



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: ID#15-989 **Version:** 2 **Name:**

Type: Action Item **Status:** Passed

File created: 10/29/2015 **In control:** City Council

On agenda: 12/3/2015 **Final action:** 12/3/2015

Title: HEARING to consider adoption of resolutions related to the designation of properties to the Local Register of Historic Resources

- 1.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the Azteca Theater (Teatro Azteca) located at 836-840 F Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3)
- 2.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the Dudley and Elsie Bates Home located at 718 E. Carmen Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 1).
- 3.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the Judy Tobacco Building located at 155 Van Ness Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).
- 4.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the Squirt Bottling Company Building located at 152 M Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).
- 5.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the Alice and John Williams Home located at 1525 N. Wishon Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 1).
- 6.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the United Grocers Inc. Wholesale Grocery Building located at 414 P Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).
- 7.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the White Truck Company/Electric Motor Shop Building located at 245 Fulton Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).

Sponsors: Planning and Development Department

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. Designation Criteria.pdf, 2. Primary and BSO Forms for the Azteca Theater, 3. Resolution Designating the Azteca Theater, 4. Primary and BSO Forms for the Dudley and Elsie Bates Home, 5. Resolution Designating the Dudley and Elsie Bates Home, 6. Primary and BSO Forms for the Judy Tobacco Building, 7. Resolution Designating the Judy Tobacco Building, 8. Primary and BSO Forms for the Squirt Bottling Company, 9. Resolution Designating the Squirt Bottling Company, 10. Primary and BSO Forms for the Alice and John Williams Home, 11. Resolution Designating the Alice and John Williams Home, 12. Primary and BSO Forms for the United Grocers, Inc. Wholesale Grocery Building, 13. Resolution Designating the United Grocers Inc. Wholesale Grocery Building, 14. Primary and BSO Forms for the White Company Trucks Electric Motor Company Building, 15. Resolution Designating the White Truck Company Electric Motor Shop Building

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
12/3/2015	2	City Council	approved	Pass

REPORT TO THE CITY COUNCIL

December 3, 2015

FROM: JENNIFER K. CLARK, AICP, Director
Development and Resource Management Department

BY: KARANA HATTERSLEY-DRAYTON, M.A., Historic Preservation Project Manager
Development and Resource Management Department

SUBJECT

HEARING to consider adoption of resolutions related to the designation of properties to the Local Register of Historic Resources

- 1.*** **RESOLUTION** - Designating the Azteca Theater (Teatro Azteca) located at 836-840 F Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3)
- 2.*** **RESOLUTION** - Designating the Dudley and Elsie Bates Home located at 718 E. Carmen Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 1).
- 3.*** **RESOLUTION** - Designating the Judy Tobacco Building located at 155 Van Ness Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).
- 4.*** **RESOLUTION** - Designating the Squirt Bottling Company Building located at 152 M Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).
- 5.*** **RESOLUTION** - Designating the Alice and John Williams Home located at 1525 N. Wishon Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 1).
- 6.*** **RESOLUTION** - Designating the United Grocers Inc. Wholesale Grocery Building located at 414 P Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).
- 7.*** **RESOLUTION** - Designating the White Truck Company/Electric Motor Shop Building located at 245 Fulton Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).

RECOMMENDATION

The Historic Preservation Commission recommends that the City Council adopt the attached Resolutions designating the Azteca Theater, the Dudley and Elsie Bates Home, The Judy Tobacco Building, The Squirt Bottling Company Building, The Alice and John Williams Home (Stonehedge Hall), The United Grocers Inc. Wholesale Grocery Building and the White Truck Company/Electric Motor Shop to the Local Register of Historic Resources pursuant to FMC 12-1607 and 12-1609.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The property owners for the Azteca Theater, the Dudley and Elsie Bates Home, The Judy Tobacco Building, The Squirt Bottling Company Building, The Alice and John Williams Home (Stonehedge Hall), The United Grocers Inc. Wholesale Grocery Building and the White Truck Company/Electric Motor Shop have requested in writing that their buildings be considered for designation to Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources. The seven properties were evaluated with respect to the historic resource criteria of the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance, Fresno Municipal Code (FMC) Article 16 of Chapter 12 and were publicly noticed in the *Fresno Bee* as required by the Ordinance. The City of Fresno's Historic Preservation Commission held a noticed public hearing on September 28, 2015 and concluded that all of the properties were eligible for listing on the Local Register. The Commission hereby forwards these nominations to the City Council for consideration.

