



Legislation Details (With Text)

**File #:** ID 23-202      **Version:** 1      **Name:**

**Type:** Action Item      **Status:** Agenda Ready

**File created:** 1/23/2023      **In control:** Pending Approval

**On agenda:** 2/27/2023      **Final action:** 2/27/2023

**Title:** HEARING TO CONSIDER AND MAKE FINDINGS on application B23-01042 for the demolition of the carriage house at the Collins Home (HP#041) located at 1101 R St. (APN 46606607).

**STAFF RECCOMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) take the following actions:

1. ADOPT a finding of Categorical Exemption pursuant to Sections 15331/Class 31 of the California Environmental Quality Act guidelines
2. APPROVE: Application B23-01042 for the demolition of the carriage house at HP#041 Collins Home located at 1101 R St. (APN 46606607) with conditions.
  - a. Removal contractor will protect the main structure from damage during demolition; and
  - b. Property owner will document the current exterior condition of the Collins Home to update the Historic Resource record; and
  - c. Any proposed future site work including but not limited to additional structures and fencing will be submitted to the Historic Preservation Specialist prior to the commencement of any related work.

**Sponsors:** Planning and Development Department

**Indexes:**

**Code sections:**

**Attachments:** 1. Exhibit A - Collins Home DPR Form HP 041, 2. Exhibit B -Minimum Maintenance Letter HP041 collins home, 3. Exhibit C - Notice and Order to RPN- Signed with proofs of Service- 1107 R Street - E22-10267 - GRC - 11.4.22., 4. Exhibit D - B23-01042 demolition application, 5. Exhibit E – FMC Findings

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
2/27/2023	1	Historic Preservation Commission	APPROVED	Pass

**REPORT TO THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

**February 27, 2023**

**FROM:** JENNIFER CLARK, Director  
Planning and Development Department

**SUBJECT**

HEARING TO CONSIDER AND MAKE FINDINGS on application B23-01042 for the demolition of the carriage house at the Collins Home (HP#041) located at 1101 R St. (APN 46606607).

**STAFF RECCOMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) take the following actions:

1. **ADOPT** a finding of Categorical Exemption pursuant to Sections 15331/Class 31 of the California Environmental Quality Act guidelines
2. **APPROVE:** Application B23-01042 for the demolition of the carriage house at HP#041 Collins Home located at 1101 R St. (APN 46606607) with conditions.
  - a. Removal contractor will protect the main structure from damage during demolition; and
  - b. Property owner will document the current exterior condition of the Collins Home to update the Historic Resource record; and
  - c. Any proposed future site work including but not limited to additional structures and fencing will be submitted to the Historic Preservation Specialist prior to the commencement of any related work.

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The carriage house at 1107 R St was substantially damaged by fire in the fall of 2022. Beginning on November 4, 2022, the property owner was noticed by the City of Fresno that the unsafe conditions were required to be abated. Nicholas F Reyes, property owner, filed application B23-01042 on January 27, 2023. The scope of work is to demolish and remove the fire damaged carriage house and debris.

## BACKGROUND



**H.P. #41**

**Collins Home (1905)**

*1107 R Street  
Stick, Eastlake Influence*

This home was built for James D. Collins. He served in the Confederate Army during the Civil War, was elected to the California Assembly in 1876, and elected Fresno County Sheriff in 1898. It is one of the finest surviving examples of early residential construction in downtown Fresno.

### Project Proposal

Nicholas F Reyes, property owner, filed application B23-01042 on January 27, 2023. The scope of work is to demolish and remove the fire damaged carriage house and debris.

### Project Analysis

HP#41 Collins Home located at 1107 R Street is an individually listed historic resource on the Local Register of Historic Resources therefore any proposed project with a scope of work which proposes substantial alterations to the resource is subject to review by the Commission pursuant to FMC Section 12-1617.

On March 22, 2007, Karana Hattersley-Drayton issued a notice to the property owner to repair moderate maintenance issues at the property including but not limited to wood deterioration, mold due to leaking rain gutters and paint. This notice also informed the property owner of the responsibility to maintain the historic building according to the Minimum Maintenance standards as outlined in the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance.

In the fall of 2022, the carriage house located at the property caught fire. According to Notice and Order issued on November 4, 2022 for Case number E22-10267, the property has residue from the fire which is a danger to public health and welfare. The notice requires that all damaged components be replaced. Given the substantial damage to the exterior and interior structural components, it is infeasible to be reconstructed with retention of any original features.

### Notice of Historic Preservation Commission Hearing

In accordance with Section 12-1617 of the FMC, the Planning and Development Department mailed Notices of this Commission hearing to surrounding property owners within 2,000 feet.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL FINDINGS**

The project is consistent with a Class 31 finding of exemption.

## **FRESNO MUNICIPAL CODE FINDINGS**

Based upon analysis of the application, the required findings by the Historic Preservation Commission to approve application permit B22-10883 FMC Section 12-1617 (h) are as follows:

**FINDING 1** is not applicable.

**FINDING 2** can be made because the removal of the structure is necessary to correct an unsafe or dangerous condition on the property.

**FINDING 3** cannot be made because there is no evidence that the denial of the application will not result in unreasonable economic hardship to the owner.

**FINDING 4** is not applicable because the site is not required for a public use which will directly benefit the public health, safety and welfare and will be of more benefit than the Historic Resource.

**FINDING 5** is not applicable because this is not an application for relocation of an Historic Resource.

**Staff Recommendation:**

Based upon analysis of the application, staff recommends approval of Application B23-01042 for the demolition of the carriage house at HP#041 Collins Home located at 1101 R St. (APN 46606607) with conditions:

- a) Removal contractor will protect the main structure from damage during demolition; and
- b) Property owner will document the current exterior condition of the Collins Home to update the Historic Resource record; and
- c) Any proposed future site work including but not limited to additional structures and fencing will be submitted to the Historic Preservation Specialist prior to the commencement of any related work.

## **CONCLUSION**

The appropriateness of the proposed project has been examined with respect to its consistency to the Fresno Municipal Code (FMC) Section 12-1617. The proposed project has been described and analyzed above and by the accompanying environmental assessment. Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) approve with conditions Application B23-01042 for the demolition of the carriage house at HP#041 Collins Home located at 1101 R St. (APN 46606607).

## **ATTACHMENTS:**

- Exhibit A - Historic Resources Inventory Form
- Exhibit B - Notice of Minimum Maintenance Standards issued 3/22/2007
- Exhibit C - Notice and Order E22-10267
- Exhibit D - Building Permit Application B23-01042
- Exhibit E - FMC Findings