



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: ID19-1710 **Version:** 1 **Name:**
Type: Discussion Item **Status:** Agenda Ready
File created: 5/17/2019 **In control:** Historic Preservation Commission
On agenda: 5/20/2019 **Final action:** 5/20/2019
Title: REVIEW AND COMMENT ON THE PRE-APPLICATION, CONSISTING OF CONCEPTUAL GARAGE RECONSTRUCTION PLANS, FOR THE FRANK CURTIN HOME (CONTRIBUTOR TO WILSON ISLAND HISTORIC DISTRICT) LOCATED AT 707 E FLORADORA AVENUE PURSUANT TO FMC 12-1606(a)(2) AND (b)(23).

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. Frank Curtin Home Pre-App Attachments

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

5/20/2019	1	Historic Preservation Commission	presented	
-----------	---	----------------------------------	-----------	--

May 20, 2019

FROM: DANIEL ZACK, AICP
Assistant Director
Development and Resource Management Department

BY: LAURA GROVES van ONNA
Historic Preservation Specialist
Development and Resource Management Department

SUBJECT:
REVIEW AND COMMENT ON THE PRE-APPLICATION, CONSISTING OF CONCEPTUAL GARAGE RECONSTRUCTION PLANS, FOR THE FRANK CURTIN HOME (CONTRIBUTOR TO WILSON ISLAND HISTORIC DISTRICT) LOCATED AT 707 E FLORADORA AVENUE PURSUANT TO FMC 12-1606(a)(2) AND (b)(23).

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Commission review and comment on the Pre-Application, consisting of conceptual garage reconstruction plans, for the Frank Curtin Home (contributor to Wilson Island Historic District) located at 707 E Floradora Avenue pursuant to FMC 12-1606(a)(2) and (b)(23). The purpose of this review and comment is to initiate discussion and to provide advisement before moving forward in preparation for a proposed project. Review of a Pre-Application is not a formal project review, cannot result in an approval or denial, and may not be relied upon by an applicant for any purpose other than obtaining generally-applicable information about the historic review process.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The owner of the Frank Curtin Home has requested that their Pre-Application, consisting of conceptual garage reconstruction plans, be reviewed and commented upon by the Historic Preservation Commission. Primary concern for Staff is the rear portion of the property that is visible from the public right-of-way, as the subject property is located on a corner parcel, and the potential effect of its substantial alteration on the overall historic character of the property. Staff encourages discussion in pursuit of optimal design that enhances, and minimizes any potential adverse effects to, the historic character of the property.

Pursuant to FMC 12-1606(a)(2) and (b)(23), Staff requests that the Commission review and comment on this Pre-Application for the purposes of initiating discussion and providing advisement before moving forward in preparation for a proposed project. Review of a Pre-Application is not a formal project review, cannot result in an approval or denial, and may not be relied upon by an applicant for any purpose other than obtaining generally-applicable information about the historic review process.

BACKGROUND

The owner of the Frank Curtin Home has requested that their Pre-Application, consisting of conceptual garage reconstruction plans, be reviewed and commented upon by the Historic Preservation Commission.

The conceptual garage reconstruction plans envision the construction of a new garage elongated on the site of the existing garage that would include a studio apartment. Conceptual plans would entail demolition of the existing garage, which has tested positive for lead, and construction of a new garage that would include a front gabled roof with composite shingles, simple brackets and open, overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails to in addition to bevel, or Dolly Varden, wood siding with mitered corners to match the existing garage. Fenestration would be similar to what is present on the existing garage, with four single-hung windows along the north elevation and the addition of three sets of French doors along the south elevation. The west elevation would include the garage door accessed by the existing driveway along the north property line, and the east elevation would include a barn door to match the exterior siding.

Upon initial review of the Pre-Application for the Frank Curtin Home, Staff finds that the rear portion of the property that is visible from the public right-of-way is the primary concern; because the subject property is located on a corner parcel, its substantial alteration could have a potential effect on the overall historic character of the property. The rehabilitation as proposed appears to comply with the Site Design Development Standards as put forth in the Development Code under Chapter 15, Article 9 for Residential Single-Family Districts and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standard's for Reconstruction*. Staff encourages discussion in pursuit optimal design that enhances, and minimizes any potential adverse effects to, the historic character of the property.

The intention of this Pre-Application is 1) to obtain advice and guidance on retaining a sense of place for this historic resource while considering adaptation and innovation for present and future needs and 2) to gain a consensus on what is recommended, what is likely to be permissible, and what may require further discussion.

The Frank Curtin Home (c. 1912) located at 707 E Floradora Avenue consists of a one and one-

half-story Craftsman style residence and a detached two-car garage with a driveway along the north property line within the rear portion of the property that leads to N Linden Avenue. It was among the first one-third of residences constructed in the 6-block area of Wilson's North Fresno Tract known locally as the "Wilson Island." And, it was occupied by the Curtin family for 95 years until it was sold in 2008, thereby holding the record for longest ownership of a home in the Wilson Island.

The Frank Curtin Home is a contributor to the Wilson Island Historic District. The Resolution designating the Wilson Island Historic District to the Local Register of Historic Resources as a Local Historic District was adopted by Fresno City Council on October 29, 2009 pursuant to FMC 12-1607 (b) under Criteria i, ii, iii and iv. The "Wilson Island" is located within Fresno's Tower District and encompasses 80 properties which are within the larger Wilson's North Fresno Tract, a subdivision first developed in 1908 by Rosanna C. Wilson and her son A. Polette Wilson. It is one of the most architecturally distinct neighborhoods in Fresno, with a mix representing the major styles prevalent during the period of 1910-1954. Several of the homes in this 6-block neighborhood were designed by prominent local and regional architects (and/or building firms). From an earlier era when people lived in more socially mixed neighborhoods, the Wilson Island represents a move to a new "suburbia," based to some extent on social standing and education.

Duties and Powers of the Commission:

The City's Historic Preservation Ordinance is located at Chapter 12, Article 16 of the Fresno Municipal Code.

Section 1606 outlines the duties and powers of the Commission. Sections 1606(a)(2) and (b)(23) specifically refer to the duties entailing review, comment, advisement, and guidance for historic resources:

(a)(2) The regulation of exterior alterations visible from a public right-of-way including demolition, relocation and new construction, and interior alterations which would affect the significance of Historic Resources or Historic Districts.

(b)(23) Render advice and guidance, upon the request of a property owner or tenant on the financial and physical aspects of the restoration, alteration, rehabilitation, landscaping or maintenance of any Historic Resource, any Contributor to any Historic District (LHD or NRD) or any Heritage Property.

Historic Review Pre-Application Submittal Check List

The Submittal Check List for the Historic Review Pre-Application is not as comprehensive and final as it would be for a formal project review, and includes the following:

- Current Photographs
 - At least one overall view of the property
 - A detailed view of each historic feature that involves the proposed work
- Conceptual Plans
 - An existing site plan (and a proposed site plan if different from existing), which can be hand-

drawn and is not required to be scale.

- Inspirational visuals and descriptions for the proposed work

Attachments

Exhibit A: State of California Survey Forms for the Frank Curtin Home 707 E Floradora Avenue
Prepared July 31, 2009 by Karana Hattersley-Drayton for the City of Fresno.

Exhibit B: Historic Review Pre-Application Submittal from the owner of the Frank Curtin Home
(contributor to Wilson Island Historic District) located at 707 E Floradora Avenue,
May 2019.