



## Legislation Details (With Text)

**File #:** ID19-1708    **Version:** 1    **Name:**  
**Type:** Action Item    **Status:** Agenda Ready  
**File created:** 5/17/2019    **In control:** Historic Preservation Commission  
**On agenda:** 5/20/2019    **Final action:** 5/20/2019  
**Title:** CONSIDER AND MAKE FINDINGS ON THE REVISED APPLICATION PZ17-90000064 BY THE PROPERTY OWNER REGARDING THE DOCK ALONG THE SIDE (NORTH) ELEVATION FACING INYO STREET AT THE STATE CENTER WAREHOUSE (HP #242) LOCATED AT 747 R STREET PURSUANT TO FMC 12-1606(a)(2) AND 12-1617.

**Sponsors:**

**Indexes:**

**Code sections:**

**Attachments:** 1. State Center Warehouse Revised App Attachments

| Date      | Ver. | Action By                        | Action   | Result |
|-----------|------|----------------------------------|----------|--------|
| 5/20/2019 | 1    | Historic Preservation Commission | approved |        |

May 20, 2019

**FROM:** DANIEL ZACK, AICP  
Assistant Director  
Development and Resource Management Department

**BY:** LAURA GROVES van ONNA  
Historic Preservation Specialist  
Development and Resource Management Department

**SUBJECT:**  
CONSIDER AND MAKE FINDINGS ON THE REVISED APPLICATION PZ17-90000064 BY THE PROPERTY OWNER REGARDING THE DOCK ALONG THE SIDE (NORTH) ELEVATION FACING INYO STREET AT THE STATE CENTER WAREHOUSE (HP #242) LOCATED AT 747 R STREET PURSUANT TO FMC 12-1606(a)(2) AND 12-1617.

### RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the Application PZ17-90000064 by the property owner regarding the dock along the side (north) elevation facing Inyo Street at the State Center Warehouse (HP #242) located at 747 R Street pursuant to FMC 12-1606(a)(2) and 12-1617 with the following conditions:

- 1) The Commission concludes that no further discussion is needed regarding potential alternatives;
- 2) Staff will be allowed to photograph before, during and upon completion of the project; and

- 3) Any changes to the approved project will be submitted to the Historic Preservation Specialist prior to the commencement of any related work.

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The owner of the State Center Warehouse has requested that his revised Application PZ17-90000064 for rehabilitation regarding the dock along the side (north) elevation facing Inyo Street be considered for Historic Review. Because these revised plans as proposed are a substantial alteration, they require review by the Historic Preservation Commission. Primary concern for Staff is the potential loss of a prominent character-defining feature along a street-facing elevation of this historic resource. Pursuant to FMC 12-1606(a)(2) and 12-1617, Staff requests that the Commission consider and make findings on revised Application PZ17-90000064.

## BACKGROUND

The owner of the State Center Warehouse has requested that his revised Application PZ17-90000064 for rehabilitation regarding the dock along the side (north) elevation facing Inyo Street be considered for Historic Review. This request entails exterior alterations visible from the public right-of-way which could potentially affect the significance of a historic resource. Because this project proposal is a substantial alteration, it requires review by the Historic Preservation Commission.

Application PZ17-90000064 was initially reviewed and approved by the Commission on December 19, 2016. Revised plans for the side (north) elevation of the building facing Inyo Street entail demolition of the dock and installation of sidewalk, street trees, and windows at basement level. Revised plans were submitted by the property owner due to a recent requirement from the Department of Public Works to have an ADA-accessible path with a minimum width of four feet along the east side of Inyo Street between R Street and the Promenade parking lot.

Upon initial review of the revised Application PZ17-90000064 for the State Center Warehouse, Staff finds that the new construction as proposed does comply with the Purpose and Façade Design Development Standards as put forth in the Development Code under Chapter 15, Article 15 for Downtown Districts. However, in reference to the Historic Preservation Ordinance and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, Staff finds that the potential loss of a prominent character-defining feature along a street-facing elevation of this historic resource is the primary concern as it would diminish the historic integrity of the property.

The project as proposed would not be in accordance with standards 9 and 10 of the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* - which specifically refer to exterior alterations or related new construction:

*9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

*10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

Alternatives to removing the dock completely have been discussed among Staff and with the owner and architect, and were presented to the Commission at its regularly scheduled meeting for further discussion on April 22, 2019. The ideal solution would be to wrap a sidewalk around the existing dock, which would extend into Inyo Street. This would decrease the width of the street significantly; however, the street is already much wider than is needed. The main concern for this alternative is the expense, as the crowning on the street as well as drainage would require adjustment. A potentially less expensive alternative was discussed involving ramping, in effort to retain as much character for the dock as possible; however, any manipulation of it would be substantial and not necessarily preserve its character or provide optimal pedestrian access along the south side of Inyo Street. The subject dock is approximately three feet in height, six bays in length, and spans the full width of the 8-foot sidewalk.

One alternative that may have proven most feasible while meeting everyone's needs is the installation of a "painted safety zone" - an urban tactic that is becoming more common in cities. By painting a southern portion of this segment of Inyo Street and installing concrete planters or other barriers, a safe and pleasant path of travel could be designated for pedestrians while maintaining a character defining feature of the building - its only remaining intact dock along a street-facing elevation. This alternative would need to be further explored, for example, regarding the grading of the street. Inyo Street could potentially require some manipulation in order to bring its cross slope down to 2%, which is the maximum cross slope for a sidewalk or other pedestrian path. In any case, this scenario entails minimal intervention that would probably be of less expense to the applicant and meet Staff's collective requirements.

The discussion that resulted from the meeting on April 22, 2019 did not clearly result in any potential alternatives gaining traction for further consideration. The dock along the side (north) elevation facing Inyo Street is a prominent character-defining along a street-facing elevation of this historic resource. According to the U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, "Integrity" is defined as "the ability of a property to convey its significance." If the dock was removed, it would diminish the historic integrity of the property; however, the property would retain the ability to convey its significance. Staff recommends approval on the condition that the Commission concludes that no further discussion is needed regarding potential alternatives. The Commission may further discuss potential alternatives to the project as proposed if it so chooses.

**The State Center Warehouse** (1918) located at 747 R Street consists of a two-story warehouse, constructed of steel reinforced concrete box frame with red brick infill. It is situated above street level with a partial basement visible and is surrounded by reinforced concrete loading docks. It was designed by architect N. H. Fisher and constructed by builder Trehwitt & Shields.

The Resolution designating the State Center Warehouse to the Local Register of Historic Resources was adopted by Fresno City Council on May 11, 2004. The property is greater than 50 years of age and possesses integrity of location, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association (FMC 12-1607). Additionally, it is significant under Local Register Criterion i because it is associated with early 20<sup>th</sup> century industrial development specific to agriculture in Fresno and Criterion iii because it is an excellent example of a Warehouse property type in Fresno designed by master architect N. H. Fisher and constructed by master builder Trehwitt & Shields.

#### **Duties and Powers of the Commission:**

The City's Historic Preservation Ordinance is located at Chapter 12, Article 16 of the Fresno Municipal Code.

Section 1606 outlines the duties and powers of the Commission. Section 1606(a)(2) specifically refers to the duties entailing review of alterations to historic resources:

*(a)(2) The regulation of exterior alterations visible from a public right-of-way including demolition, relocation and new construction, and interior alterations which would affect the significance of Historic Resources or Historic Districts.*

Section 1617 outlines the Historic Resource Permit Review Process.

### **Historic Review Application Submittal Check List**

The Submittal Check List for the Historic Review Application includes the following:

- ☐ Current Photographs
  - At least one overall view of the property
  - A detailed view of each historic feature that involves the proposed work
- ☐ Construction Documents
  - An existing site plan (and a proposed site plan if different from existing), drawn to scale, which clearly indicates all structures located on the parcel; and, the parcel's North, South, East, and West property lines
  - Detailed drawings, visuals, and descriptions for the proposed work

### **Attachments**

Exhibit A: State of California Survey Forms for the State Center Warehouse 747 R Street  
Prepared August 31, 1994 by John Edward Powell for the Ratkovich Plan Survey  
with Update March 16, 2004.

Exhibit B: Historic Review Revised Application Submittal (PZ17-90000064) from the owner of  
the State Center Warehouse (HP #242) located at 747 R Street, March 2019.