

MEETING MINUTES
HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION (HCDC)

September 14, 2016
Fresno City Hall, Room 2165-A (2nd Floor)
2600 Fresno Street, Fresno, California 93721

Commission Members Present:

Bob Farrar, Chairperson
Barbara Fiske, Vice Chairperson
Brad Hardie, Commissioner
Marina Harutyunyan, Commissioner
Debra McKenzie, Commissioner
Bob Reyes, Commissioner

Commission Members Absent:

Barry Falke, Commissioner

Staff Members Present:

Kelli Furtado, Assistant Director
Development and Resource
Management Department
Tracy Parvanian, Deputy City Attorney
III, City Attorney's Office
Bonnie Christian, Recording Secretary

Jennifer K. Clark, AICP, HDFP, Director
Development and Resource Management
Department
Dannye Casey, Project Manager
John Turnipseed, Project Manager

A. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Bob Farrar at 5:05 p.m.

B. ROLL CALL

Chair Farrar took roll call. Commissioner Falke was not present.

C. COMMUNICATIONS

Chair Farrar welcomed new Commissioner Debra McKenzie. Commissioner McKenzie summarized her background, and stated she is passionate about being engaged in the community, and happy to be serving on the Commission.

D. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION: Commissioner Reyes made a motion to approve the Agenda for September 14.

SECONDED: Commissioner Hardie

AYES: Chair Farrar, Vice Chair Fiske, Commissioners Hardie, Harutyunyan, McKenzie, and Reyes

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: None

E. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- 1) Minutes of the HCDC meeting of August 10, 2016 to be approved

Commissioner McKenzie pointed out that on the second page, the first paragraph under Public Hearing, the acronym H.E.A.T. should be spelled out the first time used. The commissioners discussed and it was agreed that the minutes will be amended so that the organization's title is written out the first time used as Hope, Effort, Appropriately Thriving (H.E.A.T.).

MOTION: Commissioner Reyes made a motion to approve the HCDC meeting minutes of August 10, 2016 with the amendment.

SECONDED: Commissioner Hardie

AYES: Chair Farrar, Vice Chair Fiske, Commissioners Hardie, and Reyes

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: Commissioners Harutyunyan and McKenzie (*not present at the August 10 HCDC meeting.*)

- 2) Minutes of the HCDC meeting of June 29, 2016 to be approved

MOTION: Vice Chair Fiske made a motion to approve the HCDC meeting minutes of June 29, 2016.

SECONDED: Commissioner Hardie

AYES: Chair Farrar, Vice Chair Fiske, Commissioners Hardie, Harutyunyan, and Reyes

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: Commissioner McKenzie (*not present at the June 29 HCDC meeting.*)

F. GENERAL ADMINISTRATION

- 1) Actions Pertaining to the City of Fresno's Program Year 2015 Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report (CAPER):

1. Public Hearing to accept public comment regarding the CAPER
2. Recommend approval of the CAPER to the City Council

Ms. Kelli Furtado, Assistant Director Development and Resource Management Department (D.A.R.M.), gave a presentation regarding the CAPER for the fiscal year that ended June 30, 2016. The CAPER is an evaluation of the performance related to U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development's (HUD) funded programs, it is a comprehensive report, not an actionable item, nor does it allocate funding. Ms. Furtado commented that she is proud of the accomplishments outlined in the draft CAPER. She spoke in terms of Program Year 2015, which is the HUD definition for the period of time covering July 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016. The City of Fresno refers to this same period of time as Fiscal Year 2016. The Program Year 2015 CAPER reports on the first full action plan year within the five-year 2015-2019 Consolidated Plan.

Ms. Furtado touched on the Integrated Disbursement and Information System (IDIS), the software that's interfaced with HUD. She advised that in addition to the required outreach in the City's Citizen Engagement Plan, and publication in the Fresno Bee on September 4, the City has also utilized several additional low, and no-cost efforts for community outreach and engagement. This

included the development of customer-friendly flyers in English and Spanish, as well as the distribution of those flyers to residents and community-based organizations through social media and the utilization of the Housing and Community Development Division's e-mail distribution list of over 500 addresses. The public review draft was made available on September 7, 2016. Additionally, the City of Fresno is in the process of updating its website, planning a very citizen and customer friendly page for the Housing and Community Development Division, customized to accommodate the public review processes and plans and opportunities for the public to become engaged.

Ms. Furtado reviewed opportunities for the public to provide written and/or oral comments, which will be incorporated into the final CAPER, if applicable, and all comments will be included with the final CAPER that is submitted to HUD.

The goals were highlighted, as well as the accomplishments related to those goals. There were twenty-one additional rehab projects completed, and Ms. Furtado passed out a copy of the map demonstrating the location of those projects to the commissioners. She noted that for the Emergency Shelter Grant, the Program Years 2011, 2012, and 2013 were overdue, but that HUD had recently provided a clearance allowing the City of Fresno to begin drawing those funds through IDIS. She commented on the impressive and coordinated work to address homelessness with these funds by the service agencies in the Fresno community.

Information regarding a \$3.5 million Substantial Amendment was also included in the CAPER. Ms. Furtado reported that this Substantial Amendment was acknowledged by HUD in August 2016, and that the City has begun moving forward to implement those funds.

Ms. Furtado acknowledged that the attachments included in the draft CAPER, specifically the Homeless Management Information System (HMIS) information, are complicated. However, this information generated by HMIS that will be uploaded to a HUD technology, and including the raw data in the draft CAPER, was intended to provide transparency and not create confusion. A summary of the information collected from HMIS will be included in the final CAPER. Ms. Furtado also commented that the attachments include an addendum for the Program Year 2014 CAPER.

Ms. Furtado wrapped up, mentioning the public review process, which goes through September 22, 2016. Oral and written statements will be accepted through that date and included in the final CAPER, which will be posted to the City of Fresno's website.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chair Farrar explained how the Public Hearing would proceed, then opened the Public Hearing related to the Program Year (PY) 2015 Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report (CAPER).

Ms. Diane Smith, with Hope, Effort, Appropriately Thriving (H.E.A.T.) for Southwest Fresno Community, asked for an explanation of the dates covered in the draft CAPER, and requested explanation as to why prior HUD funds were not used during the project year that it was meant for. Ms. Smith also wanted to know the difference between Restore Fresno and the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) areas, concerned that Restore Fresno would take CDBG funding

from CDBG areas. Chair Farrar explained that the time period covered in the PY 2015 CAPER was from July 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016. Ms. Furtado confirmed that the CDBG areas are defined by HUD, and that Restore Fresno is a compilation of local initiative that represents several different neighborhoods and efforts. Ms. Furtado confirmed that there is cross-over between Restore Fresno neighborhoods and CDBG eligible areas; however, Restore Fresno is not a program that takes funding away from CDBG areas.

Ms. Brunette Harris, with H.E.A.T for Southwest Fresno Community, began by stating that she was not confused about the program year. Ms. Harris spoke regarding the draft CAPER, that there isn't enough time for the community to review the report, and she stated that the HCDC is supposed to be holding workshops in the community. Ms. Harris commented that the community is just getting the draft CAPER paperwork, and the City wants them to speak on it this evening. She insisted that there should have been community input before the draft CAPER was even published. Ms. Harris stated that she doesn't believe the community has a say, so it looks like they will need to go to Washington, DC, because the City is not complying with the rules and regulations, the federal guidelines. She emphasized that their community are elderly and young people that do not have access to email.

Ms. Ashley Werner, with Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability, presented that their organization was very involved with the Analysis of Impediments update, which hadn't been updated for twenty years. She continued that one of the impediments identified, also identified in the CAPER, is the persistence of racially and ethnically concentrated poverty in Fresno, and the actions are not actually addressing what the impediment is. She pointed out that all of the affordable housing, rehabilitation, construction funds identified are all in areas of poverty, and that there are not projects identified for creation of new housing opportunities outside of these areas. The residents she works with want the ability to live in areas with parks, clean air, not next to industrial facilities, not next to highways, and to have high-performing schools.

