



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: ID18-0565 **Version:** 1 **Name:**
Type: Action Item **Status:** Passed
File created: 4/25/2018 **In control:** City Council
On agenda: 5/24/2018 **Final action:** 5/24/2018

Title: HEARING to consider adoption of resolutions related to the designation of properties to the Local Register of Historic Resources
1.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home located at 1608/1616 S. Minnewawa Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 5) (Subject to Mayor's veto)
2.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the Elia Home located at 634-640 Van Ness Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3) (Subject to Mayor's veto)

Sponsors: Planning and Development Department

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. 1.Designation Criteria for the Local Register of Historic Resources (FMC 12-1607), 2. 2.DPR forms_Senator Hays Home_Minnewawa, 3. 3.CC Resolution_Senator Hays Home_Minnewawa, 4. 4.DPR forms_Elia Home_Van Ness, 5. 5.CC Resolution_Elia Home_Van Ness

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
5/24/2018	1	City Council	adopted	Pass

REPORT TO THE CITY COUNCIL

May 24, 2017

FROM: JENNIFER K. CLARK, AICP, Director
Development and Resource Management Department

THROUGH: DANIEL ZACK, AICP, Assistant Director
Development and Resource Management Department

BY: LAURA VAN ONNA Historic Preservation Specialist
Development and Resource Management Department

SUBJECT

HEARING to consider adoption of resolutions related to the designation of properties to the Local Register of Historic Resources
1.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home located at 1608/1616 S. Minnewawa Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 5) (Subject to Mayor's veto)
2.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the Elia Home located at 634-640 Van Ness Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3) (Subject to Mayor's veto)

RECOMMENDATION

The Historic Preservation Commission recommends that the City Council adopt the attached Resolutions designating the Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home located at 1608/1616 S. Minnewawa Avenue and the Elia Home located at 634-640 Van Ness Avenue to the Local Register of Historic Resources pursuant to Fresno Municipal Code 12-1607 and 12-1609.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The owners of the Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home and the Elia Home have requested in writing that their properties be considered for listing on Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources. The residences were evaluated with respect to the historic resource criteria of the City of Fresno's Historic Preservation Ordinance, Article 16 of Chapter 12 of the Fresno Municipal Code, and were publicly noticed in the *Fresno Bee* as required by the Ordinance. The Historic Preservation Commission held noticed public hearings on March 26, 2018 and April 23, 2018 and concluded that the properties were eligible for listing on the Local Register of Historic Resources. The Commission hereby forwards the nominations to the City Council for consideration.

BACKGROUND

The Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home (1937) is a single-family home/ranch complex, which consists of 3,965 square feet and five bedrooms, in the Sunnyside neighborhood. It draws from a variety of architectural styles such as Craftsman (e.g., exposed rafter tails), Tudor Revival (e.g., front gabled façade bay and four cantilevered second story windows), and Colonial Revival (e.g., interior main staircase, low pitched shingled roof and exterior white paint with green shutters). The period of significance identified for this property is 1937-1993. The property was initially 44 acres and was purchased by Senator Ray Hays and his wife Marie Christina Hays who moved to this ranch in 1937 from a home at 4th and Balch near Roosevelt High School (Hays 2018). Hays was a member of the California State Senate from 1930 to 1942. Ray and Marie raised four children on the ranch, two sons (both attorneys) and two daughters (Senate Resolution No. 25, 1973). Senator Ray Hays died in 1973 and his wife in 1993. The move to the "suburbs" in the 1930s was part of the development of what is now the Sunnyside Neighborhood which was formerly part of the Easterby Rancho, platted in 1868. In June 1880, Theodore Kearney and N.K. Masten purchased the Easterby Rancho and continued to develop its use for orchards and vineyards. The section of S Minnewawa Avenue in front of the Hays Home, lined with 120-year old olive and palm trees planted with the supervision of Kearney, is a designated historic landscape on the Fresno County Landmark list (Fresno County Historical Landmark Nomination, 2000). Land use changed over time for the Hays Home, and alterations took place to the original residence such as the installation of a pool and cabanas ca. 1998 and the enclosure of the back porch beneath the sleeping porch in the late 1990s; however, the residence retains impeccable integrity.

The Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home is eligible for listing under Criterion i as an early important suburban ranch property in the development of the Sunnyside neighborhood; under Criterion ii for its association with a family of importance to the community, specifically Ray Hays who served as State Senator between 1930 and 1942; and under Criterion iii for its architectural distinction as a rambling country estate and complex with multiple design influences prominent in Fresno, and the country, between the two World Wars.

The Elia Home (1915, 1935) consists of a two-story duplex, or multiple-family residence that exhibits elements of the Folk Victorian and Colonial Revival architectural styles with the addition of a one-story storefront commercial building that exhibits elements of the Art Deco architectural style in the Armenian Town neighborhood in Downtown Fresno. The period of significance identified for this property is 1915-2001. The Elia family occupied the property from the time of its construction up until the death of Anna Elia in 2001. Sam and Ruth Elia constructed the two-story duplex residence in 1915 with the intention of occupying the first story unit (636) and providing housing for the children in the second-story unit (634), after which it would be rented out. By 1935, Sam had partnered with his son Joe in a painting contracting firm called “Sam Elia & Son” and were operating out of the newly-constructed, one-story storefront commercial building at 640 Van Ness Avenue. Sam retired in 1951, at which point “Aram’s Watch & Clock Shop” began renting and operating out of the storefront commercial building and continued to until 1969, when the building was vacated. The 60 plus-block neighborhood of Armenian Town contains only fragments of Fresno’s original Armenian community. Armenian Town initially developed as a mixed use neighborhood, primarily with residential use but naturally developed into a mixed use neighborhood with diminishing pockets of residential use and growing patches of commercial use, especially along Van Ness Avenue.

The Elia Home is eligible for listing in the City of Fresno’s Local Register of Historic Resources. The property is greater than 50 years of age and possesses integrity of location, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association (FMC 12-1607). Additionally, it is significant under Local Register Criterion i because it is associated with the early development of the Armenian Town neighborhood and worked toward honoring a rich segment of Fresno’s early ethnic history and Criterion iii because it has distinction as a Live/Work property type, specifically as a residence with a storefront commercial addition.

Local Register Criteria and Protocols:

The City’s Historic Preservation Ordinance is found at Article 16 of Chapter 12 of the Fresno Municipal Code. Section 1607 outlines the criteria for designation of a resource to the Local Register of Historic Resources. A “historic resource” is “any building, structure, object or site” which is generally more than fifty years of age and “possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association, and:

- (i) Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- (ii) Is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
- (iii) Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values; or
- (iv) Has yielded or may be likely to yield, information in prehistory or history.

The City’s criteria for assessing significance are patterned after the National Register of Historic Places (1966 as amended) which uses letters A-D for significance. Fresno’s Local Register is also similar, although not equivalent, to the California Register of Historical Resources which uses a numbering system of 1-4 for criteria. Although the concept of “integrity” is not specifically defined in the City’s Ordinance, it is implicitly understood to follow the National Register which defines “integrity” as “the ability of a property to convey its significance.” “To retain integrity a property will always possess several and usually most, of the aspects.” (“How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation” 1988:44).

The process for designating a historic resource is outlined in FMC 12-1609. In brief, a request to designate a resource to the Local Register may be made by the Council, the Commission, the Secretary to the Commission, the property owner, or an authorized representative of the owner (12-1609(a)). Applications for listing use the state protocol for survey forms with both a DPR 523A (Primary) as well as a DPR 523B (Building, Structure, Object Form) (12-1609(a)(1-9)). A notice must be published in a local newspaper at least ten days prior to the hearing and sent to the property owner as well. Commissioners must also physically visit the property prior to the Commission hearing (12-1609(c)(1)).

ENVIRONMENTAL FINDINGS

The designation of historic properties is not a “project” for the purposes of the California Environmental Quality Act as it will not result in a direct or indirect change in the environment.

LOCAL PREFERENCE

Local preference was not considered because this agenda item does not include a bid or award of a construction services contract.

FISCAL IMPACT

There is no additional impact beyond the expenditure of staff time, which is currently budgeted in the FY18 Adopted Budget.

Attachments:

1. Designation Criteria for the Local Register of Historic Resources and Local Historic Districts (FMC 12-1607).
2. DPR Forms Senator Hays Home - Minnewawa
3. CC Resolution Senator Hays Home - Minnewawa
4. DPR Forms Elia Home - Van Ness
5. CC Resolution Elia Home - Van Ness