



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: ID17-0015 **Version:** 1 **Name:**

Type: Action Item **Status:** Continued in Council

File created: 12/7/2016 **In control:** City Council

On agenda: 1/12/2017 **Final action:**

Title: (HEARING CONTINUED - DATE AND TIME TO BE DETERMINED)
CONTINUED HEARING to consider adoption of resolutions related to the designation of properties to the Local Register of Historic Resources

1. *** RESOLUTION - Designating the C.J. Ryland Home located at 573 E. Terrace Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 1).
2. *** RESOLUTION - Designating the J.B. Inderrieden Company Building located at 2721 Ventura Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).
3. *** RESOLUTION - Designating the David and Frances Bruner Home located at 215 N. Clark Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 7).
4. *** RESOLUTION - Designating the Armenian Town Historic District to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).

Sponsors: Planning and Development Department

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. Criteria 1.pdf, 2. Resolution 1.pdf, 3. Resolution 2.pdf, 4. Resolution 3.pdf, 5. Resolution 4.pdf, 6. State of CA Form 1.pdf, 7. State of CA Form 2.pdf, 8. State of CA Form 3.pdf, 9. State of CA Form 4.pdf

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
1/26/2017	1	City Council	continued	
1/12/2017	1	City Council	continued	

REPORT TO THE CITY COUNCIL

January 26, 2017

FROM: JENNIFER K. CLARK, AICP, Director
Development and Resource Management Department

THROUGH: DANIEL ZACK, AICP, Assistant Director
Development and Resource Management Department

BY: KARANA HATTERSLEY-DRAYTON, M.A. Historic Preservation Project Manager
Development and Resource Management Department

SUBJECT
(HEARING CONTINUED - DATE AND TIME TO BE DETERMINED)
CONTINUED HEARING to consider adoption of resolutions related to the designation of properties to

the Local Register of Historic Resources

- 1.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the C.J. Ryland Home located at 573 E. Terrace Avenue, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 1).
- 2.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the J.B. Inderrieden Company Building located at 2721 Ventura Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).
- 3.*** RESOLUTION - Designating the David and Frances Bruner Home located at 215 N. Clark Street, Fresno, California to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 7).
- 4.***RESOLUTION - Designating the Armenian Town Historic District to the Local Register of Historic Resources (Council District 3).

RECOMMENDATION

The Historic Preservation Commission recommends that the City Council adopt the attached Resolutions designating the C.J. Ryland Home located at 573 E. Terrace Avenue, the J.B. Inderrieden Company Building located at 2721 Ventura Street, the David and Frances Bruner Home located at 215 N. Clark Street and the Armenian Town Historic District to the Local Register of Historic Resources pursuant to Fresno Municipal Code 12-1603(s), 12-1607 and 12-1609.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The owners of the C.J. Ryland Home and the J.B. Inderrieden Company Building have requested in writing that their properties be considered for listing on Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources. The residences were evaluated with respect to the historic resource criteria of the City of Fresno's Historic Preservation Ordinance, Article 16 of Chapter 12 of the Fresno Municipal Code, and were publicly noticed in the *Fresno Bee* as required by the Ordinance. The Historic Preservation Commission held a noticed public hearing on November 14, 2016 and concluded that the properties were eligible for listing on the Local Register of Historic Resources. The property owner of the David and Frances Bruner Home has not formally requested designation of his Craftsman Bungalow to the Local Register. The single family residence has been reviewed for its eligibility pursuant to General Plan Policy HCR-2-g which requires that staff, and as appropriate, the City's Historic Preservation Commission review all demolition permits for the potential that the resource may be eligible for historic designation. The property was found eligible for listing on October 24, 2016 at a publicly noticed meeting of the Commission.

The proposed Armenian Town Historic District includes 11 parcels with a total of 17 resources. An Initial Application with proposed boundary map was presented to the Commission at a noticed public hearing on June 27, 2016. The Formal Application with revised District Map was adopted at a public hearing on November 14, 2016 and is supported to by a majority of the property owners. The Commission hereby forwards the nominations to the City Council for consideration

BACKGROUND

The C.J. Ryland Home (circa 1924) is a Period Revival Home with French eclectic detailing. The parcel is located in the prestigious St. Francis Wood Tract and was purchased by C.J. Ryland on August 18, 1921. The sale was finalized by Winnie Ryland on St. Patrick's Day in 1923. Of interest is that the sale document clearly stated zoning and building regulations for the Tract as well as exclusionary covenants (illegal today). Thus the property could not be sold, rented or conveyed to any person or persons of "Negro, Mongolian or Asiatic origin, nor to any subject or former subject of

the Turkish Empire...” Houses constructed on the parcel had to cost at least \$5,000, which assured that the subdivision would be exclusive. The house has a rambling plan that wraps the northwest corner of E. Terrace Avenue and the beautifully landscaped North Van Ness Boulevard. Character-defining features of this property include clipped gables, a distinctive round arched wood panel front door and an entryway with a surround of decorative brick quoins. The home has impeccable integrity to its period of construction (circa 1924) and the garage and green house (1936) are contributors. Architect Columbus Ryland was the business partner of Fred Swartz and together the firm designed numerous homes and commercial properties in Fresno and the San Joaquin Valley. The best known of their commissions was the Fresno State College Library (now Fresno City College). The home appears to be eligible for listing under Criterion ii for its association with a person of importance in Fresno history, under Criterion iii as the work of a master, C.J. Ryland and as an architectural jewel, and as a contributor to the proposed Terrace Gardens Historic District (Criterion i).

