

City of Fresno

*City Hall
2600 Fresno Street
Fresno, CA 93721*



Meeting Minutes - Draft

Monday, January 22, 2024

6:00 PM

Regular Meeting

**In Person and/or Electronic
City Hall, Room 2165**

Historic Preservation Commission

Chair - Jason Hatwig

Vice Chair - James Sponsler

Commissioner - Paul Halajian

Commissioner - Don Simmons

Commissioner - Julie Federico

Commissioner - Elizabeth Laval

Commissioner - Sarah E. Johnston

Staff:

Jennifer Clark, Director; Lisha Chen, Historic Preservation Specialist;

Janice Monroe, M.A. II; Myrna Rivas, Administrative Clerk

THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION WELCOMES YOU TO ROOM 2165A, LOCATED IN CITY HALL, 2ND FLOOR, 2600 FRESNO STREET, FRESNO, CALIFORNIA 93721.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION – Any interested person may appear at the public hearing and present written testimony or speak in favor or against the matters scheduled on the agenda. Public participation during Fresno City Historic Preservation Commission meetings is always encouraged and can occur in one of the two following ways:

1. Participate In Person: Room 2165, City Hall, 2nd Floor, 2600 Fresno Street, Fresno, CA 93721

a. To speak during a Commission meeting in person: You may approach the speaker podium upon the Chair’s call for public comment.

2. Participate Remotely via Zoom using the following link:

https://zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_cAUGIBe2SYygn3isiCuy4w

a. The above link will allow you to register in advance for remote participation in the meeting via the Zoom platform. After registering, you will receive a confirmation email containing additional details about joining the meeting.

b. To speak during a Commission meeting while attending remotely in the Zoom application, click on the icon labeled “Participants” at the bottom of the screen. Then select “Raise Hand” at the bottom of the Participants window. Your digital hand will now be raised. You will be asked to “unmute” when your name is called to speak. You will not be visible via video and there will be no opportunity to share your screen.

All public speakers will have up to 3 minutes to address the Commission pursuant to Rule No. 13 of the Historic Preservation Commission Bylaws of the City of Fresno (available in the City Clerk’s Office).

VIEWING HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETINGS (non-participatory) – For your convenience, there are ways to view Historic Preservation Commission meetings live:

1. Community Media Access Collaborative website: <https://cmac.tv/>

2. Cable Television: Comcast Channel 96 and AT&T Channel 99

Should any of these viewing methods listed above experience technical difficulties, the Commission meeting will continue uninterrupted. Commission meetings will only be paused to address verifiable technical difficulties for all users participating via Zoom or in the Chambers.

The City of Fresno's goal is to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Anyone requiring reasonable ADA accommodations, including sign language interpreters, or other reasonable accommodations such as language translation, should contact the office of the City Clerk at (559) 621-7650 or clerk@fresno.gov. To help ensure availability of these services, you are advised to make your request a minimum of 48 hours prior to the scheduled meeting.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Chair Hatwig called the meeting to order at 6:00 P.M.

Present 6 - Vice Chair James W Sponsler, Chair Jason Hatwig, Commissioner Paul Halajian, Commissioner Julie Federico, Commissioner Elizabeth Laval, and Commissioner Sarah Johnston

Absent 1 - Commissioner Don Simmons

II. PROCEDURES - PROCEDIMIENTOS - KEV SAB LAJ

6:00 P.M.

Chair Hatwig read procedures aloud.

III. APPROVE MEETING MINUTES

III-A [ID 24-105](#) December 18, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes.

Attachments:

Exhibit A - DRAFT 12-18-23 HPC Regular Meeting Minutes

6:03 P.M.

Commissioner Johnston asked to change the language in the 12/18/23 HPC Regular Meeting Minutes on item VI-A ID 23-1789. Commissioner Johnston asked to change "removing the sign to the fairgrounds" to "relocating the sign to the Fairgrounds". The amendment has been made to the 12/18/23 minutes.

