

Agenda Date: 05/21/2020

2020 MAY 18 P 11:07

CITY OF FRESNO
CITY CLERK'S OFFICE

FRESNO CITY COUNCIL



Information Packet

Agenda Related Item(s) – File ID 20-00487 (3-A)

ITEM(S)

File ID 20-00487 (3-A) - ***RESOLUTION - Adopting the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan Including Citizen Participation Plan, 2020-2021 Annual Action Plan, and Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice; authorizing submission to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) for application of the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG), HOME Investment Partnerships (HOME), Emergency Solutions Grant (ESG), and Housing Opportunities for Persons with AIDS (HOPWA) Programs and authorizing the City Manager to sign all implementing documents required by HUD (Subject to Mayor's Veto)

Contents of Supplement: Public Comments and Responses

Item(s)

Supplemental Information:

Any agenda related public documents received and distributed to a majority of the City Council after the Agenda Packet is printed are included in Supplemental Packets. Supplemental Packets are produced as needed. The Supplemental Packet is available for public inspection in the City Clerk's Office, 2600 Fresno Street, during normal business hours (main location pursuant to the Brown Act, G.C. 54957.5(2)). In addition, Supplemental Packets are available for public review at the City Council meeting in the City Council Chambers, 2600 Fresno Street. Supplemental Packets are also available on-line on the City Clerk's website.

Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA):

The meeting room is accessible to the physically disabled, and the services of a translator can be made available. Requests for additional accommodations for the disabled, sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or translators should be made one week prior to the meeting. Please call City Clerk's Office at 621-7650. Please keep the doorways, aisles and wheelchair seating areas open and accessible. If you need assistance with seating because of a disability, please see Security.

PUBLIC COMMENTS AND CITY RESPONSES

2020-2024 Consolidated Plan and 2020-2021 Annual Action Plan Appendix C Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice Appendix B

Comments received through May 18, 2020 and City responses are provided below. Additional comments received before the close of the Public Comment period on May 20, 2020 will be summarized by City staff and added to the official record for the May 21, 2020 City Council meeting, and appended to the final version of this document to be included with the submission of the plans to the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD).

Housing and Community Development Commission (HCDC) Public Hearing – May 13, 2020

Upon call for public comment, the following 2 people addressed the HCDC.

1. Sheng Xiong, Leadership Council for Justice and Accountability: Ms. Xiong noted that the Consolidated Plan presents a critical opportunity for the City to address the severe affordable housing needs in Fresno as well as the environmental and neighborhood health conditions that impact neighborhood health and wellbeing, and indicated she would be submitting additional written comments before the 20th. Ms. Xiong then expressed hope that the plan will address the following: promote new development of affordable housing and expand housing choice throughout Fresno, including locations in higher-income neighborhood and neighborhoods with fewer residents of color, rather than continuing to allow the concentration of housing affordable to low-income residents solely in low-income neighborhoods of color. The exclusion of other neighborhoods potentially conflicts with the City's duty to affirmatively further fair housing under fair housing and civil rights laws; also with regard to residents wishing to remain in a community like Southwest Fresno that might not want to leave due to personal choice such as family ties- they deserve a consolidated plan that spends targeted investments of block grant funds and other resources available to decrease the disparity gap within the City of Fresno. Residents should not have to leave their community because the city has allowed severe disinvestment in these neighborhoods, many of which lack basic services and amenities such as sidewalks, street lights, curbs and gutters, grocery stores, retail outlets, and mixed and middle-income housing, and which exhibit high racially and ethnically concentrated poverty. Ms. Xiong indicated that her organization wants to assist the City in developing a prosperous final Analysis of Impediments that meets its objectives by analyzing and eliminating housing discrimination in the City of Fresno and promotes fair housing choice for all persons regardless of wealth, race, income, or place.

[City Response: The public comment has been considered and accepted.]

2. Mariah Thompson, Director of Central Valley National Lawyer’s Guild: Ms. Thompson asked why the plan specifies N/A for Goal Outcome Indicator for Fair Housing, unlike the other items for which more specific values are listed. Ms. Thompson then asked the City to further build out the section of the plan which discusses property that is owned by the City that could be utilized in achieving some of the goals of the plan, and expressed that there is a lot of opportunity there, especially if compared to the Housing Element.

[City Response: The City has revised the plan to include information regarding the process under which parcels are considered for disposition by the City, including compliance with AB 1486 which requires priority consideration for affordable housing. The revision also includes information about parcels for which this process is currently underway and a list of land noted as vacant on the City’s current inventory. The City funds Fair Housing as an administrative activity. Administrative activities do not require goal outcome indicators under HUD guidelines. However, the City has accepted the comment and will consider preparing Fair Housing as a separate activity with specific goals in subsequent Annual Action Plans and Consolidated Plans. The public comment has been considered and accepted.]

City Council Public Hearing – May 14, 2020

Upon call for public comment, the following 1 person addressed the City Council.

1. [Ivanka Saunders, Leadership Council for Justice and Accountability]: Ms. Saunders indicated that her organization wants to assist the City in developing a prosperous final Analysis of Impediments that meets its objectives by analyzing and eliminating housing discrimination in the City of Fresno and promotes fair housing choice for all persons. Ms. Saunders encouraged the City’s efforts in expanding its outreach and engagement strategies to include more workshops over a longer period of time to collect information from residents throughout Fresno, and noted this plan must analyze these concerns and adopt responsive actions and objectives that will effectively address these concerns so that residents continue to participate and feel that their concerns are actually being heard. The final plan must address how the City is using participants’ input in eliminating impediments to fair housing. Ms. Saunders noted that this draft plan provides a list of impediments and recommendations from the 2016 plan, but does not address which, if any, of those recommendations were actually implemented into policies and practices. Ms. Saunders stated that if recommendations were taken, it does not indicate who or how it benefited the recipients or if they reduced the impacts of these impediments, and indicated that the final plan must address if and how these recommendations led to any changes that reduce impediments. Ms. Saunders’s final comment was regarding identification of the impediments- although recommended activities and timelines are provided to describe the action steps that the city should take to address the impediments, it fails to establish measurable goals the city would use to assess the effectiveness and success of these actions, for example “raising awareness,” but without

actual measurable results does not effectively address how the impediment will be eliminated or minimized. Ms. Saunders indicated that the final plan must include measurable goals which the City can use to assess their efforts to eliminate impediments and present the outcomes.

[City Response: The document used to report on the City’s progress toward its goals for U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development Community Planning and Development programs is the Consolidated Annual Performance Evaluation Report (CAPER). CAPERs are posted on the City’s Housing and Community Development website at <http://www.fresno.gov/housing>. The public comment has been considered and accepted.]

Public Review Period Written Comments Received – February 28, 2020 – May 20, 2020

This appendix includes all comments available as of May 14, 2020; additional comments received will be summarized in a verbal presentation to City Council on May 21, 2020, will be provided to the City Clerk to be made part of the public record, and included in the final submission of the Plans to HUD.

1. Elisabeth Robledo: Email indicating lack of translation of plans provides a barrier in communication and equal participation of all shareholders (full email attached following this summary).

[City Response: The City’s adopted Citizen Participation Plan does not require translation of public review documents. Although not required, the City provided Spanish and Hmong translation of notices and promotional materials, and interpretation services at community meetings and Public Hearings. The City will also provide Spanish and Hmong translations of the final Consolidated Plan, Annual Action Plan, and Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice. The draft documents were optimized for ADA/accessibility which allows for translations utilizing machine translation services. The City will assess cost-effective means of translating draft documents as well as revisions and final versions in the future. The public comment has been considered and accepted.]

2. Emily Brandt: Email asking why the Plans were not available in Spanish and Hmong-language versions given that agendas were (full email attached following this summary).

[City Response: The City’s adopted Citizen Participation Plan does not require translation of public review documents. Although not required, the City provided Spanish and Hmong translation of notices and promotional materials, and interpretation services at community meetings and Public Hearings. The City will also provide Spanish and Hmong translations of the final Consolidated Plan, Annual Action Plan, and Analysis of

Public Comments and City Responses – 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan, 2020-2021 Annual
Action Plan, and Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice

Impediments to Fair Housing Choice. The draft documents were optimized for ADA/accessibility which allows for translations utilizing machine translation services. The City will assess cost-effective means of translating draft documents as well as revisions and final versions in the future. The public comment has been considered and accepted.]

Exhibit 1: Email – Elisabeth Robledo (Page 1 of 2)

From: [Elisabeth Robledo](#)
To: [HCDD](#)
Subject: Re: Consolidated Plan
Date: Thursday, May 14, 2020 9:32:50 AM

External Email: Use caution with links and attachments

Thank you for your response. While I am working with the issue of connectivity, it's quite possible others have experienced similar issues and may be a potential barrier to public engagement.

However, the primary issue of concern which prompted this message is the lack of clarity in communication. While it appears the meeting's agenda is provided in multi-language format, the plan itself is seemingly provided only in English, which serves as a barrier in providing critical information to our community members and stakeholders.

Furthermore, in visiting the website for supplemental, supportive documents regarding the plan, it was noted the documents, including the plan itself appear to be available only in the English format, which again provides a barrier in communication and equal participation of all shareholders. Please advise regarding this matter, as a means of providing the community with the necessary information to allow for equity and access, as well as foster more full and complete participation and community engagement.

On Thu, May 14, 2020 at 8:41 AM HCDD <HCDD@fresno.gov> wrote:

Good Morning,

I apologize for any technical difficulties experienced at yesterday's meeting- I'll provide this feedback and any other specific information about those issues to our information services department. The meeting was conducted successfully with several members of the community in attendance and able to comment, so I'm very sorry that we were unable to receive your comment.

If you have comments regarding Substantial Amendment 2019-02 to the 2019 Annual Action Plan, there is another opportunity to comment at today's City Council meeting, which will also be held remotely. The agenda can be found at <https://fresno.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>.

If you have comments regarding the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan, 2020-2021 Annual Action Plan, or Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice, there will also be a Public Hearing regarding

Exhibit 1: Email – Elisabeth Robledo (Page 2 of 2)

those plans at City Council today as well. The Hearings will be held sequentially, starting at approximately 10:05 AM. Additionally, written comments may be submitted through May 20, 2020 by emailing HCDD@fresno.gov.

We will record your comment regarding multi-language formats as a comment for the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan, 2020-2021 Annual Action Plan, and Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice, along with a City response.

I really appreciate you reaching out and encourage you to take advantage of one of the remaining means of submitting public comment-

Edward Chivevere | 559-621-8512 | mobile: 559-240-1942

Senior Management Analyst, City of Fresno Housing & Community Development

He/him/his

From: Elisabeth Robledo [REDACTED]
Sent: Wednesday, May 13, 2020 5:31 PM
To: HCDD
Subject: Consolidated Plan

External Email: Use caution with links and attachments

Good evening. As a concerned member of the community, I was hoping to be able to attend this evening's event. However, the meeting appears to be stalled.

Also, another matter of concern is while the agenda appears to be provided in multi-language format, the plan itself is seemingly provided only in English, which serves as a barrier in providing critical information to our community members and stakeholders. Please advise.

Thank you,

Elisabeth Robledo

Exhibit 2: Email – Emily Brandt

From: [Emily Brandt](#)
To: [HCDD](#)
Subject: Public Comment
Date: Wednesday, May 13, 2020 8:54:12 PM

External Email: Use caution with links and attachments

Please explain why the Fresno City Consolidated Plan, the Impediment to Fair Housing and the Annual Action Plan are not available in Spanish and Hmong-language versions. Having agendas available in Spanish and Hmong is only partially useful if the documents themselves are not available. Enabling translation services and public comments in languages other than English really has no meaning if people cannot read the documents on which they're being asked to comment.

I ask that you review Title VI Executive Order 13166 pertaining to federal agencies and federal programs with a view to making of it all Fresno City government documents available in three languages: English, Spanish and Hmong.

Thank you!

Emily Brandt

--

Salut!