J.B. Inderrieden Company Building was constructed in 1925 as a raisin packing plant for a Chicago-based cannery and packing company. It is one of several commercial buildings located on R Street (actual address is on Ventura Street) which is part of the proposed Warehouse Row Historic District. The reinforced concrete building is rectangular in plan and has a stepped parapet. It was designed by James A. McCullough who was an architect, engineer and builder. The Inderrieden Building was previously evaluated in the 1994 Ratkovich Survey and found eligible for listing for both its architectural (Criterion iii) and economic significance (Criterion i). The property owners, Bitwise Land Company LLC have submitted plans for the restoration and adaptive reuse of the warehouse as a second site for Bitwise Industries, to house technology start-ups. The conceptual plans for the project were approved by the Commission at the December 19, 2016 public hearing. Historic designation will allow the architects to apply the California Historical Building Code in the restoration.

The David and Frances Bruner Home. The new owner of the 1922 Craftsman bungalow located at 215 N. Clark Street purchased this working class home in early September. Upon receipt of an Inspection Report that suggested serious structural issues he applied for a demolition permit. Pursuant to the City's General Plan Policy HCR-2-g, preservation staff reviewed the demolition permit for the potential that the home might be eligible for listing on the Local Register of Historic Resources. Of the 50-75 demolition permits reviewed by staff each year one or two may be reviewed in the field and documented. On rare occasions the property is evaluated on State survey forms and presented to the City's Historic Preservation Commission for review.

Staff visited the property on September 5th and then again on September 9th to meet with the owner. A staff member from the City's code division was also present at the September 9th meeting and reviewed the Inspection Report with the owner. Two issues of concern to City staff were that the home seemed to have impeccable integrity to its period of integrity of 1922 with only minor maintenance issues (wiring and plumbing need some attention for example). The home is solid on its foundation and with a little clean-up could be available for rental in an area that badly needs housing for working class families. Stylistically, it is similar to several of the contributing homes in the Huntington Boulevard Historic District.

Additionally, this Craftsman bungalow contributes to the integrity of the block. It is adjacent to the 1899 McKay Home, which is listed on Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources (HP#44). On the north side is another pre-1906 Craftsman home that City staff (both Code and Preservation) have worked to secure and preserve. The area is rapidly changing due to expansion by Community Medical Center.

Although modest the home has architectural merit in its own right, with clipped gables, a decorative brick chimney, concrete brick piers and balustrade beveled to appear like rusticated stone, and original multi-light windows. David Bruner and his wife Frances lived in the house from its construction in 1922 (they are actually shown at the address in 1920) through 1954 when Mr. Bruner, a retired mailman died.

Fresno's new downtown and neighborhood plans and development codes as recently adopted by the City Council stress the importance of preserving the City's older neighborhoods as well as the importance of context and adjacency for historic properties.

The Armenian Town Historic District. By the First World War 10,000 Armenians had settled in Fresno, refugees from the genocide that occurred in Turkey and Armenia. A 64-block "Armenian Town" developed here between the two World Wars, due in part to the restrictive covenants that precluded settlement in other parts of the city. Although State Route 41 cut a swath through the heart of this community, numerous buildings, including a church, a bakery, working class cottages and business buildings are extant.

The Armenian Town Historic District includes 11 parcels with a total of 17 resources. Two of the parcels are vacant but are counted as contributors to ensure new in-fill development is sympathetic to the historic neighborhood. All other resources meet the eligibility for age and significance for this dis-contiguous District which straddles State Route 41. Resources within the District include properties already designated on the Local and National Registers as well as several others found eligible in the 2015 South Van Ness Industrial District Historic Survey. The District includes some of the best extant resources from the (former) 64-block Armenian Town, including the Holy Trinity Armenian Apostolic Church and its ancillary buildings, the Valley Lahvosh Bakery and the restored homes and one summer kitchen within the City's Armenian Town Project. Also included are several examples of working class homes that were typical for the era.