BACKGROUND

The following properties have been found eligible for the Local Register of Historic Resources through a formal evaluation:

The **Azteca Theater (Teatro Azteca)** opened on November 30, 1948 with a program of Spanish language films (and live performances) which catered to Fresno's *Mexicano* community. Under the management of the Mexican-born entertainer and entrepreneur, Arturo Tirado, the theater also served as a venue for appearances by the leading film stars of the Mexican cinema and additionally as a community center. When for example in March 1966 Cesar Chavez led striking farmworkers on the march from Delano to the capitol in Sacramento, they stopped in Fresno and held a rally in the Azteca that was attended by 1,000 people. The theater was designed by an English-born architect J.C. Johnson initially in a more flamboyant Spanish revival style with a cantilevered second floor on the façade. The design as built was a much more restrained Art Deco retro with a stepped parapet and blade sign stating the theater name, "Azteca," which may have communicated home to those working class families from central Mexico. The Azteca Theater has previously been evaluated as individually eligible for listing on both the California and the Local Registers in the 2006 Chinatown Historic Survey and the 2010/2011 survey for the High Speed Rail Authority. The Azteca Theater appears eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places (nomination currently in progress) and for the California Register of Historical Resources under Criteria 1, 2 and 3 and for Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources under Criteria i, ii and iii.

The **Dudley and Elsie Bates Home** is a Prairie style residence with influences from the Tudor (due to the placement of the chimney on the façade of the home). It was constructed in 1925 by contractor S.L. Allen for insurance agent Dudley Bates and his wife Elsie. In 1932 the property was purchased by Philip Conley who served as the Fresno Deputy District Attorney from 1921 to 1922 and thereafter was a judge for the Fresno County Superior Court and a Presiding Judge of the California Court of Appeals, fifth Appellate District in Fresno. In 1958 Conley married Phoebe McClatchy, the widow of Carlos McClatchy former editor of the *Fresno Bee*. The new Mrs. Conley apparently did not appreciate the home and the Conleys moved to her home on Huntington Boulevard (HP#282). The Bates Home is currently a contributor to the designated Wilson Island Historic District and appears individually eligible under Criteria i, ii and iii.

The **Judy Tobacco Building** is one of several commercial buildings recently evaluated in the California Office of Historic Preservation sponsored South Van Ness Industrial District Historic Survey. It was constructed in 1945 by builder, L.E. Gibson in a Mid-Century modern style of red brick with Art Deco articulations on the façade. The building's first owner was Andrew R. Judy whose business, the Judy Wholesale Distributors (candy and tobacco) occupied the building from 1948 through the 1980s. The current owner has rehabilitated the building and is converting it to a high-end boxing gym. The Judy Tobacco Building was evaluated by consultants Architecture+History as eligible for both the California Register of Historical Resources and the Local Register of Historic Resources under Criterion 3/iii as a rare and intact example of (late) Art Deco commercial architecture in the survey area.

The **Squirt Bottling Company** is a World War II steel Quonset hut that was repurposed and moved to the current site in 1946, following the War. Quonset huts are lightweight prefabricated structures of galvanized steel with a semicircular cross-section forming an arched roof. They were designed after a template used by the British during World War I. Following World War II Quonset huts were recycled and sold to the public; they can occasionally still be seen on San Joaquin Valley farms as an outbuilding. This example is a rare surviving Quonset hut within urban Fresno. It was assembled on site and used by the Squirt Company of Fresno for bottling and as a warehouse. The hut has a false front apparently of wood with a stucco finish. The former Squirt Bottling Company was evaluated as eligible for listing under Criterion iii on Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources in the South Van Ness Industrial District Historic Survey.

The Alice and John Williams Home (Stonehedge Hall) is a 1½ story Arts and Crafts style home located three blocks southwest of Fresno City College in Wilson’s North Fresno Tract, a subdivision first developed in 1908 by Rosanna C. Wilson and her son A. Polette Wilson. Unlike the homes to the west in the more exclusive “Wilson Island Historic District” this residence was located on the Fresno Beach street car line which ran up Wishon Avenue beginning in 1914 and connected residents of these suburbs with businesses downtown as well as recreational opportunities at the San Joaquin River. The home was later used as a residence hall “for Selective Women Students” possibly by Alice Williams following the death of her husband. The home is 100 years old and is one of the earliest extant residences in this neighborhood. It is a fine example of an Arts and Crafts style home built for the middle class. Other than the dormer windows which have been replaced with vinyl, the building has excellent integrity to its period of significance of 1915. It appears eligible for individual listing on the Local Register of Historic Resources under Criteria i and iii.