On motion of Commissioner Halajian, seconded by Commissioner Federico, the above MINUTES were APPROVED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Vice Chair Sponsler, Chair Hatwig, Commissioner Halajian, Commissioner Federico, Commissioner Laval and Commissioner Johnston

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Simmons

IV. APPROVE AGENDA

6:05 P.M.

On motion of Commissioner Laval, seconded by Vice Chair Sponsler, the above Agenda were APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Vice Chair Sponsler, Chair Hatwig, Commissioner Halajian, Commissioner Federico, Commissioner Laval and Commissioner Johnston

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Simmons

V. CONSENT CALENDAR

N/A

VI. CONTINUED MATTERS

VI-A [ID 24-142](#) CONTINUED FROM 12/18/2023
Consultation regarding Development Permit application P23-01976
located at 1470 E Bulldog Lane.

6:06 P.M.

Hatwig summarized the discussion from the previous Architectural Subcommittee Review meetings.

Chen gave a brief presentation on the background of the project.

Mohamad Annan, applicant, presented his proposal with updated site plan/renderings and talked about the neighboring buildings.

After discussion with applicant, Commission, and Staff, they agreed to keep the flat roof line and pursue a more modern design (limiting the colors and materials).

VII. COMMISSION ITEMS

VII-A [ID 24-34](#) Annual Election of Commission Chair and Vice Chair of Historic Preservation Commission, pursuant to FMC 12-1605(b).

6:24 P.M.

Chair Hatwig announced that annual elections are due. Hatwig nominated Vice Chair Sponsler to Chair. Laval also nominated Sponsler to Chair. Sponsler accepts the nomination. Laval nominated Hatwig to Vice Chair. Sponsler and Hatwig were elected as Chair and Vice Chair respectively, for the 2024-2025 year.

VII-B [ID 24-35](#) Annual Reappointment of Subcommittees

6:24 P.M.

Architectural Review Subcommittee members for 2024 are Halajian, Hatwig and Johnston.

Economic Incentive Program Subcommittee members for 2024 are Simmons, Halajian and Federico.

Historic Names Subcommittee members for 2024 are Sponsler and Laval.

Historic Preservation Month Subcommittee members for 2024 are Sponsler and Laval.

Historic Property Disclosures Subcommittee are Sponsler and Laval for this ad-hoc committee.

Signs and Plaques Subcommittee members for 2024 are Sponsler and Federico.

VII-C [ID 24-108](#) Consideration of Development Permit Application P23-02525 for the redevelopment of the site located at 2411 East Shields Avenue (APN: 43726416).

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) take one of the following actions:

1. **DENY** Development Permit Application P23-02525 for the redevelopment of the site located at 2411 E Shields Avenue (APN:

43726416).

Or

1. **CONTINUE** Development Permit Application P23-02525 for the redevelopment of the site located at 2411 E Shields Avenue (APN: 43726416) until an appropriate Cultural Resources Study has been completed for the Site.

6:43 P.M.

Chen gave a brief history of 2411 Shields Ave.

The Commission decided that there is enough information to warrant a Cultural Resources Survey prior to approval of the development permit. They voted to approve Staff's recommendation to continue the Development Application P23-02525 for the redevelopment of the site located at 2411 E Shields Avenue until an appropriate Cultural Resources Study has been completed for the Site.

On motion of Commissioner Laval, seconded by Commissioner Halajian, that the above Action Item be APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Vice Chair Sponsler, Chair Hatwig, Commissioner Halajian, Commissioner Federico, Commissioner Laval and Commissioner Johnston

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Simmons

- VII-E** [ID 24-144](#) Workshop regarding Historic Highway 99 by Michael Ballard, President of the Historic Highway 99 Association of California.

7:09 P.M.

Sponsler introduced Michael Ballard, President of the Historic Highway 99 Association. Ballard shared a Powerpoint presentation regarding the Fresno City Sign Proposal.

Ballard shared pictures of the signs placed in the City of Madera. Bigger signs (24" x 36") at the start and end of the historic route, and smaller (12" x 18") signs along both sides of the route. Ballard has proposed two options for the City of Fresno, both options totaling 20 signs. He is currently waiting

for estimate costs but provided estimates from 2021 in Madera for reference

The Commissioners expressed their excitement with this project and felt that the cultural value of this project is critical for the community.

- VII-F** [ID 24-143](#) Update on the Fresno Fairgrounds Museum regarding policy, capacity, & accessibility regarding historic signs

7:23 P.M.

Chen reported that she has been in contact with the Fresno County Historical Museum regarding accepting historic signs and storage capabilities. The Museum receives historically significant signs and is currently accepting donations. The Museum reported that they restore the signs prior to displaying them.. After Chen briefly covered some of the questions from the Commission in the attachment, the Commission discussed a potential future relationship with the Smithsonian and ownership of signs in the collection.

- VII-G** [ID 24-139](#) Monthly update regarding historic "G" sign located at old Guarantee building (HP#167), located at 1177 Fulton Street.

7:30 P.M.

Christine Miktarian gave an update on an attempt to take down the "G" sign. She stated that the engineers miscalculated the weight of the sign, and it was stuck on something when trying to move. More research is needed before they attempt in February. A second attempt will take place, as weather allows, using the help of a helicopter.

- VII-H** [ID 24-140](#) Monthly Update on the Jose Garcia Brewer Adobe building (HP#227) located at 5901 W Shaw (APN 51004038)

7:35 P.M.

Eric Frampton, Building Manager, reported that the Jose Garcia Brewer Adobe Building is now fenced but is in a fragile state. Mazen Al Hindi, property owner, explained that the fenced posts have been cemented in to prevent theft. After talking about the obstacles, he said that he would report back on his plan of action and that he was waiting for bids.

VII-I [ID 24-141](#) Update regarding site of start of Fresno and San Francisco Mail Route

7:41 P.M.

Sponsler asked Staff where they were on the project before he works on DPR & necessary paperwork. Clark reported that she has not received any response back regarding the Mail Route proposal. She noted the location is owned by City but leased, therefore the process will take time.

VII-J [ID 24-87](#)

UPDATE on Regular Monthly Topics:

1. Staff Updates
2. Architectural Subcommittee Updates
3. Economic Incentive Subcommittee Update
4. Plaque Design Subcommittee Update
5. Historic Preservation Month Subcommittee

7:42 P.M.

Chen reported that she and Frampton, made a site visit to the Adobe Brewer to check on tarping and fencing request.

Chen also reported that the review of Mitigation applications has commenced and is expects to notify applicants by end of January.

Hatwig reported that the Architectural Review Subcommittee met at the site of the Basque Hotel with the designer

Sponsler reported that the Historic Preservation Month Subcommittee will meet in the next 10 days. Monroe asked Commissioners to send their schedules to Staff.

VIII. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

N/A

IX. UNSCHEDULED ITEMS

IX. - A. Members of the Commission

7:47 P.M.

Commissioners Sponsler and Laval and Chen and Clark met with the Association of Realtors to discuss the Historic Property Disclosures that will be given to property owners at close of escrow. They discussed MLS obstacles and the idea of treating the disclosure like lead disclosures. There was concern that current owners were unaware of property status and Sponsler reported an invitation in March to speak to the Association.

IX. - B. Staff

N/A

IX. - C. General Public

7:54 P.M.

Members of the public came forth with ideas for Historic Preservation Month in May.

Two members of the public expressed their concern for Chinatown. They said that they lost many buildings as a result of High Speed Rail. They added that Chinatown is historically significant to Fresno and Fresno should embrace it.

X. NEXT MEETING

8:05 P.M.

Chair Hatwig announced the next meeting will be held on 2/26/24 In Room 2165.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

At 8:05 P.M. Chair Hatwig adjourned the meeting.