Chair Farrar closed the Public Hearing. He asked for commissioner comments.

Commissioner McKenzie recommended edits regarding the draft CAPER, suggesting corrections that might be made on certain pages, and giving explanation. Discussion proceeded.

Chair Farrar asked the Commission how they would like to act on the item, and requested clarification from staff. Ms. Furtado stated that staff will be prepared to present the draft CAPER to the Council, summarize the public hearing process and the recommendation of the HCDC. She also noted that written comments would be provided to the Council, should any be received, and that the Council would also accept public comments. Ms. Furtado noted that the CAPER would still be in draft format, because the final document would only be produced once the public comment period concluded on September 22, 2016. Discussion continued.

MOTION: Commissioner Reyes made a motion to recommend approval of the CAPER to City Council.

SECONDED: Vice Chair Fiske

AYES: Chair Farrar, Vice Chair Fiske, Commissioners Hardie, Harutyunyan, McKenzie, and Reyes

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: None

G. INFORMATIONAL REPORTS

None.

H. COMMISSIONER ITEMS

1) Voting of new Chairperson and Vice Chairperson

Chair Farrar recommended Vice Chair Fiske as Chairperson, and asked if there were any other commissioners interested in being Chairperson. He then asked if there was a motion.

MOTION: Commissioner Hardie made a motion for Vice Chair Fiske to be Chairperson for Fiscal Year 2017.

SECONDED: Commissioner Reyes

AYES: Chair Farrar, Vice Chair Fiske, Commissioners Hardie, Harutyunyan, McKenzie, and Reyes

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: None

Chair Farrar asked if there were any commissioners who would be interested in being Vice Chair for the fiscal year.

MOTION: Vice Chair Fiske made a motion for Commissioner Hardie to be Vice Chairperson for Fiscal Year 2017.

SECONDED: Chair Farrar

AYES: Chair Farrar, Vice Chair Fiske, Commissioners Hardie, Harutyunyan, McKenzie, and Reyes

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: None

2) Citizen Participation Plan

Ms. Furtado explained that the 2015-19 Consolidated Plan involved a Citizen Participation Plan, and when the City went through the public outreach, workshops, etc., for the Consolidated Plan, part of that process included a new Citizen Participation Plan. The City Council adopted the 2015-19 Consolidated Plan in 2015, including the Citizen Participation Plan, and that is what the Department is currently operating under. She expounded on the current plan, outlining some of the practices and procedures.

I. UNSCHEDULED ORAL COMMUNICATION

Ms. Brunette Harris advised that the commissioners and the City had the Citizen Participation Plan prior to Ms. Furtado passing it out on this evening, all of it, so it should be nothing new to Ms. Furtado and the attorney. The City was supposed to have a community forum, and there has not been one held. She stated that it's an insult to her community, the Board is an insult. Related to the three-minute time period allowed for public comment, she doesn't want her words narrowed down, she would like for everything she states, word for word, put into the minutes.

Ms. Ashley Werner commented that on the topic of citizen participation, her organization has worked extensively, and continues to work with the City, and with residents throughout South Fresno who really do want to participate. While she appreciates the enhanced outreach efforts, she believes that there is a disconnect between the City and the residents and that forming personal relationships would be helpful. Ms. Werner spoke about her desire to expand outreach to people in the community who would be suited to deliver information in a way that is understood so that individuals will get involved.

J. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to bring before the Housing and Community Development Commission, the meeting adjourned at 6:09 p.m.

The next scheduled Commission meeting is on **September 28, 2016.**

{SIGNATURES ON FILE}

Bob Farrar, HCDC Chairperson

Kelli Furtado, Assistant Director
Development and Resource Management