Local Historic Districts: The City's Historic Preservation Ordinance (FMC 12-1600 et seq) provides for the designation of both individual properties as well as Local Historic Districts. Local Historic Districts may be contiguous, as with Fresno's Wilson Island Historic District, or thematic and non-contiguous (FMC 12-1603(s)). Designated neighborhood historic districts provide for protection of the character-defining features of the District, compatible infill through design and building permit review, use of the more flexible California Historical Building Code as well as some perks through the City's Zoning Ordinance. Most importantly, historic districts add to a sense of place and community pride and usually lead to enhanced property values. Designated non-residential buildings may also qualify for federal tax credits. Parenthetically, a property's inclusion within a Local Register District does not require that the property owner restore the home or commercial business to an earlier "historic" period, only that the façade of the building retain its current character-defining features. Likewise interior improvements such as upgrades to a kitchen or laundry room are encouraged and not precluded.

Formal Application for a Local Register Historic District: The Formal Application for a Historic District (FMC 12-1610(c)) is prepared once the Initial Application for a District is reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. As outlined at FMC 12-1610(c) the District designation must be consented to by a majority of the property owners within the District. Of the 17 resources six are already individually listed on the Local Register and are thus automatically eligible for inclusion in the District. Signed consent forms have been received from the property owners for the two houses located at 340 and 342 Van Ness. Verbal consent has been given by the former

Redevelopment Agency for inclusion of the three additional homes which were relocated to the former Firehouse site. All of these homes are protected through a Mitigated Negative Declaration which found them eligible for designation in the 2002 Armenian Town Project. Owners of the remaining 6 resources have not responded.

The Formal District Application must also include the approved District map, a District Record and completed DPR survey forms for each resource. A copy of the hearing agenda must be mailed to all the property owners and published once in a local newspaper (12-1610(d)(2)). Letters with the revised draft map, a copy of the Fresno Bee notice and an agenda were sent to all property owners on November 3rd and the notice in the Bee was published on November 4th.

The proposed District includes some of the best extant properties associated with Fresno's Armenian Town, including a church, a commercial bakery and numerous working class houses. The non-contiguous District appears to be significant under the following criteria (12-1607(b)) :

- 1) It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, or architectural heritage;
- 2) It is identified with a person or group that contributed significantly to the culture and development of the city;
- 3) It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.

Local Register Criteria and Protocols:

The City's Historic Preservation Ordinance is found at Article 16 of Chapter 12 of the Fresno Municipal Code. Section 1607 outlines the criteria for designation of a resource to the Local Register of Historic Resources. A "historic resource" is "any building, structure, object or site" which is generally more than fifty years of age and "possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association, and:

- (i) Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- (ii) Is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
- (iii) Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values; or
- (iv) Has yielded or may be likely to yield, information in prehistory or history.

The City's criteria for assessing significance are patterned after the National Register of Historic Places (1966 as amended) which uses letters A-D for significance. Fresno's Local Register is also similar, although not equivalent, to the California Register of Historical Resources which uses a numbering system of 1-4 for criteria. Although the concept of "integrity" is not specifically defined in the City's Ordinance, it is implicitly understood to follow the National Register which defines "integrity" as "the ability of a property to convey its significance." "To retain integrity a property will always possess several and usually most, of the aspects." ("How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation" 1988:44).

The process for designating a historic resource is outlined in FMC 12-1609. In brief, a request to designate a resource to the Local Register may be made by the Council, the Commission, the Secretary to the Commission, the property owner, or an authorized representative of the owner (12-1609(a)). Applications for listing use the state protocol for survey forms with both a DPR 523A (Primary) as well as a DPR 523B (Building, Structure, Object Form) (12-1609(a)(1-9)). A notice must be published in a local newspaper at least ten days prior to the hearing and sent to the property owner as well. Commissioners must also physically visit the property prior to the Commission hearing (12-1609(c)(1)).

ENVIRONMENTAL FINDINGS

The designation of historic properties is not a “project” for the purposes of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) as it will not result in a direct or indirect change in the environment.

LOCAL PREFERENCE

Local preference was not considered because this agenda item does not include a bid or award of a construction services contract.

FISCAL IMPACT

There is no additional impact beyond the expenditure of staff time.

Attachments:

1. Designation Criteria for the Local Register of Historic Resources and Local Historic Districts (FMC 12-1607).
2. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the C.J. Ryland Home located at 573 E. Terrace Avenue, Fresno.
3. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California Designating the C.J. Ryland Home located at 573 E. Terrace Avenue to the Local Register of Historic Resources.
4. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the J.B. Inderrieden Company Building located at 2721 Ventura Street, Fresno.
5. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California Designating the J.B. Inderrieden Company Building located at 2721 Ventura Street, Fresno to the Local Register of Historic Resources.
6. State of California Primary and BSO Forms for the David and Frances Bruner Home located at 215 N. Clark Street.
7. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California Designating the David and Frances Bruner Home located at 215 N. Clark Street, Fresno to the Local Register of Historic Resources.
8. State of California District Record for the Proposed Armenian Town Historic District, Fresno, California.
9. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Fresno, California Designating Armenian Town, Which Includes All Properties Described in Attachment A, as a Local Historic District.