The United Grocers Inc. Wholesale Grocery Building is another property evaluated for the South Van Ness Industrial District Historic Survey. The two-story brick warehouse is articulated with pilasters of buff colored brick as well as a painted black concrete bond beam which gives this commercial property a distinctive appeal and aesthetic. No original building permit exists but the building appears on the 1928 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map labeled as “United Grocers, Inc. Wholesale Grocery.” State Route 41 literally cut the building in half when the freeway was punched through the area and the north end of the property was removed. Nevertheless, the surviving building has high integrity to its period of significance and was evaluated as eligible for both the California Register of Historical Resources and the Local Register of Historic Resources under Criteria 3/iii.

The **White Truck Company/Electric Motor Shop** was built in 1919 by D.A. Carew with exterior upgrades in 1949 by L.H. Hansen when the Electric Motor Shop purchased the building. The first known tenant was a truck company, the White Company. The building as initially constructed quoted the Mission Revival, with a restrained stepped parapet, and a rhythm of solid piers along the façade. The 1949 exterior upgrade accentuated the piers with brick decorative tiles near to the cornice as well as brick coping along the roof line which drew upon the Art Deco aesthetic. Curiously, although the Art Deco faded as an architectural style by the late 1930s, it is quoted not only on this building but on others as well within the project area. The White Truck Company/Electric Motor Shop was recommended as eligible for both the California Register as well as the Local Register of Historic Resources under Criterion 3/iii.

Local Register Criteria and Protocols: The City’s Historic Preservation Ordinance is located at Chapter 12, Article 16. Section 1607 outlines the criteria for designation of a resource to the Local Register of Historic Resources. A “historic resource” is “any building, structure, object or site” which is generally more than fifty years of age and “possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association, and:

- (i) Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- (ii) Is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
- (iii) Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values; or
- (iv) Has yielded or may be likely to yield, information in prehistory or history.

The City's criteria for assessing significance are patterned after the National Register of Historic Places (1966 as amended) which uses letters A-D for significance. Fresno's Local Register is also similar, although not equivalent, to the California Register of Historical Resources which uses a numbering system of 1-4 for criteria. Although the concept of "integrity" is not specifically defined in the City's Ordinance, it is implicitly understood to follow the National Register which defines "integrity" as "the ability of a property to convey its significance." "To retain integrity a property will always possess several and usually most, of the aspects" of integrity ("How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation" 1988:44).

The process for designating a historic resource is outlined in FMC 12-1609. In brief, a request to designate a resource to the Local Register may be made by the Council, the Commission, the Secretary to the Commission, the property owner, or an authorized representative of the owner (12-1609(a)). Applications for listing use the state protocol for survey forms with both a DPR 523A (Primary) as well as a DPR 523B (Building, Structure, Object Form) (12-1609(a)(1-9)). A notice must be published in a local newspaper at least 10 days prior to the hearing and sent to the property owner as well. Commissioners must also physically visit the property prior to the Commission hearing (12-1609(c)(1)).

ENVIRONMENTAL FINDINGS

The designation of historic properties is not a "project" for the purposes of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), as it will not result in a direct or indirect change in the environment.

LOCAL PREFERENCE

Local preference was not considered because this does not include a bid or award of a construction or services contract.

FISCAL IMPACT

There is no additional impact beyond the expenditure of staff time.

Attachments:

1. Designation Criteria for the Local Register of Historic Resources (FMC 12-1607).
2. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the Azteca Theater, 836-840 F Street, Fresno.
3. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California, Designating Azteca Theater (Teatro Azteca) Located at 836-840 F Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources.
4. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the Dudley and Elsie Bates Home, 718 E. Carmen Avenue, Fresno.
5. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California, Designating the Dudley and Elsie Bates Home Located at 718 E. Carmen Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources.
6. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the Judy Tobacco Building, 155 Van Ness Avenue, Fresno.
7. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California, Designating the Judy Tobacco Building Located at 155 Van Ness Avenue Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources.

8. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the Squirt Bottling Company, 152 M Street, Fresno.
9. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California, Designating the Squirt Bottling Company Building Located at 152 M Street Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources.
10. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the Alice and John Williams Home, 1525 N. Wishon Avenue, Fresno.
11. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California, Designating the Alice and John Williams Home Located at 1515 N. Wishon Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources.
12. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the United Grocers, Inc. Wholesale Grocery Building, 414 P Street, Fresno.
13. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California, Designating the United Grocers, Inc. Wholesale Grocery Building Located at 414 P Street Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources.
14. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the White Company Trucks/Electric Motor Shop Building, 245 Fulton Street, Fresno.
15. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California, Designating the White Company Trucks/Electric Motor Shop Building Located at 245 Fulton Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources.