



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: ID18-0446 **Version:** 1 **Name:**
Type: Action Item **Status:** Agenda Ready
File created: 3/23/2018 **In control:** Historic Preservation Commission
On agenda: 3/26/2018 **Final action:** 3/26/2018
Title: CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL OF REQUEST BY THE PROPERTY OWNERS TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL THE DESIGNATION OF THE FOLLOWING PROPERTY TO THE LOCAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC RESOURCES AND ADOPTION OF FINDINGS NECESSARY TO SUPPORT RECOMMENDATION PURSUANT TO FMC 12-1609:

1. The Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home Located at 1608/1616 S Minnewawa Avenue.

Staff Recommendation: Approve and forward to the City Council

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. Exhibit A.pdf

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
3/26/2018	1	Historic Preservation Commission	approved	

REPORT TO THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

March 26, 2018

FROM: DANIEL ZACK, AICP, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR
Development and Resource Management Dept.
Secretary, Historic Preservation Commission

BY: LAURA VAN ONNA
Historic Preservation Specialist

SUBJECT

CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL OF REQUEST BY THE PROPERTY OWNERS TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL THE DESIGNATION OF THE FOLLOWING PROPERTY TO THE LOCAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC RESOURCES AND ADOPTION OF FINDINGS NECESSARY TO SUPPORT RECOMMENDATION PURSUANT TO FMC 12-1609:

1. The Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home Located at 1608/1616 S Minnewawa Avenue.

Staff Recommendation: Approve and forward to the City Council

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Commission find that the Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home be designated for listing to the Local Register of Historic Resources, as meeting the applicable criteria for buildings more than fifty years old in FMC 12-1607(a)(1). If the Commission concurs with the staff recommendation, the property will be forwarded to the Fresno City Council for designation pursuant to FMC 12-1609. As required by the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance, notice of this hearing considering designation of the property was published in *The Fresno Bee* on March 15, 2018.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The owners of the Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home have requested in writing that their properties be considered for listing in Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources. The Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home located at 1608/1616 S Minnewawa Avenue was constructed in 1937 as a single-family home/ranch complex in the Sunnyside neighborhood that exhibits a variety of architectural styles such as Craftsman, Colonial Revival, and Tudor Revival. The design is attributed to architect Charles E. Butner. It meets Criteria i, ii and iii for designation on the Local Register for buildings more than fifty years old (only one is required) as it: is an early important suburban ranch property in the development of the Sunnyside neighborhood (i); is associated with a family of importance to the community - specifically Ray Hays who served as a State Senator between 1930 and 1942 (ii); and has architectural distinction as a rambling country estate and complex with multiple design influences prominent in Fresno, and the country, between the two World Wars (iii).

The Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home (1937) is a single-family home/ranch complex, which consists of 3,965 square feet and five bedrooms, in the Sunnyside neighborhood. It draws from a variety of architectural styles such as Craftsman (e.g., exposed rafter tails), Tudor Revival (e.g., front gabled façade bay and four cantilevered second story windows), and Colonial Revival (e.g., interior main staircase, low pitched shingled roof and exterior white paint with green shutters).

The design of the home is attributed to architect Charles E. Butner (1888-1957) through family and circumstantial history, although there is no documentation to confirm he is the architect such as signed contracts or plans. Butner was prolific in Fresno particularly between 1913 and the 1930s. He designed numerous residential and commercial buildings including the Fresno Republican Printery Building (1919) as part of the firm Glass and Butner; he continued work on his own beginning in the early 1920s. Whether or not Charles Butner is the architect of record for the Hays Home, it is eligible for listing in Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources.

The period of significance identified for this property is 1937-1993. The property was initially 44 acres and was purchased by Senator Ray Hays and his wife Marie Christina Hays who moved to this ranch in 1937 from a home at 4th and Balch near Roosevelt High School (Hays 2018). Hays was a member of the California State Senate from 1930 to 1942. Ray and Marie raised four children on the ranch, two sons (both attorneys) and two daughters (Senate Resolution No. 25, 1973). Senator Ray Hays died in 1973 and his wife in 1993.

The move to the "suburbs" in the 1930s was part of the development of what is now the Sunnyside Neighborhood which was formerly part of the Easterby Rancho, platted in 1868. In June 1880,

Theodore Kearney and N.K. Masten purchased the Easterby Rancho and continued to develop its use for orchards and vineyards. The section of S Minnewawa Avenue in front of the Hays Home, lined with 120-year old olive and palm trees planted with the supervision of Kearney, is a designated historic landscape on the Fresno County Landmark list (Fresno County Historical Landmark Nomination, 2000). Land use changed over time for the Hays Home, and alterations took place to the original residence such as the installation of a pool and cabanas ca. 1998 and the enclosure of the back porch beneath the sleeping porch in the late 1990s; however, the residence retains impeccable integrity.

The home appears to be eligible for listing under Criterion i as an early important suburban ranch property in the development of the Sunnyside neighborhood; under Criterion ii for its association with a family of importance to the community, specifically Ray Hays who served as State Senator between 1930 and 1942; and under Criterion iii for its architectural distinction as a rambling country estate and complex with multiple design influences prominent in Fresno, and the country, between the two World Wars.

BACKGROUND

Local Register Criteria and Protocols:

The City's Historic Preservation Ordinance is located at Chapter 12, Article 16. Section 1607 outlines the criteria for designation of a resource to the Local Register of Historic Resources. A "historic resource" is "any building, structure, object or site" which is generally more than fifty years of age and "possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association, and:

- (i) Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- (ii) Is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
- (iii) Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values; or
- (iv) Has yielded or may be likely to yield, information in prehistory or history."

The City's criteria for assessing significance are patterned after the National Register of Historic Places (1966 as amended) which uses letters A-D for significance. Fresno's Local Register is also similar, although not equivalent, to the California Register of Historical Resources which uses a numbering system of 1-4 for criteria. Although the concept of "integrity" is not specifically defined in the City's Ordinance, it is implicitly understood to follow the National Register which defines "integrity" as "the ability of a property to convey its significance." "To retain integrity a property will always possess several and usually most, of the aspects." (How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation," 1988: 44).

The process for designating a historic resource is outlined in FMC 12-1609. In brief, a request to designate a resource to the Local Register may be made by the Council, the Commission, the Secretary to the Commission, the property owner, or an authorized representative of the owner [12-1609(a)]. Applications for listing use the state protocol for survey forms with both a DPR 523A (Primary) as well as a DPR 523B (Building, Structure, Object Form) [12-1609(a)(1-9)]. A notice must be published in a local newspaper at least 10 days prior to the hearing and sent to the property owner as well. Commissioners must also physically visit the property prior to the Commission hearing [12-1609(c)(1)].

Attachments

Exhibit A: State of California Survey Forms for the Senator Ray W. and Marie Hays Home 1608/1616 S Minnewawa Avenue Prepared by Karana Hattersley-Drayton, M.A. Architectural Historian, 26 January 2018.